FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY

Halil Taş¹, Tuncay Zorba²
¹Ministry of National Education, Inspection Board, Turkey
orcid.org/0000-0002-5219-1123
²Ministry of National Education, Branch Manager, Turkey
orcid.org/0000-0002-9911-669X

Abstract:
The aim of the research is to identify the problems that primary school teachers encounter in the education of primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills and to reveal solutions to these problems. The research was structured within the framework of the phenomenology pattern, which is one of the qualitative research methods. The study group of the research consists of 20 primary school teachers who were determined by the "easily accessible situation sampling" method, one of the purposive sampling methods. In the study, data source diversification was made by selecting teachers of different gender, age and service periods and working in different settlements (province/district/village). Research data were collected with a semi-structured interview form developed by the researchers. The obtained data were analyzed by subjecting content analysis. Participant responses were grouped into categories and codes, tabulated, and presented by calculating their frequencies. In the research, it has been determined that the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills and the solution proposals for these factors are gathered in seven different categories: "student, teacher, family, social environment, printed material, curriculum and education system".

Keywords: Turkish course, reading skill, reading education, fluent reading, literacy

1. Introduction

Students have to acquire the ability of reading which is one of the main academic skills to be successful at school and to be able to maintain daily life activities. Being used nearly
in all parts of daily life and being the source of learning in many areas makes the reading skill, which is the source of high-level thinking skills, important (Bouchamma, Poulin & Ruel, 2014). While the act of reading is defined as recognizing letters, vocalizing words and sentences; reading skill is defined as understanding the meanings of the words and sentences read and thinking about them, being able to criticize and develop ideas (Eldeleklioğlu-Onuk & Avcı, 2021). Reading is not only decoding code in which the words are expressed, but also it is a high-level cognitive process that requires analyzing, interpreting and connecting ideas spoken (Dilidüzgün, Çetinkaya-Edizer, Ak-Başoğul & Karagöz, 2019).

Reading ability is described with the aim of achieving a person’s goal, improving knowledge and potential, participating and contributing to society; as comprehending, using, evaluating, relating and reflecting on texts presented in different ways (MEB, 2019). Reading, which includes many tasks such as analyzing the words in the texts by using orthographic, phonological and structural knowledge and skills, making sense of the analyzed words by associating them with the existing vocabulary, syntactic analysis of the sentences formed by the meaning of words and reaching the message contained (Güldenoğlu, Kargin, Gengeç, & Gürbüz, 2019; Keskinkılıç & Keskinkılıç, 2005; Wong, Graham, Hoskyn, & Berman, 2008; Yılmaz & Ertem, 2020), is a cognitive and linguistic process that forms the basis of all academic learning (Afflerbach, Pearson, & Paris, 2008).

Reading skill; facilitating a person’s life, contributing to his knowledge and cognitive development, chipping in with understanding his/her past and planning his/her future; acquiring the ability to understand, analyze, think critically, interpret and evaluate; can be defined as a learning skill that contributes significantly to the formation of personality (Dursun & Özenç, 2019). The feature of enabling individuals to reach a comprehensive information universe, increase their horizons of emotions and thoughts and establish the desired communication with the society they live in increases the importance of reading skill in daily life. Reading can be described as an important learning tool that is preferred not only by those who go to school, but also by everyone who needs learning, in order to get information, increase their sensitivity and awareness, and communicate effectively (Sever, 2011). It can be said that people read for reasons such as increasing their professional knowledge, meeting their needs, following social changes, expressing themselves in the community they are in, and learning new information by doing research on the subjects that they are curious about and interested in.

