



## MULTICULTURAL EDUCATION IN ELEMENTARY MUSIC EDUCATION TEXTBOOKS (GRADES 1-4)

**Sevan Nart<sup>i</sup>**

Assistant Professor Dr.,  
Faculty of Education,  
Fine Arts Education Department,  
Music Education Section,  
Bartın University, Bartın, Turkey

### **Abstract:**

In this study, the elementary music education textbooks which are published for use in the first stage of elementary education (1<sup>st</sup>-4<sup>th</sup> grades) in Turkey were examined in terms of multicultural elements they contain. Student workbooks for each grade were evaluated and analysed using the document review method according to the categories established by the researcher. Following the research, it was determined that the content of the books strongly reflects Turkish national culture. However, with regard to elements that reflect the national culture, it was determined that explanations, photographs and musical works that reflect Turkish folk culture (folklore) were found to be of limited number and considerably insufficient scale. It was noted especially that almost no place was given to different cultural elements regarding multicultural music education. Due to these aspects, it is thought that they are considerably insufficient in presenting a multicultural musical education. In addition to this, it is thought that the findings gained in this study will provide a contribution to the development of elementary music education curriculum and educational materials and the educators who are implementing the courses. Also, it is believed that the research will form the basis for action research on the field.

**Keywords:** elementary education, music education, multicultural education, textbooks

### **1. Introduction**

Today, the rapid speed at which information is shared and spread, has brought with it globalization. Especially, the high level of immigration of people from different cultures and ethnic variety has also made change and transformation inevitable. In this process, just as in the areas of economy, politics and culture, different models and approaches to

---

<sup>i</sup> Correspondence: email [sevannart@bartin.edu.tr](mailto:sevannart@bartin.edu.tr)

education have begun to be debated. The concept of multicultural education is one of these.

### 1.1. Culture

The first explanation among definitions of culture found in the Comprehensive Turkish Dictionary is stated in the following way: *“All the material and moral/spiritual values created in the process of historical and social development, with all the means that these are created, used to pass on to the next generations and which show the level to which people have dominion over their natural and social environment”* ([www.tdk.gov.tr](http://www.tdk.gov.tr)). According to Kongar (1994) *“Culture is the sum of all that humans have created. ...All the kinds of vehicles and appliances that humans have created are examples of material culture; and all the meanings, values and rules are examples of moral/ spiritual culture. ...Every kind of vehicle, appliance, machine, clothing, dress, belief, value and attitude is an element that forms a culture”* (p. 19, 37). In addition to this, Kongar (1994) expresses that because art, literature and ideological works have features, which are unique to themselves, they fit neither into the category of material cultural elements, nor the category of moral/ spiritual cultural elements; they can be thought of as a third category of cultural elements. However, he underlines that culture (as well as the three groups) is a whole (Kongar, 1994, p. 19, 20). E. B. Tylor, as cited in many sociological and social anthropological books, defines culture as: *“The multifaceted whole encompassing all the knowledge, beliefs, art, morality, law, customs and the habits and other skills that the individual gains with regards to being a member of the society they are part of”* (Erkal, 2000, p. 123).

This definition includes both values that belong to a particular society and values that make that society different from other communities, and also material and technical elements that transcend societies and borders; that can belong to more than one society (Duman, 2007, p. 212). According to Aypek Aslan (2016) values which belong to people living in a particular period of time and in a particular place constitute “regional culture”; properties and values that make a nation different from others “national culture”, and values that are made by human beings, such as science, art and music constitute “universal culture” (p. 365). The term “national culture” in this study is used within the scope of Kongar’s (1994, p. 32, 33) definition to specify the properties that differentiate a particular nation from the other nations that make up humanity. And the material and moral elements that were included in national culture and how these elements were classified is explained more broadly in the method section of the research.

### 1.2. Multicultural Education

In a report prepared by the American Psychological Association (APA), titled *Guidelines on Multicultural Education, Training, Research, Practice* the term ‘multicultural’ is defined in the following way: *“The terms “multiculturalism” and “diversity” have been used interchangeably to include aspects of identity stemming from gender, sexual orientation, disability, socioeconomic status, or age. Multiculturalism, in an absolute sense, recognizes the broad scope of dimensions of race, ethnicity, language, sexual orientation, gender, age, disability,*

*class status, education, religious/spiritual orientation, and other cultural dimensions”* (p. 9, 10). Similarly, the following is expressed in a report prepared by UNESCO (2006): *“The term multicultural describes the culturally diverse nature of human society. It not only refers to elements of ethnic or national culture, but also includes linguistic, religious and socio-economic diversity”* (p. 17).

In a comprehensive study that analyzes definitions of multicultural education, Özturgut (2011) states that a clear consensus on the definition of multiculturalism and multicultural education is not found among academics and practitioners. In addition to this, in a definition, Jay and Jones (2005), define multicultural education as *“a common term used to define an education system that is pluralistic and that takes all children from preschool through to University into account”* (Cited by Özturgut, 2011, p. 2)

Banks and Banks (2009) state that multicultural education is at least three things: an idea or concept, an educational reform movement, and a process whose major goal is to change the structure of educational institutions, so that male and female students, exceptional students, and students who are members of diverse racial, ethnic, language, and cultural groups will have an equal chance to achieve academically in school.

*“...[It] is an idea stating that all students, regardless of the groups to which they belong, such as those related to gender, ethnicity, race, culture, language, social class, religion, or exceptionality, should experience educational equality in the school. ...[It] is also a reform movement designed to bring about a transformation of the school so that students from both genders and from diverse cultural, language, and ethnic groups will have an equal chance to experience school success. ...[It] is a continuing process because the idealized goals it tries to actualize –such as educational equality and the eradication of all forms of discrimination- can never be fully achieved in human society”* (Banks & Banks, 2009, p. 25).

In this study also, when referring to multicultural education, what is intended to be expressed, is different cultures and all the dimension of these differences, being included in education; to put it another way, education or teaching programs and activities being implemented in a way that encompasses different cultures and diversity. With the increasing change and diversity among societies caused by rapid immigration, we are no longer referring to a single culture. Campbell (2002) notes that multicultural education term was first emerged in America, which is multinational and therefore includes cultural diversity when following on from the results of actions initiated by ethnic minority groups to make others aware of the perspectives and needs of their under-recognized groups. He adds that multicultural education became the more encompassing term when other groups, such as women and disabled people, urged the incorporation of their histories and cultures into the school curriculum. In short, importance must be given to multicultural education and it must be included in the curriculum, in order to give the opportunity for every individual to experience his or her own culture and for these different cultures to communicate and interact with one another; as well as for the raising of respectful individuals, who are sensitive to

different cultures, cultural values and differences (Reimer, 1993; Anderson and Campbell, 2010; Cırık, 2008; Arslan, 2009; Tonbuloğlu, Aslan and Aydın, 2014; Papageorgiou and Kontrouba, 2014). And because young children are inclined to accept and appreciate differences in an unprejudiced way, this education must begin at as early an age as possible (Ramsey, 1982; Anderson & Campbell, 2010; Uz, 2007; Abdullah, 2009; Boon, 2009; Papageorgiou & Koutrouba, 2014; Aktin vd, 2015). According to Papageorgiou and Koutrouba (2014) because during the elementary education age, what is known or unknown is not clear, children are unlikely to be found to respond negatively to new music. Moreover young students find the strange sounds of the music of cultures far from their own, to be interesting and do not experience difficulty in accepting them. Of course, at this point it must be stated that a special effort needs to be made in the selection of musical and visual elements belonging to different cultures, which will be chosen for use with children. An attention must be paid to ensure that every kind of educational material including cultural content considered for use is appropriate for the age and level of development of the children and is of educational value.

