

European Journal of Education Studies

ISSN: 2501 - 1111 ISSN-L: 2501 - 1111

Available on-line at: www.oapub.org/edu

DOI: 10.46827/ejes.v10i3.4713

Volume 10 | Issue 3 | 2023

THE MEDIATING EFFECT OF NORMATIVE COMMITMENT ON THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN INSTRUCTIONAL COACHING SKILLS AND TEAMWORK OF TEACHERS

Lyndon A. Quines¹, Divina A. Albutra²ⁱ

¹EdD, University Professor, University of Mindanao, Davao City, Philippines ²Master of Arts in Education, Major in Educational Management, Teacher 2, Dolo Elementary School, Dolo, Bansalan, Davao del Sur, Philippines

Abstract:

The purpose of this study was to determine the mediating effect of normative commitment on the relationship between instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers. Utilizing quantitative, non-experimental design via correlational technique, data were obtained from 300 elementary public school teachers who belong to the 3 districts, Magsaysay, Bansalan and Matan-ao under the Division of Davao Del Sur in the province of Davao Del Sur. The researcher utilized a stratified random sampling technique and an online survey mode of data collection. The researcher also utilized the statistical tools mean, Pearson r and Medgraph using Sobel z-test. From the results of the study, it was found out that there is a very high level of mean scores for all variables of normative commitment, instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers. Also, results revealed that there are significant relationships between instructional coaching skills and normative commitment and between normative commitment and teamwork of teachers. Further, it was revealed that there was a full mediation effect of normative commitment on the relationship between instructional coaching skills and the teamwork of teachers.

Keywords: education, teamwork, instructional coaching skills, normative commitment, mediating effect, teachers, Philippines

ⁱ Correspondence: email <u>faithevangel.agohob@deped.gov.ph</u>

1. Introduction

Teachers and students are negatively affected by poor team collaboration at school. Teachers' incapacity to work as a team may reduce their readiness to teach and have a negative impact on their dedication and behavior (Amorim Neto et al., 2018; Polega et al., 2019; Ronfeldt et al., 2015; Tschida et al., 2015). Furthermore, a culture of teamwork does not emerge naturally in the school setting. Effective leaders are required to shape the educational organization's team culture. The failure of the principal is likewise a failure of the teaching staff. Teachers expect principals to promote teamwork in the majority of circumstances. School administrators and teachers, on the other hand, are limited in ideas for how to strengthen every team member's involvement in enhancing team performance at school (Amorim Neto et al., 2018; Groysberg et al., 2018; Warrick, 2017).

In light of this, the advantages of teamwork are becoming more widely recognized. Several researches have proven the benefits of teamwork in the classroom. School administrators are primarily responsible for cultivating a sense of teamwork among teachers. To achieve school success, principals must drive teachers away from the safety of their closed classroom doors and instructional routines and encourage them to take risks such as learning and doubting with peers. Hence, team working is critical to school effectiveness (Amorin Neto et al., 2018; Benoliel & Schechter, 2018; O'Neill & Salas, 2018). Furthermore, the performance of the teachers' team is critical to the success of the school's vision, mission, strategies, and reforms. Teachers freely devote their energy and dedication to these teams through collective efforts and the collaboration process (Salleh & Kayode, 2017).

In teamwork practice, the teachers are designing and preparing materials, researching materials and ideas for curriculum, preparing lesson plans, reviewing and discussing plans, making collective agreements to test an idea, teaching others in formal in services, engaging in instructional coaching, and meeting to talk about professional topics of interests such as self-esteem. These practices make teachers have time to interact around the problem of practice and fostering relationships (Emanuel, 2015). Moreover, coaching leads to intrinsic motivation which in turn results to higher organizational commitment in teachers. The results of a previous study indicated that the coaches in the sample were highly committed to their organization and remaining in their position primarily through feelings of loyalty to it (O'Brien, 2020). Also, there are factors that can affect commitment including: work discipline and teamwork. Where teachers who have high discipline will attend school on time and go home on time too. While teamwork is part of the work team, the strength of the work team is centered on the extent of the cooperative relationships built within the team (Purba & Purba, 2019).

There is an urgency to conduct this study because as one of the teachers assigned to one of the identified schools in the study, it is quite significant to note that the teaching life during the pandemic time was greatly affected because of the abrupt shift from the normal face to face mode of teaching to either online or modular wherein not only the teachers made big adjustments but also the students as well. The mediating variable in

the study, normative commitment is timely to be studied whether it really determined if it had a mediating effect on the instructional coaching skills and the kind of teamwork shown by the teachers. Although there were already existing literatures on the association between and among normative commitment, instructional coaching skills and teamwork among teachers but those studies dealt only with bivariate relationships and did not cover the interrelationships between and among the three variables in a single study. This study dealt with the three variables with one variable as the mediating construct, making this study a contribution to new knowledge. Further, this study can raise concern for the intended beneficiaries of this study and possibly develop action plans to augment the teachers' normative commitment, instructional coaching skills and teamwork, thus, the need to conduct this study.

2. Literature Review

There are reviews of related literature which are discussed in support of the study. The instructional coaching relationship, as the independent variable of the study, is collaborative, democratic and of equal status in which problems are identified, interventions are planned, and reflection is practiced. Moreover, transformative coaching, which is the pinnacle of instructional coaching, goes beyond the technical advice or emotional support found in many mentor/mentee relationships as it assists in the development of the teacher's conceptualization and re-conceptualization of the teaching process (Richardson et al., 2020). It is also important to note that instructional coaching has been widely viewed as a viable method of professional development for experienced teachers, but instructional coaching for pre-service teachers gets little attention in the literature (Richardson et al., 2020).

In addition, instructional coaching involves one-on-one and small group meetings between coaches and teachers to improve instruction. A growing number of studies show that instructional coaching can have a large impact on instruction and student achievement (Knight & Skrtic, 2021). Yet there is substantial variation in the quality of coaching models. Like most educational interventions, the impact of instructional coaching depends largely on aspects of implementation, including the effectiveness of the specific model and the skills, training, and support of those tasked with implementation (Kraft et al., 2018).

Moreover, in instructional leadership, school leaders are actively involved in a wide range of activities aiming to improve teaching and learning. It is primarily characterized as a task-oriented leadership that emphasizes setting specific goals, coordinating the instructional program, and monitoring teaching methods, rather than motivating teachers, building lasting relationships with them and ensuring their satisfaction and general well-being. As a person who is expected to focus on the work that needs to be carried out, the principal engages mainly in task-oriented leadership (Shaked, 2021). Also, the correct leadership style to enable a school to leap forward depends on the demands and the intelligence of the leader to understand these demands.

A relations-oriented leadership style is less flexible than a task-oriented style. Leadership elasticity is higher in task-oriented leadership behavior than in relations-oriented behavior (Rajbhandari et al., 2016).

Also, schools with high proportions of staff working part-time tended to adopt a proactive approach towards flexibility. This included issuing an annual request to teachers asking for any requests to change their working patterns in the next academic year. School leaders check whether they could make teachers' requests fit with the timetable and staffing before negotiating with staff. Several school leaders mentioned that (Sharp et al., 2019). Moreover, spontaneous flexibility describes a person's tendency to search for various ways to deal with a problem without external pressure. To cope with this external pressure to adapt to a challenging environment, adaptive flexibility may be a useful ability for teachers. There is a positive impact of teachers' flexibility on the complexity of their classroom organization and their ability to react differentially to students' needs (Lubke et al., 2021).

Teamwork as the dependent variable emphasizes that a team denotes a group of two or more people working interdependently in the pursuit of a common goal. Teamwork is simultaneously used to capture both personal traits and a set of interpersonal behaviors necessary for teams to operate. Further, effective teamwork skills are essential for success in an increasingly team-based workplace. Teamwork is consistently identified as a crucial component of success in today's professional sector. Employers identified teamwork skills and the ability to collaborate with others in diverse group settings as a learning outcome that necessitated increased emphasis in schools (Britton et al., 2017; Varela & Mead, 2018).

Moreover, teamwork, encouraged by powerful leaders' initiative and management, is one of the methods utilized by organizations to expand gainfulness. This implies that team leaders should feel responsible towards attaining team effectiveness by exerting much service efforts inside the team (Chen et al., 2017; Eisenbeiss et al., 2008; Irving & Longbotham, 2017; Schaubroeck et al., 2007).

In conjunction, team building is a theory of occupation plan in which representatives are seen as individuals from related groups rather than as individual laborers. Team building alludes to an extensive variety of exercises, displayed to organizations, schools, games groups, religious or charitable associations intended for enhancing group execution. In addition, team building is sought after through a mixed bag of practices, and can go from straightforward holding activities to complex reproductions and multi-day team building retreats intended to add to a group, normally falling some place in the middle. Most part of it sits inside the hypothesis and practice of hierarchical improvement, however, can likewise be connected to group dynamics, school bunches, and different settings. Team building is not to be mistaken for group entertainment that comprises exercises for groups that are entirely recreational (Cialdini et al., 2017; DeBono et al., 2017; Lamm et al., 2017).

Additionally, leadership is important for creating school culture through mission analysis. It is also responsible for engaging improvement efforts out of the goal-setting

phase and into action. The style of leadership may have an impact on the effective implementation of mission analysis for school culture and student success. Leaders that can inspire staff are necessary to develop a professional culture of leadership at levels below administrators, such as department chairs, who are responsible for developing and sharing an instructional vision with their staff (Fraser, 2021). Further, teachers have commitment to student learning accept increasing student success as the mission and purpose of their work. Teacher leaders maintain a focus on improving student learning by diligently supporting peers to increase the effectiveness of their professional practices. Their infectious attitude provides the motivation and energy needed to engage others in the difficult work of teaching (Killion et al., 2016).

Furthermore, there are three types of teacher backup behaviors identified according to their reaction to feedback: mostly open, teachers who accept almost all the criticism from students and are keen on modifying large parts of the course, in order to satisfy their needs; critical thinkers, teachers who are selective in choosing the appropriate opinions from students, rejecting some of them, however being open to most of them; and identity liker, teachers who prefer to only implement changes suggested by direct feedback from students, rejecting all the anonymous criticism (Corelli, 2015). Moreover, teachers demonstrate positive backup behaviors in motivating the students during classroom interaction. The teaching technique applied in the classroom was teacher-centered model, and most of the classroom activities were done by the teacher. In some instances, there were some shared activities between the teacher and the students such as when giving demonstrations and examples (Leoanak & Amalo, 2017).

On the other hand, normative commitment as the mediating variable states that organizations continually face challenges to compete effectively with global environments. These are accompanied by modifications in the structure and planning of workplace procedures and people, including strategies for implementing change to effectively satisfy worldwide requirements. It was stressed that any organization's achievement resides in fostering an efficient technique by which staff can be ready to embrace change as they are the core implementers of the development programs, which in turn leads to employee engagement with the organization (Adeniji et al., 2020; Caballero & Guhao, 2020).

Relatedly, organizational commitment is the relationship between the organization and its employees. It has consequences based on their self-experience in a choice to continue or discontinue membership in the organization. The more established the relationship inside the organization is, the more organizational commitment is present. Employees who are organizationally committed have the tendency not to violate the policies prescribed by the organization and have good attendance at work because they see their work as an essential component of life. As said, willingness is tantamount to commitment (Caballero & Guhao, 2020; Sarhan et al., 2020).

Moreover, in the educational context, the school organizational commitment of teachers is very important for achieving school effectiveness which in turn influences students' learning outcomes. Additionally, teachers' organizational commitment plays

an essential role in establishing a unified effort within a school organization. Thus, it is necessary for every individual in the school organization to build up efforts in supporting the augmentation of teachers' commitment towards the school organization. Herewith, this will allow the school organization to come across impending organizational challenges and concurrently maintain the organizational commitment of teachers (Bernaldez & Gempes, 2016). In conjunction, to achieve success in organizational commitment, every organization needs effective leadership. Studies found out that teachers trust school leaders if they possess effective leadership, consistency, reliability, openness, respect and integrity which constitutes ethical leadership. These practices are likely to encourage teachers to be more committed to their careers.

Furthermore, this study was anchored on the Team Coaching Theory of Hackman & Wageman (2005) which states that team coaching is an act of leadership. Team leaders engage in many different kinds of behaviors intended to foster team effectiveness, including structuring the team and establishing its purposes, arranging for the resources a team needs for its work and removing organizational roadblocks that impede the work, helping individual members strengthen their personal contributions to the team, and working with the team as a whole to help members use their collective resources well in pursuing team purposes.