Tonbul, Aslan and Aydın (2014, 2016) state that in Turkey teachers do not have enough knowledge and experience related to multicultural education and therefore they are found to be not ready for implementation. They express that the reason for this situation is that the meanings of the terms multiculturalism and multicultural education and what they encapsulate are not widely known; and that this stems from multicultural educational approaches rarely being included in pre-service and in-service training programs. Similarly Cırık (2008) suggests that sufficient weight is not given to multicultural education on teaching programs in Turkey; Arslan (2009) suggesting that both teaching programs and textbooks do not reflect an understanding of multicultural education. However, beyond the necessity of the age we live in, in Turkey, based on its historical background, which has been home to many different ethnic roots, religions, languages and races, and which has a rich cultural heritage and diversity, there is a need to mention multicultural education.

In the related literature, as well as publications that advocate multicultural education, publications that defend the opposite viewpoint were also discovered. The writers of these publications converge on the view that multicultural education will open the way to division and conflict in the cultural and therefore also social structure. However, in this research debates relating to multicultural education have not been touched upon. This study has been undertaken based on the idea that multicultural education is a positive and necessary approach in the nurturing of students as individuals that recognize, understand and give value to different cultures and diversity and that are sensitive and respectful of different cultures and diversity. Banks' (2008) explanation on misunderstandings surrounding multicultural education also supports this opinion. According to Banks, multicultural education, rather than dividing a nation, is designed to unite a country that is already divided. According to Yalçın (2002), the foundational purpose of multicultural discourse is for differences to be recognized and through tolerance the creation of a harmonious and productive

society (As cited in Başbay & Bektaş, 2009, p. 33). In this situation the essential questions that must be debated are “What must multicultural education include and how much?” and “When must it be included in education?” As in all areas of education, in art education too, these are questions for which answers are being sought.

Uz (2007) states that a multicultural education approach is a correct approach from the point of view of an understanding of contemporary education and contemporary arts education; pointing out that the foundation of contemporary art and art education is creativity and that the foundation of creativity is a rich, multidimensional interaction and accumulation; an openness to every kind of change and interaction (p. 837).

### 1.3. Multicultural Music Education

Music is a cultural element in itself; a language that reflects the material, moral and spiritual cultural values of the society it is born and developed within. Uçan (1996) names this language as “muzikçe [musichish]” and defines it as the language above other languages that different people from different cultures and societies are more or less able to meet and unite with (p. 28). Uçan (1996), who states that the foundational purpose of music education is establishing behavioral changes geared towards meeting the individual’s and society’s aesthetic needs; satisfying its creative instinct; developing taste; and enabling it to be in harmony with and sensitive to the natural, social and cultural environment it is in, also mentions that music has individual, social, cultural and economic functions and that every function of music has an educational aspect.

*“The place and importance in human life of the individual, social, cultural and economic functions of music have led, since the oldest civilizations, to it becoming a comprehensive dimension of education, a beneficial and useful educational tool, an effective and a productive educational method, and a meaningful and important field of education. The reason for the increasingly evident existence of approaches in music education such as “education with music”, “education through music”, and “education for music” actually rests here. ...Because music carries in its essence an educational quality, it serves educational aims, it meets/ fulfills educational needs” (Uçan, 1996: 33)*

With a similar point of view, according to Elliot (1989) *“If the process of music education reflects, distils and abstracts cultural values, - if music education functions as culture - then music education may also have the potential to change prejudicial attitudes and behaviors”* (p. 14). Therefore, as Çevik (1989) has stated, music must not remain limited to singing songs, playing instruments or the teaching of a branch of theoretical knowledge (p. 83); music education must not be understood only as the development of an individual’s musical skill. Through music education, both the transmission, continuity and protection of the common cultural values that form and hold together a society are enabled, and the sharing and familiarization of cultural values that are accepted as being universal, and values that belong to other cultures is ensured. In this way it is made possible for an individual to acquire a rich musical culture; to take

ownership of his or her national culture, but at the same time to approach different cultures with respect and tolerance.

The multicultural education movement, which began to appear in America in the 1960's, was opened up for serious discussion in music education in the 1970's and after the 1980's teaching strategies began to be developed within multicultural education, with even the necessary practical and theoretical knowledge for the training of music teachers beginning to be implemented (Boon, 2009, p. 3). Toksoy (2014) states that in the related literature terms such as *inter-cultural music education*, *cross-cultural music education* or *world music education* are also used referring multicultural music education (p.3). However, in this research the term "*multicultural music education*" was used which is most often preferred in sources.

#### **1.4. Related Research**

When related research in the literature was reviewed, it was noted that similar studies that analyze the presence of songs belonging to other cultures in music textbooks have been undertaken (Culig, 2012; Curry, 1982; Diaz, 1980; Wang, 2010).

In Diaz's (1980) research, songs belonging to other cultures in music textbooks written between 1926 – 1976 were analyzed, and it was determined that within these 50 years that folk songs covering a wide field starting from Western Europe, carrying on to America, Eastern Europe, and continuing to incorporate other regions of the world, appeared in the books.

Culig (2012) analyzed 18 primary education music textbooks published in America between 1967-2008, with regard to the Asian pacific folk songs that they contain, and determined that a very low proportion of around 3% of the books contained songs from this region.

In Curry's (1982) research, which analyzed songs belonging to Afro-American culture in music textbooks, it was determined that between the years 1970-1982 the number of related songs had increased, however most of them did not have the characteristics of an African folk song.

Wang (2010) compared resource books used in primary education music lessons in Macau and Taiwan, using the content analysis method. Following the research, it was revealed that there is a significant resource issue in Macau that every year and semester, the teaching materials were changed and that, for these reasons shortcomings were found in the students' music education; local resources were not used and students were unable to have an opportunity to acquire their own musical culture. In contrast to this, in Taiwan, it was determined that in addition to government publications, many music education publications were published and these publications contained the most recent, up-to-date methods and techniques in music education and systematic, orderly, non-repetitive information. Wang also recommended that a place be given to folk songs in the textbooks from the first grade of primary education onwards to provide students a solid fundamental knowledge of music musicianship; and combine music with other art genres in order to cultivate students' sensitivity towards the appreciation of the arts.

In addition to research that analyzes the contents of elementary education music textbooks, Papageorgiou and Koutrouba (2014) in their wide-ranging research discussed multicultural music education with all its attributes and brought all the related positive and negative opinions together. Additionally, as a result of interviews conducted with 15 educators, who were chosen from different regions of Greece and who are authorities in their fields, it was revealed that the importance of multicultural music education among educators had increased; and that is necessary for world music to begin to be taught at an early age and that it should be carried out in parallel with national music education, which will be at the center of the curriculum. The participants in the research saw it as beneficial for sociocultural and historical non-musical information relating to world music that is of educational value and appropriate to the students' age also be covered. Many important and beneficial results have been obtained in the research. One of these is that besides the lack of a clear, certain curriculum, the implementation of a multicultural music education program is left entirely to the teacher's judgment. For this reason, the researchers recommend that for the success of such a program, first of all educators must gain the appropriate knowledge and skills in the field of world music, through pre-service or in-service training.

Similarly, Tonbuloğlu, Aslan and Aydın (2014) examined the perceptions and awareness of elementary education teachers towards multicultural education and diversity. As a result of the research, they found that teachers had sufficient knowledge about multicultural education and that their attitudes towards multicultural education were positive. According to this, all the participants entirely agreed that equality and multicultural education were necessary in education. Additionally a large section of teachers expressed that they had not received training on the subject or had practical experience; that subjects relating to multicultural education must definitely be included in the pre-service training programs.

Elliot (1990, p. 164) submits that multicultural music education practices will only achieve success through multicultural music education programs that give students the opportunity to discover a wide variety of musical cultures and compare concepts and practices. Anderson and Campbell (2010), state that studying a variety of world music, students develop greater musical flexibility, termed by some as "polymusicality". They increase their ability to perform, listen intelligently to, and appreciate many types of music. Further, with this flexibility, they are much less prone to judge a new music without first trying to understand it and become more aware of aspects of their own music. In addition Toksoy (2014), who looks at the issue within the scope of national music education, states that both from the point of youth understanding modal [makamsal] music practices and sharing folk music cultures, which are still alive in Anatolia, multicultural music education offers important opportunities and paves the way to students developing a more comprehensive musical understanding (p.24).

### 1.5. Purpose of the Study

Based on these considerations, this study was undertaken to examine to what extent multicultural education was presented in music textbooks published to be used in the first stage of elementary education; that is to say the first 4 years of elementary education. The findings obtained in this study are thought to contribute to the development of elementary music education curriculum, teaching materials and the course practitioners, educators as well as establish a basis for action research, which will take place in this area.

In this context, the main problem sentence was defined as “To what extent multicultural education was presented in the first stage elementary education (grades 1-4) music textbooks?” The sub-problems underlying this problem are comprised as follows:

1. To what extent phrases and words that reflect Turkish national culture and different cultures were presented in the explanatory texts in the first stage elementary education (grades 1-4) music textbooks?
2. To what extent elements that reflect Turkish national culture and different cultures were presented in the songs or instrumental music pieces in the first stage elementary education (grades 1-4) music textbooks?
3. To what extent cultural elements that reflect Turkish national culture and different cultures were presented in the photographs in the first stage elementary education (grades 1-4) music textbooks?

## 2. Methodology

In this study, the document analysis method, a descriptive research model, has been used. The document analysis method is used in qualitative research, when it is not possible to directly observe or interview and/or when visual materials are included in the research. Document analysis includes analysis of written materials containing information pertaining to facts or events, which are aiming to be researched (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2004, p.153). This technique, which is also referred to as document review, is the systematic analysis of existing records and documents as a data source (Karasar, 2006, p.183).

The population of this research comprises of music class textbooks written and published for the initial stage of elementary education (grades 1-4). Four books, published by the MEB (Ministry of National Education) as 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup>, 3<sup>rd</sup>, and 4<sup>th</sup> grade “Elementary Music Workbooks”, were chosen as a sample. Books deemed acceptable for use as initial stage music class textbooks by the Ministry of National education, education board on 07/03/2012 and article 1397, were assessed for their inclusion of multicultural elements through content analysis.

### 2.1 The gathering of Data and Analysis

In order to establish a conceptual framework for the research, first of all the accessible local and foreign publications and Internet resources relating to *culture, multicultural*



*education, music training and multicultural music education* were reviewed. The 4 books mentioned above were obtained as PDF files from the MEB's website. In the process of data analysis, the books were analyzed according to categories established by the researcher and the content of the established categories (headings) was explicitly defined.

Cultural expressions and elements in the books were analyzed according to categories established by the researcher. While analyzing elements in the books that reflect "*national culture*", they were classified in the following manner:

- All the elements (visual materials, explanations, words) related to traditional celebrations and religious festivals; traditional clothing and attire; belongings; instruments; foods; folk dances; children's dances; art and crafts; architecture; historical artifacts; nursery rhymes, lullabies, anonymous songs and folk songs were assessed as *elements that reflect folk culture*.
- Historical personalities, flags, subjects of heroism (soldiers, victory), elements related to national festivals (visuals, explanations, words), also songs and anthems containing elements of these were assessed as *elements reflecting national culture*.

According to this categorization, explanations, songs and photographs within the books that were determined as cultural elements and expressions that do not belong to Turkish national culture were classified as reflecting other cultures or "*cultural elements that belong to other cultures*".

The children's music in the books was analyzed according to the criterion expressed below. Sun and Seyrek (1993) define verbal and instrumental musical pieces created (composed) by children or for children as children's music and discuss them under four subject headings: "*Nursery rhymes and Counting rhymes' 'lullabies and Turkish folk songs', 'children's songs' and 'instrumental music'*". (p. 23-30):

1. *Nursery rhymes and counting rhymes*: These are products of child folklore created by children comprising of simple melodies or simply rhythmic syllables.
2. *Lullabies and Turkish folk songs [Türkü]*: These are individual products of folklore. Lullabies are sung to put children to sleep and like folk songs they take an important place in every nation's folk music literature. In Turkey folk music carries both regional local characteristics; with their unique way of using scales, rhythmic patterns, sounds, dances and names. This variety establishes the richness of our music culture. Most folk songs and lullabies are anonymously written. That is to say, they are pieces that were composed by a person within a local and regional tradition, but whose composer is unknown, that come to a society, undergoing small changes as they spread from person to person. In addition to this there are many Turkish folk music pieces, whose composer is known (such as those by *Aşık Veysel* and *Pir Sultan Abdal*)
3. *Children's songs*: Songs created for children with their words and melodies. Children's song repertoire comprises of anonymous children's songs, folk music from a variety of societies and children's songs composed for children by national and foreign composers. Children's songs used in the area of music education in

Turkey can be considered in four groups: adapted, imitated, anonymous and Turkish school songs. Adapted songs have a foreign melody with Turkish lyrics. Imitated songs are songs that are composed by Turkish school music composers but that originate in the music of other societies. Turkish school songs, by contrast, are songs written by Turkish children's music composers, but originate from Turkish folk music. These are original pieces, composed in a way appropriate to the people's musical taste, using Turkish musical scales and measures.