In support of this study was the proposition about Instructional Coaching: Building Theory by Galluci, VanLare, Yoon and Boatright (2010) which defined instructional coaching as embedded and situated work that includes observations of classroom teaching, demonstrations of model practices, and cycles that include pre- and post-conferences with practitioners (Neufeld & Roper, 2002). Coaching requires skills in communication, relationship building, change management, and leadership for teacher professional development (Knight, 2006). These skills and activities add up to a tall order for professionals who are placed in what has been described as ambiguous and contextually-dependent roles (Poglinco, Bach, Hovde, Rosenblum, Sauders, & Supovitz, 2003). Coaches are sometimes referred to as "change agents" (Learning Point Associates, 2004; Tung et al., 2004), implying that the teacher leaders who take these positions are pivotal in the creation of change through professional development. Change coaches may support the development of leadership or collaboration skills (Neufeld & Roper, 2003); or they may filter new information from outside the school (such as research or achievement data), something referred to in the literature as "knowledge management" (Coggins et al., 2003).

In addition, this study is supported by the Self-Determination Theory by Ryan and Deci (2000). The theory is an approach to human motivation and personality that uses traditional empirical methods that highlights the importance of humans evolved inner resources for personality development and behavioral self-regulation. It highlights the investigation of people's inherent growth tendencies and innate psychological needs that are the basis for their self-motivation, personality integration, and the conditions that foster those positive processes. The theory identified three needs namely: need for competence, relatedness, and autonomy. These are essential for facilitating optimal

functioning of the natural propensities for growth, integration, and constructive social development and personal well-being (Leal et al., 2014).

3. Material and Methods

The respondents of the study included 300 public elementary school teachers in School A, School B, and School C, all under the Division of Davao del Sur. A stratified random sampling technique was used in the study. In this method, there is a possibility that each person in the population sample could be selected as a subject. It ensured that the results would be comprehensive to the context currently studied. This stratified sampling approach divides the population into groups or strata. The concept is that the groups are formed so that the demographic units are comparable (Salkind, 2007). Moreover, the idea was that the groupings were made so that the population units within the groups are similar. Specifically, with a total population of 1,200 teachers for the 3 districts (MABAMA), the sample size was taken using Slovin's formula (n = N / (1+Ne2) Stephanie (2003). In this case, the public elementary school teachers in MABAMA only were the groups to become respondents. In particular, included in this study as the respondents were the regular public elementary school teachers of the 3 identified districts (MABAMA). The respondents were chosen accordingly to answer the questionnaire with confidentiality. The researcher believed that such a sample size and a number of respondents can represent the population.

Moreover, the researcher considered the inclusion and exclusion criteria in the selection of the respondents of the study. In particular, included in this study as the respondents were the regular public elementary school teachers of the 3 identified districts (MABAMA), who were currently employed and whose plantilla numbers were in the Department of Education, as they were the ones who were in the position to provide useful information upon testing the hypothesis of the study.

On the other hand, those teachers who were not teaching under the elementary department in the areas of School A (Magsaysay), School B (Bansalan) and School C (Matan-ao) were excluded from the study, for they were in different work environments and supervision. Also, teachers who were working in secondary and private schools whether in the same identified areas including those teachers also who hold managerial or supervisory positions were excluded from the study.

Furthermore, the respondents were free to decline to participate in the survey without any form of consequence or penalty or loss of benefits. They were not forced to answer the research questionnaire and were encouraged to return the same to the researcher for its automatic disposal. Moreover, they can withdraw anytime their participation in the research process if they felt uncomfortable about the study since they were given the free will to participate without any form of consequence or penalty

As to the research locale, this study was conducted in 3 districts of public elementary schools in School A (Magsaysay), School B (Bansalan) and School C (Matanao)- (MABAMA), Davao del Sur which is part of Region XI in the Philippines. Region XI

is located in the southeastern portion of Mindanao, and Mindanao consists of five provinces, namely: Compostela Valley, Davao del Norte, Davao del Sur, Davao Oriental, and Davao Occidental. The region encloses the Davao Gulf and its regional center is Davao City. The province of Davao Del Sur was created by the defunct Congress on May 8, 1967 under Republic Act No. 4867. It started functioning as a province on July 1, 1967 and was comprised of only ten (10) municipalities where Digos as the capital.

In this connection, the researcher believed that this is the appropriate locale of the study because it has a good number of respondents which ensured concrete results of the study and that the researcher has not come across a study using the variables on normative commitment, instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers in the local setting. Also, these 3 public elementary schools (School A, School B and School C) were chosen to be the focus of the study considering that as teacher, I have encountered various experiences that teachers needed to maintain their normative commitment, instruction coaching skills and teamwork, especially this pandemic time to be able to deliver what was expected of them by the students. The schools' accessibility and proximity to the researcher, likewise were considered as the reasons for the choice of the research locale.

The study employed a quantitative non-experimental research design using the descriptive-correlation technique. It was used since the researcher was interested to determine the degree of connection between variables. Additionally, it tried to define and understand the state of the current study (Creswell, 2014). The correlational technique is a non-experimental approach in which it analyses the relationship between two or more variables without reserve. It also looks into the degree of association by relating it with other variables. Apparently, correlational studies have an independent and dependent variable with the effects of the independent variable observed on the dependent value (Patidar, 2013). This design was used to align the variables based on the discussion of the aforementioned related literature. This technique was appropriate since the study aimed to determine whether there was a significant relationship between normative commitment, instruction coaching skills and teamwork of teachers in which the findings of the study may become good inputs in the formulation of relevant programs and activities for the betterment of both the teachers and the students, as well.

Moreover, a mediation model was used in this study. The mediation model is one that seeks to identify and explicate the mechanism or process that underlies an observed relationship between an independent variable (instruction coaching skills) and a dependent variable (teamwork) via the inclusion of a third explanatory variable, known as a mediator variable (normative commitment). Rather than hypothesizing a direct causal relationship between the independent variable and the dependent variable, a mediational model hypothesized that the independent variable influenced the mediator variable, which in turn influenced the dependent variable. Thus, the mediator variable served to clarify the nature of the relationship between the independent and dependent variables. In other words, mediating relationships occur when a third variable plays an

important role in governing the relationship between the other two variables (MacKinnon, 2008).