4. *Instrumental Music*: Music gathered under this heading is divided into two: 'music composed for instruments, which children use' and 'Music composed with instruments for children to listen to'. Many pieces, written for instruments used as school instruments such as the recorder, melodica, mandolin and orff instruments, enter the first category.

In this study, it has been sought to assess songs according to Sun and Seyrek's classification. However, like anthems, lullabies and folk songs have been analyzed under different headings. Due to the expression 'adapted song' only being used once, and because it is not clear which country or region the song came from, it has been grouped together with anonymous songs. Songs that have an adapted melody with Turkish lyrics are analyzed under the heading 'Songs using melodies belonging to a different culture with Turkish lyrics'. In line with these explanations the pieces found in each book have been analyzed, clearly classified to assess whether or not they carry characteristics that reflect our national cultural, folk culture, or a different culture. Because counting rhymes and nursery rhymes are child folklore pieces and lullabies and Turkish folk songs are folk culture pieces, they were assessed directly as *pieces that reflect our folklore*. Original school songs with lyrics and music belonging to Turkish composers have also been assessed in this category. Anthems and songs about national holidays and Atatürk have been assessed under the category of *pieces that reflect our national culture*; adapted and anonymous songs, songs with a melody from another culture with Turkish lyrics, songs with both melody and lyrics from another culture and instrumental pieces from another culture, were assessed under the category *pieces that reflect a different culture*. The "Turkish National Anthem (score)" included in the introduction of the four books was not added to the total number of pieces in books 1,2 and 3 and was not assessed. However, because book 4 focuses on teaching the National Anthem, in the assessment of the book, the National Anthem was included under anthems; therefore pieces that reflect our national culture category.

As stated above, the data was gathered under categories (headings) and recorded as it appears in the book. Findings gained from data, examples and pieces described are presented as tables and interpreted.

### 3. Findings

When the limited number of explanatory texts found in the books was analyzed, it was seen that a limited number of expressions reflecting cultural elements are used. These

expressions, together with other foreign root words that were identified, are presented in the table below.

**Table 1:** Expressions and foreign words that reflect elements of culture in the explanation texts of the books

		Rate of Use			
		Book 1	Book 2	Book 3	Book 4
<b>Expressions (National Culture)</b>	October 29	1	1	1	
	November 10	1	1		
	April 23	1	1	1	
	Turkish National Anthem		1		1
<b>Expressions (Folklore)</b>	Kızılay Week		1		
	Frugality, investment and Turkish Goods Week		1		
	November 24	1			
	Instruments	1	1	3	
	Folk Dances			2	
	Recorder				1
<b>Foreign Words</b>	Musical Term			1	9
	Name of Composer	1			1

As can be observed in table 1, there are just one sentenced explanations regarding October 29<sup>th</sup> and October 23<sup>rd</sup> are included in the 1<sup>st</sup>, 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> books. The phrase “*Every year on October 29<sup>th</sup> we celebrate the founding of our republic*” is found in the 1<sup>st</sup> book on page 62, in the 2<sup>nd</sup> book on page 60 and in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book on page 50.

Phrases relating to April 23<sup>rd</sup> National Sovereignty and Children’s Day are as follows:

- “*At the same time we also celebrate the date of opening of the Turkish Parliament, April 23<sup>rd</sup>, as children’s day*” (1<sup>st</sup> Book, page 68).
- “*April 23<sup>rd</sup> is the date of the opening of the Turkish Parliament. ...April 23<sup>rd</sup> is the first and only children’s day celebrated in the world*”. (2<sup>nd</sup> Book, p. 68).
- “*Let us celebrate April 23<sup>rd</sup> with enthusiasm, the world’s first children’s day, which Atatürk gifted to children*” (3<sup>rd</sup> book, p. 56).

Other phrases and explanations in the books that reflect our national culture:

- “*November 10<sup>th</sup> is the anniversary of the death of Atatürk. Every year between the 10-16<sup>th</sup> of November is referred to as Atatürk week*. (1<sup>st</sup> book, p.64).
- “*Atatürk lost his life on November 10<sup>th</sup> 1938. ...Between November 10-16 Atatürk is remembered throughout the whole country with ceremonies*” (2<sup>nd</sup> book, p.74).
- “*National anthems represent the commonwealth. ..The Turkish National Anthem is a symbol of our national unity and independence*” (2<sup>nd</sup> book, p. 9).
- “*The poem, which Mehmet Akif Ersoy wrote; ...was accepted as the words of our National Anthem. ...The National Anthem, the symbol of our national unity and independence...*” (4<sup>th</sup> book, p. 9).

In the 2<sup>nd</sup> book the following phrases mentioning specific days and weeks, which are celebrated, and that were analyzed under elements that reflect our folk culture:

“November 24<sup>th</sup> Teacher’s Day”, “Kızılay Week” and “Frugality, Investment and Turkish goods week” are included:

- *“Every year we celebrate November 29<sup>th</sup> as Teacher’s Day”* (1<sup>st</sup> book, p.66).
- *“Every year between October 29<sup>th</sup> and November 4<sup>th</sup> we celebrate Kızılay Week”* (2<sup>nd</sup> book, p. 62).
- *“Frugality, Investment and Turkish Goods Week is celebrated in our schools between December 12<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup>”* (2<sup>nd</sup> Book, p. 64).

In addition to these, in the chapter in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book on “Our Specific Days and Weeks” (p.48), a list of relevant days with names and dates celebrated is included. However, no kind of explanation is given, therefore it has not been evaluated in the research.

The underlined phrases in the sentences below have been identified to be expressions, which reflect our folk culture or other cultures:

- *“Below are some pictures of traditional Turkish instruments”* (Book 3, p.32).
- *“Below are some pictures of instruments used in international classical music”* (3<sup>rd</sup> Book, p.32).
- *“Our folk dances... are our dances accompanied by music. Folk dances, which are important elements of our culture... differ from region to region”* (3<sup>rd</sup> Book, p.34)
- *“Horon, Hora, Halay, Bar and Kafkas folk dances”* (3<sup>rd</sup> Book, p. 35, 36)

As it is seen, expressions that reflect our folk culture have been included the most in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book. After a one-paragraph explanation under the subject heading “Our Folk Dances” on page 34, on pages 35-36, the region the dance belongs to is mentioned next to the photograph in a single sentence; but no space is given for an explanation.

Because the instrument name “marakas<sup>ii</sup>” is a word of foreign origin, in the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> books, it has been assessed as a word and instrument that reflects another folk culture (1<sup>st</sup> book, p41; 2<sup>nd</sup> book, p26). Additionally, because from the point of view of its origins, the “recorder” is an instrument belonging to another culture it has been assessed as an element reflecting a different folk culture. However, the instrument name “dilli kaval [tongued pipe] that is included in the explanation, which the word “recorder” is found in, reflects an element belonging to our folk culture:

- *“The recorder, a middle age instrument, is the standardized form of an instrument known in our country as the tongued pipe. It is made of Bakelite plastic or wood”* (4<sup>th</sup> Book, p.31).

Apart from names of instruments, the foreign words in the books comprise of musical terms and names of composers. The composers’ names that are included in the books are “David Dawson” in the 1<sup>st</sup> book (p.44, 45), and “Johannes Brahms” in the 4<sup>th</sup> book (p.54). All the other 11 words outside these two names are words used to express musical terms. One of these terms “senyo” is found in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book on page 27. It is the Turkish pronunciation of “Sengo” (name of a repetition symbol), an Italian musical term. The other 9 terms are all found in the 4<sup>th</sup> book:

---

<sup>ii</sup> A rhythm instrument made from seashells referred to in Spanish as “maracá”. “Maracas” is the plural form of the word. This word is an African origin form of music and dance and is also thought to have spread to the world from South America-Cuba. (<https://www.etimolojiturkce.com>)

- *Bona* (p.41); *solfege* (p.41, 42),
- Musical tempo terms; *Allegro* (fast), *moderato* (medium), *Adagio* (slow) (p. 50),
- *Accelerando* (speed up gradually), *Ritardando* (slow down gradually) (p. 54),
- Musical Dynamics *Crescendo* (gradually get louder); *Decrescendo* (to gradually get quieter).

When the findings in Table 1 are assessed, it is seen that expressions that reflect Turkish national culture are found most in the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> books. It was determined that there are terms reflecting Turkish national culture in the first 3 books, but in the 4<sup>th</sup> book, apart from phrases related to Turkish national anthem, no place has been given to terms that reflect Turkish national culture or folk culture. Apart from the one foreign composer's name in each of the 1<sup>st</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> books; the book with the most foreign words is the 4<sup>th</sup> book. It is thought that the reason for this situation is that foundational musical knowledge together with the recorder begins to be taught in the 4<sup>th</sup> grade and therefore the musical terms related to the scope of this teaching are included a lot more in the 4<sup>th</sup> book.

**Table 2:** Distribution of songs and instrumental pieces in the books

Kind of Piece	Books							
	1st Book		2nd Book		3rd Book		4th Book	
	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Counting Rhymes and Nursery Rhymes	5	21	1	6	3	15	4	15
Lullabies	0	0	1	6	1	5	0	0
Turkish Folk Songs	0	0	1	6	2	10	2	7
Original School Songs by Turkish Composers	9	38	6	38	9	45	13	48
Anthems and Songs about Atatürk	8	33	4	25	5	25	5	19
Adapted and Anonymous Songs	1	4	2	13	0	0	0	0
Songs with a Foreign Melody and Turkish Lyrics	1	4	1	6	0	0	3	11
Songs with a Foreign Melody and Lyrics	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Foreign Instrumental (Non-verbal) Piece/ Melody	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	24	100	16	100	20	100	27	100

When all the pieces (n=24) in the 1<sup>st</sup> book were analyzed it was determined that there are 5 rhymes and 9 songs. It was determined that 9 out of the 11 (38%) of the songs with Turkish lyrics were original school songs written by Turkish Composers; and the other 2 (8%) were songs belonging to a different culture (foreign composer) with Turkish lyrics. One of the 2 songs, is named "The train is coming", on page 19 and its Turkish lyrics were written by Hilmi Seyrek. It is shown on the piece that it is an English melody; however, the name of the composer is not specified. This situation leads one to think that this melody is an anonymous melody. The other is on page 44; a song named "The Hare and the Tortoise", with lyrics written by Sefai Acay and composed by David Dawson.

It is observed that from the 60th page of the 1<sup>st</sup> book consisting of 84 pages, space is given to the topic of "love of Atatürk" and "National Festivals". Therefore, from the

60<sup>th</sup> to the 83<sup>rd</sup> page, songs and anthems that are analyzed under the category *Anthems and Songs about Atatürk* are found. These pieces make up 8 of the total 24 pieces in the book (33%).

In the 2<sup>nd</sup> book the song named "What's at the market?" was identified as "anonymous", "Little Frog" was identified as "adapted" and the song named "Hurray/Long live our School" was identified as a "German Melody". Which country or region the adapted song is adapted from or its composer is not specified. It is observed that with these three songs, the 2<sup>nd</sup> book contains the most of the songs from different cultures (19%). The only Turkish folk song in the 2<sup>nd</sup> book is a song named "Degirmen Üstü Çiçek" [The mill is Covered with Flowers], which originates from the region of Erzurum/Turkey. The piece named "Kırmızı Balık" [Red Fish], which is defined by many preschool, class and music teachers as a children's song, is included in this book as a "nursery rhyme". It is also observed that Turkish School Songs found in the 2<sup>nd</sup> book constitute more pieces (38%) than those that reflect Turkish national culture (25%).

It is seen that in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book more space has been given to Turkish School Songs (45%) than pieces that reflect Turkish national culture (25%). There are two Turkish folk songs in the book; one from the Kars/Turkey region named "Üç Elma" [Three Apples] and the other from the region of Artvin/Turkey named "Atabari". Atabari is included in the book under the heading "Our Folk Dances". In the book, apart from 1 counting rhyme, 2 nursery rhymes, and 1 lullaby; no melodies or songs belonging to another culture are included.

As it is seen in Table 2, the book with the most pieces included is book 4 (n=27). It is thought that due to teaching of the recorder and foundational music education is beginning in this book; the rhymes, Turkish folk songs and other songs used in the teaching process have increased the overall number of pieces. Therefore the number of rhymes, Turkish folk songs and original school songs included in the 4<sup>th</sup> book is higher than the number of pieces in the other books. The piece included in the 4<sup>th</sup> book that is known as "Youth Anthem", starting with the words "Dağ başını duman almış" [The mountain top is smoking] is a song written in the form of a march (p. 68). The music for the piece was compiled from a piece of Swiss folk music named "[Tre trallande jantor](https://en.wikipedia.org)" [Three Girls saying Tralalla] by a Swiss musician Feliz Körling. After Selim Sırrı Tarcan wrote it as a musical score, the lyrics were translated into Turkish by Ali Ulvi Elöve (<https://en.wikipedia.org>). Despite it being in the form of a march, because it is a piece of foreign origin and because its content does not have the quality of reflecting Turkish national culture, it has not been put in the category of Anthems. Two other songs in the same category as "Youth Anthem" are; "Oyun" (p.54) with Turkish lyrics written by Hasan Toraganlı to the melody of Johannes Brahms' "Hungarian Dance" and a French melody made a song named "Cici Köpeğim" [My Sweet Dog], by Muhtar Ataman with Turkish lyrics (p. 48).