In the collection of data, the researcher followed a systematic procedure. The researcher asked permission from the Dean, Professional Schools, thru a letter, addressed to the Schools Division Superintendent of the Division of Davao del Sur. The said letter was furnished to the School Heads concerned with the 3 identified schools to allow the researcher to conduct the study on the 300 public elementary school teachers. As soon as the request was approved and strictly observing the safety protocols in this pandemic time as per mandate by the Inter-Agency Task Force for the Emerging Infectious Disease (COVID 19) such as physical/social distancing and wearing facemasks, the researcher immediately visited the concerned school heads of the 3 schools, as part of the courtesy call and discussed the plan on the conduct of online survey thru google forms to all concerned respondents. During the courtesy call, a list and contact numbers/email addresses of all respondents/teachers were requested from the offices of the concerned school heads/principals. The list served as the basis for the researcher for the data gathering. Also, before the actual data collection, the researcher secured Certificate of Compliance from UMERC to ensure compliance with some ethical considerations in research.

All retrieved questionnaires were encoded in the excel template after verification and checking as to the completeness of the answers. After all the tallying and validating of results, the data were analyzed and interpreted in line with the objectives of the study. Based on the findings of the study, conclusions and recommendations were formulated.

In addition, these statistical tools were used in this study, to include Mean in order to determine the level of instructional coaching skills of school heads, the teamwork of teachers and the normative commitment of teachers. Pearson Product Moment Correlation (Pearson r) was used to determine the significance of the relationship between the instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers; between the instructional coaching skills and normative commitment of teachers; and between the normative commitment and teamwork of teachers. Medgraph using Sobel z-test. This was used to determine the significance of the mediation of normative commitment on the relationship between the instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers.

Another important aspect of this research was the observance of ethical consideration since the researcher aimed to impart authentic knowledge, truth and prevention of errors in doing research. The researcher did not force the respondents to join the data gathering. The researcher ensured that the data to be gathered were kept confidential and that such information was utilized only for the purpose of the research. Each target respondent was given an informed consent form prior to the gathering of data. The participants were carefully selected based on the criteria provided in the research. The study did not involve high risks of situations that the respondents had experienced. Elementary teachers are the primary beneficiaries of the study. The study underwent a plagiarism check in the University using Turnitin, to ensure that there was no plagiarism that happened during the whole duration of the study.

The study had no conflict of interest (COI) since the researcher has no relationship to the respondents of the study. There was no deceit and everything that was written and reflected was true and has undergone validation and thorough checking from different experts in the field of research. Considering the risks of COVID-19, and in the conduct of the online data gathering, the researcher utilized Google forms where the respondents indicated their responses to the specific item-questions being asked. Furthermore, no person was authorized to publish nor present this paper except for the researcher herself or her adviser without the consent of the researcher. Lastly, before the conduct of actual data collection, the researcher secured Compliance Certificate from UMERC with the understanding that all ethical considerations were properly observed.

4. Results and Discussion

Table 1: Level of Instructional Coaching Skills of School Heads

| Indicators | Mean | SD | Descriptive Level |
|-------------------------|------|-------|-------------------|
| Task-focused leadership | 4.42 | 0.441 | Very High |
| Flexibility | 4.39 | 0.458 | Very High |
| Overall | 4.40 | 0.519 | Very High |

The level of instructional coaching skills is very high, resulting from the very high levels of responses. The indicators of task-focused leadership and flexibility have very high ratings. These indicators are arranged from the highest to the lowest level. The very high-level rating of task-focused leadership is suggestive of the very high extent to which the teacher plays a leadership role in team meetings. This claim is in line with various authors (Rajbhandari et al., 2016; Shaked, 2021) wherein leadership elasticity is higher in task-oriented leadership behavior. Task-oriented leadership emphasizes setting specific goals, coordinating the instructional program, and monitoring teaching methods, rather than motivating teachers, building lasting relationships with them and ensuring their satisfaction and general well-being. As a person who is expected to focus on the work that needs to be carried out, the principal engages mainly in task-oriented leadership.

The very high level of flexibility suggests that school heads develop collegial relationships with teachers. This is also in line with various authors (Lubke et al., 2021; Sharp et al., 2019) stating that there is a positive impact of teachers' flexibility on the complexity of their classroom organization and their ability to react differentially to students' needs. To cope with this external pressure to adapt to a challenging environment, adaptive flexibility may be a useful ability for teachers. School leaders can check whether they could make teachers' requests fit with the timetable and staffing before negotiating with staff. A two-week timetable is helpful in enabling more flexible working patterns.

Table 2: Level of Teamwork of Teachers

| Indicators | Mean | SD | Descriptive Level |
|------------------------------------|------|-------|-------------------|
| Mission analysis | 4.44 | 0.436 | Very High |
| Strategy formulation | 4.44 | 0.482 | Very High |
| Situation monitoring | 4.40 | 0.475 | Very High |
| Backup behaviors | 4.19 | 0.522 | High |
| Coordination | 4.43 | 0.479 | Very High |
| Conflict management | 4.38 | 0.472 | Very High |
| Motivating and confidence building | 4.37 | 0.466 | Very High |
| Affect management | 4.35 | 0.447 | Very High |
| Overall | 4.38 | 0.363 | Very High |

The very high level of teamwork among teachers resulted from the very high and high levels of responses. The indicators of mission analysis, strategy formulation, coordination, situation monitoring, conflict management, motivating and confidence building, affect management, and backup behaviors were arranged from highest to lowest. The very high level of mission analysis is indicative of the high extent to which teachers participate in defining the major goals of the team. This claim is in line with various authors (Fraser, 2021; Killion et al., 2016) wherein the style of leadership may have an impact on the effective implementation of mission analysis for school culture and student success. Teachers have a commitment to student learning and accept increasing student success as the mission and purpose of their work. Teacher leaders maintain a focus on improving student learning by diligently supporting peers to increase the effectiveness of their professional practices.

Additionally, the high level of backup behaviors is suggestive of the high verbal feedback of teachers toward teammates. This is in line with various authors (Corelli, 2015; Leoanak & Amalo, 2017) stating that teachers demonstrate positive backup behaviors in motivating the students during classroom interaction. In some instances, there were some shared activities between the teacher and the students such as when giving demonstrations and examples. Teachers who are most open accept almost all the criticism from students and are keen on modifying large parts of the course, in order to satisfy their needs.

Table 3: Level of Normative Commitment of Teachers

| Statements (8) | Mean | SD | Descriptive Level |
|--|------|-------|----------------------|
| Believing that a person must always be loyal to his or her organization | 4.49 | 0.558 | Very High |
| Thinking that people these days move from organization to organization too often | 4.11 | 0.691 | High |
| Believing that jumping from organization to organization seems unethical | 3.94 | 0.732 | High |
| Believing that one of the major reasons I continue to work in this school organization is that I believe loyalty is important and therefore feel a sense of moral obligation to remain | 4.47 | 0.563 | Very High |

| Believing that if I got another offer for a better job elsewhere, I would not feel it was right to leave the organization | 4.46 | 0.586 | Very High |
|---|------|-------|-----------|
| Believing in the value of remaining loyal to one organization | 4.47 | 0.551 | Very High |
| Believing that things were better in the days when people staying in one organization for most of their careers | 4.37 | 0.644 | Very High |
| Thinking that to be an "organization man" or "organization woman" is not sensible anymore | 3.90 | 0.708 | High |
| Overall | 4.28 | 0.439 | Very High |

The very high level of normative commitment of teachers reveals the very high belief that the teachers must always be loyal to his or her organization. This claim is in line with various authors (Caballero & Guhao, 2020; Sarhan et al., 2020) who mentioned that employees who are organizationally committed have the tendency not to violate the policies prescribed by the organization and have good attendance at work because they see their work as an essential component of life. The more established the relationship inside the organization is, the more organizational commitment is present.

Moreover, the results of the study are also in line with various authors (Bernaldez & Gempes, 2016; Ismail & Daud, 2016) who stated that it is necessary for every individual in the school organization to build up efforts in supporting the augmentation of teachers' commitment towards the school organization. To achieve success in organizational commitment, every organization needs effective leadership. Teachers trust school leaders if they possess effective leadership, consistency, reliability, openness, respect and integrity which constitutes ethical leadership.

Table 4.1: Significance on the Relationship between Instructional Coaching Skills and Teamwork of Teachers

| | | | | 0 | | | | | |
|---------|-------|--------|-------|--------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|
| | MA | StratF | SitM | BuB | Coor | ConfM | MCB | AffM | Overall |
| TFL | 0.500 | 0.402 | 0.374 | 0.363 | 0.328 | 0.283 | 0.308 | 0.328 | 0.469 |
| IFL | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | < .001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 |
| E1 | 0.538 | 0.456 | 0.449 | 0.416 | 0.376 | 0.386 | 0.295 | 0.369 | 0.534 |
| Flex | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | < .001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 |
| O11 | 0.582 | 0.482 | 0.462 | 0.437 | 0.395 | 0.376 | 0.338 | 0.391 | 0.562 |
| Overall | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 |

The correlation between the measures of instructional coaching skills and the teamwork of teachers revealed a significant relationship. This implies that instructional coaching skills are significantly correlated with the teamwork of teachers. The findings of this study are in line with the studies of various authors (Center for Creative Leadership, 2020; Harvard Medical School, 2021; Richardson et al., 2020) stating that coaching positively impacted employee's careers as well as their lives by helping them to contribute more effectively to the team and the organization. Also, coaching can improve team performance. Transformative coaching, which is the pinnacle of instructional coaching, goes beyond the technical advice or emotional support found in many

mentor/mentee relationships as it assists in the development of the teacher's conceptualization and re-conceptualization of the teaching process.

Table 4.2: Significance on the Relationship between Instructional Coaching Skills and Normative Commitment of Teachers

| | NCT |
|---------|--------|
| TFL | 0.210 |
| | < .001 |
| Flex | 0.318 |
| riex | < .001 |
| Overall | 0.297 |
| Overall | < .001 |

The correlation between measures revealed that there is a significant relationship between instructional coaching skills and the normative commitment of teachers. This implies that instructional coaching skills are positively correlated with the normative commitment of teachers. The result of the study confirms various authors (Knight & Skrtic, 2021; Kraft et al., 2018) who mentioned that coaching involves one-on-one and small group meetings between coaches and teachers to improve instruction. Instructional coaching can have a large impact on instruction and student achievement. Like most educational interventions, the impact of instructional coaching depends largely on aspects of implementation, including the effectiveness of the specific model and the skills, training, and support of those tasked with implementation.

Table 4.3: Significance on the Relationship between Normative Commitment and Teamwork of Teachers

| | MA | StratF | SitM | BuB | Coor | ConfM | MCB | AffM | Overall |
|-----|-------|--------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|
| NCT | 0.377 | 0.450 | 0.504 | 0.468 | 0.543 | 0.596 | 0.628 | 0.655 | 0.686 |
| | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 | <.001 |

The correlation between the measures of normative commitment and the teamwork of teachers revealed a significant relationship. This implies that normative commitment is positively associated with the teamwork of teachers. This claim is in line with various authors (Kokemuller, 2021; Salleh & Kayode, 2017) wherein the major benefit of commitment is improved bottom-line results in a team. Committed employees make decisions that benefit their team colleagues, and team organization in general. The performance of the teachers' team is critical to the success of the school's vision, mission, strategies, and reforms. Teachers freely devote their energy and dedication to these teams through collective efforts and the collaboration process.

Table 5: Regression results of the variables in the criteria of the presence of mediating effect

| | | | | 95% Confiden | | | | |
|----------|-------|----------|--------|--------------|-------|-------|--------|-------------|
| Effect | Label | Estimate | SE | Lower | Upper | Z | p | % Mediation |
| Indirect | a × b | 0.153 | 0.0301 | 0.0937 | 0.212 | 5.07 | <.001 | 30.0 |
| Direct | С | 0.356 | 0.0340 | 0.2890 | 0.422 | 10.45 | < .001 | 70.0 |
| Total | c+a×b | 0.508 | 0.0432 | 0.4239 | 0.593 | 11.78 | <.001 | 100.0 |

The aim of this study is to contribute to the literature regarding the possible mediating variable for the relationship between instructional coaching skills and the teamwork of teachers. Specifically, a normative commitment was investigated as a possible mediating variable that could explain the effect of instructional coaching skills on the teamwork of teachers. Full mediation is found in the study, and important and significant direct effects were presented that may help in the enhancement of the existing research on instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers. Significantly, the present study on the relationship between instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers has found relevance to the study of Hackman & Wageman (2005) wherein team coaching is an act of leadership. Specifically, the current study has found that normative commitment is a positive and significant full mediator of instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers and met Baron and Kenny's (1986) mediation guidelines.