The Turkish National Anthem (score) included in the introductory section of the four books has not been included in the total number of pieces and has not been assessed. However, because in this book (the 4<sup>th</sup> book) focus is given to teaching the

Turkish National Anthem, it has been included in the Anthem category in the evaluation of this book. The Turkish Folk Songs in this book are: “Evlerinin Önü Sarı Karınca” [The Yellow Ant in Front of Their Houses], which originates from Balıkesir/Turkey and “Gelin Ayşe” [Ayşe the Bride]. The origin of the Turkish folk song “Gelin Ayşe” or in other sources “Koyun Gelir Yata Yata” [Sheep Come and Lie Down] has not been stated in the book. Some sources state that it originates from Sivas/Turkey, some that it originates from Adana/Turkey. ([www.turkuler.com](http://www.turkuler.com)). “Additionally, this Turkish folk song is sung in many regions of Anatolia with similar or slightly different melodies ([www.turkudostlari.com](http://www.turkudostlari.com))”.

If we take a look at general to the overall table, the number of songs from another culture with Turkish lyrics in the 1<sup>st</sup> book is 2, in the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> books are 3 and in the 4<sup>th</sup> book there are no pieces that fit this category. It was determined that original school songs written by Turkish composers and pieces that reflect Turkish national culture comprise the majority of pieces in the books. It was seen that very few Turkish folk songs and lullabies that reflect Turkish folk culture were included in the books. Despite this, nursery rhymes and counting rhymes were included in all the books. It is thought that because nursery rhymes and counting rhymes take an important place in pre-school and elementary music education, therefore a large amount of this teaching material has been included in the books.

**Table 3:** Photographs with cultural content that are included in the books (\*)

	Books							
	1st Book (47)		2nd Book (32)		3rd Book (59)		4th Book (12)	
Total number of photographs (n)	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Cultural elements in the photographs (*)	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
Relating to Turkish national culture (Ataturk, historical personality, Heroism etc.)	17	36	5	15,6	5	8	3	25
Relating to Turkish folk culture (region, historical piece, instrument, belongings, folk dance etc.)	3	6	7	21.8	32	54	0	0
Photographs that reflect other cultures	4	9	6	18,8	18	31	2	17
Other (nature, animals, plants etc.)	23	49	14	43.8	4	7	7	58
TOTAL	47	100	32	100	59	100	12	100

(\*) Except for the flag and Ataturk photographs used in the 8 page introductory first sections.

Out of the 47 photographs included in the 1<sup>st</sup> book, 24 were evaluated as photographs containing cultural elements. From these 24 photographs, 17 were included in the category of photographs relating to Turkish national culture and 13 of these are photographs of Ataturk taken in various environments; one of them including an image of the Ataturk's Mausoleum [Anitkabir]. The other 3 photographs have been included in this category because they contain images of the flag. Two of these contain images of students taking part in a Turkish National Anthem ceremony in a school garden. The other one is of an athlete receiving a medal, while the Turkish National Anthem is being played (p. 9, p. 11). Because the second photograph, containing German and United

States of America' flags and reflects other cultures, it was also included in the photographs that reflect other cultures category.

Bearing in mind that the markets that are set up in Turkish neighborhoods have an important place in Turkish culture, the two photographs, showing a "market place", were evaluated under photographs that reflect Turkish folk culture (p25, 26). The third photograph in this category is about a group of students performing a Turkish folk dance (p 59). A photograph, on the same page, thought to be a group of children performing a European, Balkan or Russian folk dance was evaluated as a photograph reflecting other cultures. Additionally a photograph, on a page containing a song related to April 23<sup>rd</sup> National Sovereignty and Children's Festival, of 4 children in Chinese, Indian, European and Caucasian folkloric costumes, was included in this category (p.68).

In the 2<sup>nd</sup> book the Orff instruments (wooden sticks, agogo, maracas, xylophone, triangle and tom-tom) included on pages that introduce school instruments were evaluated as photographs belonging to another culture (n=6). On the same page the wooden spoons, mini-finger cymbals, tambourine and darbuka [goblet drum] photographs were evaluated as photographs belonging to Turkish folk culture (n=4). Additionally, photographs related to special days and weeks that are celebrated in Turkey -two related to Kızılay Week and one related to Frugality, Investment and Local Goods Week- were evaluated under this category. In the 2<sup>nd</sup> book, two of the 5 photographs assessed to be reflecting Turkish national culture were of the composer of the Turkish National Anthem (Osman Zeki Üngör) and the poet of the lyrics (Mehmet Akif Ersoy). The other three were photographs relating to Atatürk.

Two photographs in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book (p.13, 14) were created using a collage effect, bringing together different touristic and historical areas in Turkish country. 22 of the photographs that reflect Turkish folk culture were of Turkish musical instruments; 8 were of regional Turkish folk dances. Following a very short explanation relating to Turkish folk dances on page 34; on page 35, 36, 38 and 39 photographs are included of the following Turkish folk dances: Horon (Central and Eastern Blacksea); Hora (Thrace); Zeybek (Aegean, South Marmara, Central Western Anatolia); Halay (East Central Anatolia, Eastern and Southeastern regions of Anatolia and Çukurova) and Bar and Caucasian dances (North East Anatolia and Central Artvin region). 17 photographs included in the book of universal instruments (drums, electric guitar, organ, piano, accordion, xylophone, guitar, harp, trumpet, and wind and string classical orchestral instruments) were classified as photographs of instruments that reflect another culture. A photograph, which is also found in the 1<sup>st</sup> book, on a page that contains a song about April 23<sup>rd</sup> National Sovereignty and Children's festival, of 4 children in Chinese, European and Caucasian folk costumes was also classified in this book as a photograph that reflects another culture.

Out of the total of 12 photographs included in the 4<sup>th</sup> book, 5 were identified as photographs with cultural content. 3 of these reflect Turkish national cultural values. Two of these were related to Atatürk. In one photograph, there is a Turkish soldier and the Turkish flag. The other two photographs included a plastic and a wooden recorder.



Although the recorder is an instrument that is widely used and taught in Turkish country, it originated in Europe (since the beginning of the Middle Ages) and therefore these instrument photographs have been identified as photographs that reflect another culture. The 7 photographs relating to teaching of the recorder; showing holding and finger positions were included in the “other” category (p. 32-35).

If we interpret the findings of Table 3 generally, the first striking finding is the number of photographs, which include cultural content, in the books. According to this the most photographs with cultural content have been included in the 3<sup>rd</sup> grade textbook; and the least in the 4<sup>th</sup> grade textbook. Such that only 5 photographs, with cultural content, have been used in the 4<sup>th</sup> grade music textbook. It is thought that this result is due to space being given in the 4<sup>th</sup> book to teaching the Turkish National Anthem and the recorder. So that the number of musical pieces are higher than the other books. The greatest number of photographs reflecting other cultures in the books is in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book (31%). It is observed that the 1<sup>st</sup> book has the lowest percentage in this category.