In this connection, the mediation analysis involved the path between instructional coaching skills and normative commitment, and the path between normative commitment and teamwork of teachers. The findings confirmed the significant relationship between instructional coaching skills and teamwork of teachers leading to support various authors of this study (Amorin Neto et al., 2018; Benoliel & Schechter, 2018; O'Neill & Salas, 2018) who declared that to achieve school success, principals must drive teachers away from the safety of their closed classroom doors and instructional routines and encourage them to take risks such as learning and doubting with peers. Hence, team working is critical to school effectiveness. Thus, instructional coaching skills convey good normative commitment and teamwork among teachers.

5. Recommendations

The researcher came up with recommendations based on the results of the study. On the very high level of instructional coaching skills, it is hereby recommended that the best practices of school heads of being task-focused leaders and flexible may be continued as it provided sustainable effects to the teachers in their respective areas of teaching assignments. These include maintaining a good relationship with all the school employees specifically the teachers, showing a complete focus on the realization of the school's vision, mission and goals, being sensitive to the needs of the teachers' concerns for the students, and being able to make decisions under a win-win situation. Also, being supportive of the activities of the school involving teachers, students and parents, which activities may be conducted inside or outside the school premises. These activities may be officially reported to the Department of Education for their information and

monitoring purposes. This may also allow DepEd to come up with sustainable plans and programs for the continuing quality improvement of all schools.

On the very high level of teamwork among teachers, the researcher recommends the continuous implementation of open communication and building rapport between teachers and school management. This includes the conduct of regular meetings for some school updates and accomplishments, the conduct of dialogue between teachers and the school head if there are pressing problems or issues. Also, the conduct of seminars to enhance teachers' teamwork skills, problem-solving skills, conflict resolution, listening skills, time management and leadership training. These trainings will strengthen the abilities of teachers to become good examples and models to students, parents and the community as well.

On the very high level of normative commitment, it is hereby recommended that sustained efforts to keep the teachers committed to their teaching career should be maintained. This includes the grant of awards to deserving teachers for outstanding achievements obtained. Awards may come in monetary (if funds warrant) of giving of certificates or plaques of appreciation corresponding to the accomplishment. There may be an annual get-together celebration with some focus on the relaxation and recreation of teachers to unwind in the year's activities. The conduct of sports fest may not just be a better way of releasing some stresses and tensions at work but will be good also to show some teachers' skills in sports and physical activities. Also, activities like the conduct of spiritual activities like bible sharing, retreats and recollection are ecumenical in nature so all employees/teachers may be able to attend. Moreover, the results of this study may be a good basis for future researchers to replicate the study in other regions in a bigger scope using quantitative- structural equation model and another qualitative study depicting the best practices of schools which may somehow be given a commendation by the Department of Education.

6. Conclusion

With consideration of the findings of the study, conclusions are drawn in this section. There is a very high level of instructional coaching skills, teamwork and normative commitment in teachers. There is a significant relationship between instructional coaching skills and the teamwork of teachers. There is also a significant relationship between instructional coaching skills and normative commitment, and a significant relationship between normative commitment and teamwork of teachers. Also, there is a full mediation on the effect of normative commitment on the relationship between instructional coaching skills and the teamwork of teachers.

The findings of the study clearly confirm the notion about the mediating effect of normative commitment on the relationship between instructional coaching skills and the teamwork of teachers. The findings are supported by the anchor theory, the Team Coaching Theory of Hackman & Wageman (2005) which states that team leaders engage in many different kinds of behaviors intended to foster team effectiveness, including

structuring the team and establishing its purposes, helping individual members strengthen their personal contributions to the team, among others. Further, the findings of the study were substantiated by the proposition of Galucci, et al. (2010) on Instructional Coaching: Building Theory and the Self-Determination Theory of Deci and Ryan (2000).

Acknowledgements

To our Almighty Father the source of life, wisdom and everything for bestowing us His love, and enlightenment. Dear Lord, the researcher lifts this work to you and gives you back all the glory and praise.

A number of people deserve special mention for their contribution towards the completion of this paper.

To Lyndon A. Quines, EdD, her adviser for his efforts in reviewing and giving feedback and encouragement.

To the panel of examiners chaired by Jocelyn B. Bacasmot, PhD and the members, Mary Ann E. Tarusan, PhD, Rinante L. Genuba, EdD and Elleine Rose A. Oliva, EdD for the professional guidance, helpful advice, and encouragement through the course of this study. I benefitted greatly from their inputs.

To the officers of the Department of Education, Division of Davao del Sur who gave me permission to conduct this study and to all the respondents who have given their wholehearted support in this study;

To her husband, Al Ryan T. Albutra and their children, Christine Faye, Angel Faith and to her parents, and friends for the inspiration they give the researcher every day;

One above all, the Omnipresent God, thank you so much.

Conflict of Interest Statement

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

About the Author(s)

Lyndon A. Quines, EdD., is currently a university professor at the University of Mindanao, Davao City, Philippines.

Divina A. Albutra is a Teacher 11 assigned at Dolo Elementary School South District, Dolo, Bansalan, Davao del Sur, Philippines. She is a candidate for Master of Arts in Education major in Educational Management.

References

Adeniji, A., Osibanjo, A., Salau, O., Atolagbe, T., Ojebola, O., Osoko, A., ... & Edewor, O. (2020). Leadership dimensions, employee engagement and job performance of selected consumer-packaged goods firms. *Cogent Arts & Humanities*, 7(1), 1801115. Retrieved

https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/23311983.2020.1801115

- Amorim Neto, R. D. C., Bursey, A., Janowiak, D., Mccarty, C., & Demeter, B. (2018). Teamwork and motivation to leave the teaching profession: An exploratory study. Journal of Education, 198(3), 215-224.
- Baron, R. M. & Kenny, D. A. (1986). The moderator-mediator variable distinction in social psychological research: Conceptual, strategic, and statistical considerations. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 51, 1173-1182.
- Benoliel, P., & Schechter, C. (2018). Teamwork doubting and doubting teamwork. Improving Schools, 21(3), 225-239.
- Bernaldez, E. A., & Gempes, G. P. (2016). The mediating effect of conflict management styles of school heads on the relationship between ethical climate and organizational commitment among public elementary schools in region XI. International Journal of Management Excellence, 7(1), 743-750. Retrieved from https://www.academia.edu/download/73503631/pdf 46.pdf
- Britton, E., Simper, N., Leger, A., & Stephenson, J. (2017). Assessing Teamwork in Undergraduate Education: A Measurement Tool to Evaluate Individual Teamwork Skills. Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education, 42(3), 378-397. https://doi.org/10.1080/02602938.2015.1116497
- Caballero, C. G., & Guhao Jr, E. S. (2020). Structural equation model on organizational commitment of private schools' library personnel in region XI. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 9, 335-381. Retrieved from http://buscompress.com/uploads/3/4/9/8/34980536/riber-9-s3-29-h19-058-335-381.pdf
- Center for Creative Leadership (2021). Coaching to Improve Performance & Provide Support. Retrieved from https://www.ccl.org/articles/leading-effectively-articles/coaching-to-improve-performance/.
- Cialdini, R. B., Morgan, N., Hill, L. A., & Duarte, N. (2017). *Influence and Persuasion (HBR Emotional Intelligence Series*). Harvard Business Press.
- Chen, Z., Lam, W., & Zhong, J. A. (2007). Leader-Member Exchange and Member Performance: A new look at Individual-Level Negative Feedback-Seeking Behavior and Team-Level Empowerment Climate. Journal of Applied Psychology, 92(1), 202-212. https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.92.1.202
- Coggins, C.T., Stoddard, P., & Cutler E. (2003). Improving instructional capacity through school-based reform coaches. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (Chicago, IL).
- Corelli, A. (2015). Direct vs. anonymous feedback: teacher behavior in higher education, with focus on technology advances. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 195, 52-61. Retrieved from https://pdf.sciencedirectassets.com/277811/1-s2.0-S1877042815X00334/1-s2.0-S1877042815038082/main.pdf
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). Research design. qualitative, quantitative and mixed: Methods approaches (2nd ed). London: Sage Publication.

- Debono, D., Taylor, N., Lipworth, W., Greenfield, D., Travaglia, J., Black, D., & Braithwaite, J. (2017). Applying the theoretical domains framework to identify barriers and targeted interventions to enhance nurses' use of electronic medication management systems in two Australian hospitals. *Implementation Science*, 12(1), 1-13. Retrieved from https://implementationscience.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s13012-017-0572-1
- Eisenbeiss, S. A., Van Knippenberg, D., & Boerner, S. (2008). Transformational Leadership and Team Innovation: Integrating Team Climate Principles. Journal of Applied Psychology, 93(6), 1438. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0012716
- Emmanuel, J. K. (2015). Factors affecting the establishment and practice of teamwork of teachers: The case study of selected secondary school in Kilwa District, Tanzania (Doctoral dissertation, Masters dissertation, Open University of Tanzania). Retrieved from http://repository.out.ac.tz/1401/1/KILINDO JOHN EMANUEL.pdf
- Fraser, A. K. (2021). Licensed educator perceptions of the use of mission, vision, and values to guide daily school operations: A qualitative study. George Fox University.

 Retrieved from https://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1171&context =edd
- Gallucci, C., Van Lare, M. D. V., Boatright, B., and Yoon, I. (2010). Instructional Coaching: Building Theory About the Role and Organizational Support for Professional Learning American Educational Research Journal Vol. 47, No. 4, pp. 919-963. Published by: American Educational Research Association
- Groysberg, B., Lee, J., Price, J., & Cheng, J. (2018). The leader's guide to corporate culture. Harvard business review, 96(1), 44-52.
- Hackman, J. R., & Wageman, R. (2005). A theory of team coaching. Academy of management review, 30(2), 269-287.
- Harvard Medical School (2021). Benefits of coaching. Retrieved from https://instituteofcoaching.org/coaching-overview/coaching-benefits.
- Irving, J. A., & Longbotham, G. J. (2007). Team Effectiveness and six Essential Servant Leadership Themes: A Regression Model based on Items in the Organizational Leadership Assessment. International Journal of Leadership Studies, 2(2), 98-113.
- Killion, J., Harrison, C., Colton, A., Bryan, C., Delehant, A., & Cooke, D. (2016). A systemic approach to elevating teacher leadership. Learning Forward. Retrieved from https://learningforward.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/a-systemic-approach-to-elevating-teacher-leadership.pdf
- Knight, D. S., & Skrtic, T. M. (2021). Cost-effectiveness of instructional coaching: Implementing a design-based, continuous improvement model to advance teacher professional development. Journal of School Leadership, 31(4), 318-342.
- Knight, J. (2006). Instructional coaching. The School Administrator, 63 (4), 36-40