#### **4. Conclusion, Discussion and Recommendations**

In this study, Grade 1-4 Music student workbooks, prepared by the MEB for use in music classes in the first stage of elementary education were examined in terms of the multicultural items they contain. It was determined that the content of the books heavily reflect Turkish national culture. The findings gained from the books show that 4<sup>th</sup> book is the book with the most pieces in the category of songs with Turkish lyrics with melodies belonging to another culture (only 3 pieces). Additionally it was determined that 3 pieces are found in the 2<sup>nd</sup> book, 2 in the 1<sup>st</sup> book, but none are found in the 3<sup>rd</sup> book in this category.

Also, when the musical pieces included in the books are evaluated according to a multicultural educational approach, it is remarkable that many more anthems and songs that reflect Turkish national culture have been included in the first stage of elementary music education. This situation fits in with one of the principles and methods of teaching: *from known/close culture to unknown/distant culture* and elementary education general purposes bearing approaches in which *priority is given to including/teaching national values at all grades and levels, beginning in the first grade*. It has been determined that apart from a few songs and photographs relating to Atatürk and national festivals, a limited number and highly insufficient level of explanations, photographs and musical pieces that reflect Turkish folk culture have been included in the books. It was especially observed that songs, photographs and expressions that introduce different cultures oriented towards multicultural education, were not included. Accordingly, it can be stated that the books have been prepared with an approach that is far from an understanding of multicultural education. It is thought that due to these aspects observed in the books, they are insufficient in presenting a multicultural education.

On the other hand, it can be considered that although not included in the student workbooks, the Elementary School Teacher Guide books for Music, which were printed by the Turkish Ministry of National education and written by the same author(s) –as a supplementary guide for classroom teachers-, might include a higher level of cultural expressions in their explanations regarding application examples. Additionally, the instructor may be using different materials and supporting resources in practice. However in this study only the material the students use, namely the student workbooks, were analyzed. For this reason, in order to explore how much teachers are including a multicultural education approach in their classes, it is appropriate to observe the situation during the classes or at the point of implementation. In other words, due to the approach of the educator the content observed in the books can be reflected differently in implementation.

Based on this it can be stated that the success or failure of multicultural education, whether it is or is not able to be implemented, is dependent on the effective preparation of teachers and principals and their knowledge of the students and ability to correctly determine their needs. While teachers are choosing the right material for use in their classes, it is necessary for them to bear in mind the experiences, preferences, skills and cultural backgrounds of the students and therefore for them to know their students well. Erden and Akman (2005), who emphasize the role of the teacher in learning, mention that in accordance with the principles of humane education, it is necessary for teachers to establish relationships with their students. This is a principle based upon *respect*; accepting each student for who they are and *empathy*; trying to understand the students by looking at the world through their eyes (p. 108). Teachers that are teaching in nonhomogeneous classes must be able to look at the change, variety and differences as *a source of richness* rather than a problem.

Perhaps most of all, as well as the competence of the teacher the implementation of multicultural education is also about the sufficiency of the education program. For this reason, not only the textbooks alone, but also the educational programs, which form the basis of the textbooks, must be prepared within the framework of a multicultural (music) educational approach.

Based on these considerations, it is thought that there is a need for more research to be done in this area. It is recommended that multicultural education practices in music education be researched through experimental studies at the level of implementation and included in multicultural music education textbooks.

## References

1. Abdullah, A. C. (2009). Multicultural education in early childhood: Issues and challenges. *Journal of International Cooperation in Education*, 12(1), 159–175.
2. Aktın, K., Karakaya, M., Türk, Z., & Aslan, Y. (2015). Okul öncesi dönemde farklı kültürlerin öğretimine yönelik uygulamalı bir çalışma [An applied study for teaching of different cultures at pre-school period]. *Uluslararası Türk Eğitim*

- Bilimleri Dergisi* [International Journal of Turkish Education Sciences], 3(4), 258–277.
3. Anderson, W. M., & Campbell P. S. (2010). Teaching music from a multicultural perspective. In Anderson, W. M., & Campbell P. S. (Eds.), *Multicultural Perspectives in Music Education Volume 3*. (3rd Ed.). Lanham, US: Rowman & Littlefield Education, pp. 1–7.
  4. APA (2002). *Guidelines on multicultural education, training, research, practice, and organizational change for psychologists*. Retrieved from <http://www.apa.org/pi/oema/resources/policy/multicultural-guidelines.aspx>
  5. Arslan, H. (2009). Educational policy vs. culturally sensitive programs in Turkish educational system. *International Journal of Progressive Education*, 5(2), 44–57.
  6. Aypek Arslan, A. (2016). Sanat eğitiminde transkültürel yaklaşım [The transcultural approach in arts education]. *İdil*, 5(21), 363–372.
  7. Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. M. (Ed.). (2009). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives* (7<sup>th</sup> Ed.). Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
  8. Başbay A. & Bektaş, Y. (2009). The Teaching Environment in the Context of Multiculturalism. *Education and Science*, 34 (152), 30-43.
  9. Boon, E. (2009). *A Critical Pedagogy in Music Education and Dynamic Multiculturalism: Turkey Model*. 8<sup>th</sup> National Music Education Symposium, 23-25 September 2009, OMU.
  10. Campbell, P.S. (2002). Music Education in a Time of Cultural Transformation. *Music Educators Journal*, 89(1), 27-32.
  11. Cırık, İ. (2008). Çok Kültürlü Eğitim ve Yansımaları. [Multicultural Education and Reflections]. *Journal of Hacettepe University Faculty of Education*, 34, 27-40.
  12. Culig, E. A. C. (2012). *A content analysis of Asian-Pacific folk songs in American elementary music textbooks from 1967 to 2008*. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, University of Colorado: Boulder.
  13. Curry, B. A. B. (1982). *An evaluation of African and Afro-American music in selected elementary music textbook series and recommendations for supplemental song materials*. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, University of Houston, USA.
  14. Çevik, S. (1989). *Ortaöğretim Kurumlarında Müzik Öğretimi ve Sorunları*. [Music Teaching and Problems in Secondary Education Institutions]. Müzik Eğitiminde Başlıca Sorunlar Paneli, [Principle Problems in Music Education Panel], Ankara: Türk Eğitim Derneği [Turkish Association for Education] Publications, p.83.
  15. Diaz, M. C. (1980). *An analysis of the elementary school music series published in the United States from 1926 to 1976*. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, University of Illinois: Urbana-Champaign.
  16. Duman, M. Z. (2009). Küreselleşme, Kimlik, ve Çokkültürlülük. [Globalization, Identity and Multiculturalism]. *Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, [Journal of Social Sciences], 2(1), 93-112.
  17. Duman, T. (2007). *Atatürk'ün Kültür ve Eğitim Anlayışı* [Ataturk's Understanding of Culture and Education] in Cumhuriyetin İlk Yıllarından Günümüze Dil, Kültür,