- Kokemuller, N. (2021). The effects of team commitment. Retrieved from https://smallbusiness.chron.com/effects-team-commitment-42028.html.
- Kraft, M. A., Blazar, D., & Hogan, D. (2018). The effect of teacher coaching on instruction and achievement: A meta-analysis of the causal evidence. Review of Educational Research, 88(4), 547–588.
- Lamm, B., Keller, H., Teiser, J., Gudi, H., Yovsi, R. D., Freitag, C., ... & Lohaus, A. (2017). Waiting for the second treat: Developing culture-specific modes of self-regulation. *Child development*, 89(3), e261-e277. Retrieved from https://srcd.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/cdev.12847
- Leal, I., von Humboldt, S., & Pimenta, F. (2014). What predicts older adults' adjustment to aging in later life? The impact of sense of coherence, subjective well-being, and sociodemographic, lifestyle, and health-related factors. *Educational Gerontology*, 40(9), 641-654. Retrieved from https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/03601277.2013.860757
- Learning Point Associates. (2004). Reading first coaching: A guide for coaches and Reading First leaders. Naperville, Ill.: Author.
- Leoanak, S. P. P., & Amalo, B. K. (2018). Teacher's behaviour towards students' motivation practice. In SHS Web of Conferences (Vol. 42, p. 00078). EDP Sciences. Retrieved from https://www.shs-conferences.org/articles/shsconf/pdf/2018/03/shsconf_gctale2018_00078.pdf
- Lübke, L., Pinquart, M., & Schwinger, M. (2021). The role of flexibility in the realization of inclusive education. Sustainability, 13(8), 4452.
- MacKinnon, David P., & Linda J. Luecken. "How and for whom? Mediation and moderation in health psychology." Health psychology 27.2S (2008): S99.
- Neufeld, B., & Roper, D. (2003). Coaching: A strategy for developing instructional capacity: Promises & practicalities. Boston: Education Matters, Inc.
- O'Brien, M. (2020). The effect of organizational commitment on teacher-coach burnout (Doctoral dissertation, Seton Hall University). Retrieved from https://scholarship.shu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3823&context=dissertations
- O'Neill, T. A., & Salas, E. (2018). Creating high-performance teamwork in organizations. Human Resource Management Review, 28(4), 325-331.
- Patidar, J. (2013). "Non-experimental research design." Retrieved from http://www.slideshare.net/drjayesshpatidar/nonexperimental-research-design
- Polega, M., Neto, R. D. C. A., Brilowski, R., & Baker, K. (2019). Principals and teamwork among teachers: an exploratory study. Revista@ mbienteeducação, 12(2), 12-32.
- Poglinco, S.M., Bach, A.J., Hovde, K., Rosenblum, S., Saunders, M., & Supovitz, J.A. (2003). The heart of the matter: The coaching model in America's Choice schools. Philadelphia: Consortium for Policy Research in Education, University of Pennsylvania.

- Purba, N., & Purba, S. (2019). Relationship between work discipline, teamwork, and altruistic with teacher's affective commitment state vocational schools in Padangsidimpuan City. In AIP Conference Proceedings (Vol. 2194, No. 1, p. 020145). AIP Publishing LLC. Retrieved from https://aip.scitation.org/doi/pdf/10.1063/1.5139877
- Rajbhandari, M. M. S., Rajbhandari, S. & Loock, C. (2016). Relations- and task-oriented behaviour of school leaders: Cases from primary schools in Finland, South African Journal of Childhood Education 6(1), a360. Retrieved from http://dx.doi.org/10.4102/sajce.v6i1.360
- Richardson, G., Yost, D., Conway, T., Magagnosc, A., & Mellor, A. (2020). Using instructional coaching to support student teacher-cooperating teacher relationships. Action in Teacher Education, 42(3), 271-289.
- Ronfeldt, M., Farmer, S. O., McQueen, K., & Grissom, J. A. (2015). Teacher collaboration in instructional teams and student achievement. American Educational Research Journal, 52(3), 475-514.
- Ryan, R. M., & Deci, E. L. (2000). Self-determination theory and the facilitation of intrinsic motivation, social development, and well-being. American Psychologist, 55 (1), 68. Retrieved from https://selfdeterminationtheory.org/SDT/documents/2000 RyanDeci SDT.pdf
- Salleh, M. J., & Kayode, B. K. (2017). An analysis of teachers' perceptions towards teamwork. Asian Journal of Management Research, 4(3), 516-524.
- Salkind, Neil, Jr. (2007). Encyclopaedia of Measurements and Statistics. https://dx/doi.org/10.4135/97814129526644.n439.
- Sarhan, N., Harb, A., Shrafat, F., & Alhusban, M. (2020). The effect of organizational culture on the organizational commitment: Evidence hotel industry. Management Science *Letters*, 10(1), 183-196. Retrieved from http://growingscience.com/beta/msl/3400-the-effect-of-organizational-culture-onthe-organizational-commitment-evidence-from-hotel-industry.html
- Schaubroeck, J., Lam, S. S., & Cha, S. E. (2007). Embracing Transformational Leadership: Team Values and the Impact of Leader Behavior on Team Performance. Journal of Applied Psychology, 92(4), 1020. https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.92.4.1020
- Shaked, H. (2021). Relationship-based instructional leadership. International Journal of Leadership in Education, 1-18. Retrieved from https://haimshaked.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/pdf.pdf
- Sharp, C., Smith, R., Worth, J., & Van den Brande, J. (2019). Part-time teaching and flexible working in secondary schools. National Foundation for Educational Research.

 Retrieved from https://www.nfer.ac.uk/media/3476/part-time-teaching-and-flexible-working-in-secondary-schools.pdf
- Stephanie, E. (2003). Slovin's Formula Sampling Techniques. Houghton-Mifflin, New York, USA
- Tschida, C. M., Smith, J. J., & Fogarty, E. A. (2015). "It just works better": Introducing the 2: 1 model of co-teaching in teacher preparation. The Rural Educator, 36(2).

- Tung, R., Ouimette, M., & Feldman, J. (2004). The challenge of coaching: Providing cohesion among multiple reform agendas. Boston: Center for Collaborative Education
- Varela, O., & Mead, E. (2018). Teamwork skill assessment: Development of a measure for academia. Journal of Education for Business, 93(4), 172-182.
- Warrick, D. D. (2017). What leaders need to know about organizational culture. Business Horizons, 60(3), 395-404.
- Yalcin-Arslan, F., & Ilin, G. (2013). Effects of peer coaching for classroom management skills of teachers. Journal of Theory and Practice in Education, 9(1), 43–59.

Creative Commons licensing terms

Author(s) will retain the copyright of their published articles agreeing that a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0) terms will be applied to their work. Under the terms of this license, no permission is required from the author(s) or publisher for members of the community to copy, distribute, transmit or adapt the article content, providing a proper, prominent and unambiguous attribution to the authors in a manner that makes clear that the materials are being reused under permission of a Creative Commons License. Views, opinions and conclusions expressed in this research article are views, opinions and conclusions of the author(s). Open Access Publishing Group and European Journal of Education Studies shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability caused in relation to/arising out of conflicts of interest, copyright violations and inappropriate or inaccurate use of any kind content related or integrated into the research work. All the published works are meeting the Open Access Publishing requirements and can be freely accessed, shared, modified, distributed and used in educational, commercial and non-commercial purposes under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0).