- Eğitim [Language, Culture and Education from the Early Years of the Republic to Present]. (Ed. Nazife Güngör). Ankara: Gazi University Publication.
18. Elliott, D. J. (1989). Key Concepts in Multicultural Music Education. *International Journal of Music Education*. DOI: 10.1177/025576148901300102 1989 os-13
  19. Elliott, D. J. (1990). Music as culture: Toward a multicultural concept of arts education. *Journal of aesthetic education, Special Issue: Cultural Literacy and Arts Education*, 24(1), 147-166.
  20. Erden, M & Akman, Y. (2005). Development and Learning (14th Edition). Arkadaş Publishers: Ankara.
  21. Erkal, M. (2000). *Sosyoloji (Toplumbilim), [Sociology (Social Science)]*, İstanbul: Der Publications.
  22. Karasar, N. (2006). Bilimsel Araştırma Yöntemi [Scientific Research Method]. (16<sup>th</sup> Edition). Ankara: Nobel.
  23. Kongar, E. (1994). *Kültür Üzerine. [About Culture]*. (4<sup>th</sup> Edition). İstanbul: Remzi Kitabevi [Publishing].
  24. Mason, E. (2010). Multicultural Music Represented in Current Elementary Music Textbooks: A Comparative Study of Two Published Music Series. *Applications of Research in Music Education*, 28(2), 29-41.
  25. MEB (2006). *İlköğretim Müzik Dersi Öğretim Programı [Elementary Education Music Class Teaching Program]*. MEB: Ankara.
  26. National Association for Multicultural Education (2003). *Multicultural Education*. Retrieved October 3, 2016, <http://www.nameorg.org/resolutions/definition.html>
  27. Özdek, A. (2012). Müzikal-Kültürel Belleğin Bir Yansıması Olarak İlköğretim Müzik Ders Kitaplarında Halk Ezgileri (Azerbaycan-Türkiye Karşılaştırması) [Folk Melodies in Elementary School Class Books As a Reflection of Musical-Cultural Memory (Comparison of Azerbaijan and Turkey)]. Proceedings of KTÜ, 1. Uluslararası Müzik Araştırmaları Sempozyumu [1st International Music Research Symposium]. October 2012, Trabzon, Turkey. 53-78.
  28. Özturgut, O. (2011). Understanding multicultural education. *Current Issues in Education*, 14(2). Retrieved December 25, 2016, <http://cie.asu.edu/ojs/index.php/cieatasu/article/view/732>
  29. Papageorgiou P. & Koutrouba K. (2014). Teaching multicultural music in elementary school: Issues about what, when, and how to teach. *Hellenic Journal of Music Education & Culture*, (5)1, ISSN 1792-2518.
  30. Ramsey, P. (1982). Multicultural Education in Early Childhood. *Young Children*, 37(2), 13-24. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/42643731>
  31. Reimer, B. (1993). Music Education in Our Multimusical Culture. *Music Educators Journal*, 79(7), 21-26.
  32. Sun, M. & Seyrek, H. (1993). *Okul Öncesi Eğitiminde Müzik [Music in Preschool Education]*. İzmir: Müzik Eserleri Yayınları [Musical Works Publications].
  33. Toksoy, A. C. (2014). Çok kültürlü müzik eğitimi [Multicultural music education]. *Akademik Bakış Dergisi, Uluslararası Hakemli Sosyal Bilimler E-Dergisi*

- [Academic Perspective Journal, International Peer Reviewed Social Sciences E-Journal], 40, 1–28.
34. Tonbuloglu, B., Aslan, D., & Aydin, H. (2014). Türk eğitim sisteminin çokkültürlülük bağlamında analizi ve öneriler [Analysis of the Turkish education system in multicultural education context and recommendations]. *Eğitim Öğretim ve Bilim Araştırma Dergisi* [Education, Teaching and Science Research Journal], 10(29), 67–72.
35. Tonbuloglu, B., Aslan, D., & Aydin, H. (2016). Teachers' awareness of multicultural education and diversity in school settings. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, 64, 1–28.
36. Uçan, A. (1996). *İnsan ve müzik, insan ve sanat eğitimi* [Human being and music, human being and art education] (2nd ed.). Ankara: Müzik Ansiklopedisi Yayınevi [Music Encyclopedia Publications].
37. Uçan, A. (2000). *Geçmişten günümüze günümüzden geleceğe türk müzik kültürü* [Music culture from the past to today from today to the future] (1st ed.). Ankara: Müzik Ansiklopedisi Yayınevi [Music Encyclopedia Publications].
38. UNESCO-United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (2006). *Guidelines on intercultural education*. Retrieved from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001478/147878e.pdf>
39. Uz, A. (2009). *Türk müzik ders programları ve batılılaşma, küreselleşme, kültürel kimlik, "yurtta sulh, dünyada sulh"* [Turkish music class programs and westernisation, globalisation, cultural identity, "peace at home, peace in the world"]. In 38. ICANAS (Uluslararası Asya ve Kuzey Afrika Çalışmaları Kongresi) Bildiriler: Müzik Kültürü ve Eğitimi [38. ICANAS (International Asia and North Africa Studies Congress) Proceedings: Music Culture and Education] (pp.833–847). Ankara: Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu Yayınları [Atatürk Culture, Language and History Higher Institute Publications].
40. Wang, P. C. (2010). An analytical study of music textbooks used at the elementary school in Chinese society. *Research in Higher Education Journal*. 7, 21–32.
41. Yaşar, N. (2016). *İlköğretim Müzik 1 Öğrenci Çalışma Kitabı* [Elementary Education Music 1 Student Workbook] (5th ed.). Ankara: MEB. Publication.
42. Yaşar, N. (2016). *İlköğretim Müzik 2 Öğrenci Çalışma Kitabı* [Elementary Education Music 2 Student Workbook] (5th ed.). Ankara: MEB. Publications.
43. Yaşar, N. (2016). *İlköğretim Müzik 3 Öğrenci Çalışma Kitabı* [Elementary Education Music 3 Student Workbook] (5th ed.). (Ankara: MEB. Publications.
44. Yaşar, N., Çelik, M., & Şendağ, B. A. (2016). *İlköğretim Müzik 4 Öğrenci Çalışma Kitabı* [Elementary Education Music 4 Student Workbook] (5th ed.). Ankara: MEB. Publications.
45. Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2004). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri* [Qualitative Research Methods in the Social Sciences] (4th ed.). Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık [Publishing].

Creative Commons licensing terms

Author(s) will retain the copyright of their published articles agreeing that a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0) terms will be applied to their work. Under the terms of this license, no permission is required from the author(s) or publisher for members of the community to copy, distribute, transmit or adapt the article content, providing a proper, prominent and unambiguous attribution to the authors in a manner that makes clear that the materials are being reused under permission of a Creative Commons License. Views, opinions and conclusions expressed in this research article are views, opinions and conclusions of the author(s). Open Access Publishing Group and European Journal of Education Studies shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability caused in relation to/arising out of conflicts of interest, copyright violations and inappropriate or inaccurate use of any kind content related or integrated into the research work. All the published works are meeting the Open Access Publishing requirements and can be freely accessed, shared, modified, distributed and used in educational, commercial and non-commercial purposes under a [Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License \(CC BY 4.0\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).