In order to raise individuals who question, criticize, discuss, produce conclusive solutions and gain high-level thinking skills, significant attention should be paid to the education of fluent reading skills. The fact that reading is a skill that can be developed and turned into a habit (Ceran & Karabacak, 2013) requires regular and planned reading skill training. Reading education has an undeniable place in raising individuals equipped with the superior features needed (Uyanık, 2014). The purpose of reading education is to gain the ability to operate metacognitive reading strategies that will enable the individual to understand and interpret the types of texts he/she applies to meet his/her individual and social needs (Dilidüzgün et al., 2019).
Perceiving reading skill only as word recognition and vocalization will cause deficiencies. For this reason, reading skill should be carried to advanced stages by exceeding the steps of word recognition and vocalization. Moving the reading skill to advanced stages has led to the emergence of fluent reading skills (Bilge, 2015). Fluency can be explained as reading a text accurately, quickly and with a suitable countenance (Bursuck & Damer, 2014; Kuhn & Stahl, 2003; Lai, George-Benjamin, Schwanenflugel, & Kuhn, 2014; Mercer, Mercer & Pullen, 2010). The abilities like recognizing the word easily, reading at an appropriate pace, reading by dividing the sentences in the text in terms of meaning and syntax, and paying attention to emphasis and intonation form the basis of fluent reading (Aktaş, 2021). Therefore, it can be said that people who recognize words accurately and quickly and vocalize them in an appropriate tone acquire fluent reading skills (Lerner, 2003; Wong et al., 2008). The ability of fluent reading skills to affect every stage and type of education allows some students to continue their education without difficulty with the advantage of acquiring fluent reading skills, while it may cause some students to encounter difficulties in their education life due to difficulties in reading fluency. In this case, it can be said that acquiring fluent reading skills is an important stage in the educational life of many students (Pesa & Somers, 2007).

Fluent reading (Young & Rasinski, 2009), which forms the basis of reading education, is today accepted as a skill beyond reading (Rasinski, 2010). According to Akyol (2019), fluent reading is a reading that focuses on spelling rules, emphasis and intonation, and doesn’t have flashbacks, word repetitions, syllables and unnecessary pauses, without disturbing the integrity of the meaning. According to the definitions made, concepts and principles such as speed in fluent reading, reading as if speaking, not disrupting the integrity of meaning, not making unnecessary stops, flashbacks and word repetitions stand out (Akyol, 2019; Keskin & Baştuğ, 2013). Reading aloud and silently, correct pronunciation, emphasis and intonation, meaningful reading, reading in chorus and speaking on the text will enable students to acquire and develop fluent reading skills (MEB, 2019).

When the PISA results are analyzed, it is revealed that Turkey is at the bottom of the list in terms of reading skills and the scores obtained are lower than the average reading scores of OECD countries (İnce & Gözü托k, 2018; Karakullukçu & Çelik, 2021). These results show that the reading education practiced in our country should be reconsidered and improved according to the needs (Bozkurt, 2016). New age needs individuals who can express their thoughts effectively and accurately, who are not only content with reading but also can draw new conclusions from what they read, and who can transform the theoretical knowledge they have acquired into practice (Çarkıt, 2019). The ever-increasing importance of reading skills requires more emphasis on reading education, which will provide fluent reading skills, and taking the necessary precautions on time (Aytaş, 2005).

Being important not only for individuals, but also for the smooth functioning and development of social life fluent reading skills (Karatay, Külah, & Kaya, 2020) reveal the importance of teaching fluent reading skills to children at a younger age. The
acquisition/formation of skills and habits as a result of the learning process that starts at a younger age makes the primary school period important in terms of the child's starting to read and turning reading into a habit (Aslantürk & Saracoğlu, 2010). This situation indicates that fluent reading skills should be given in primary school and the deficiencies in this subject should be eliminated during this period. These values and reasons constitute one of the reasons for choosing primary school students in this study. Additionally, the fact that the problems encountered in the education of providing fluent reading skills to primary school students have not been revealed by other studies is another reason for choosing primary school students in this study. In addition, it is known that the studies on reading in the literature are mostly carried out with students and teachers at the secondary and high school level, and the studies conducted with primary school students are limited (Yılmaz & Ertem, 2020). The stated reasons also ensure the originality and importance of the research.

In the international studies made, our country is placed low degrees in terms of fluent reading skills, there are inadequacies in fluent reading education in the country, grown-up individuals encountering difficulties in reaching metacognitive skills (MEB, 2019); has got this research to center students’ focusing on the problems encountered in the education of fluent reading skills and the solutions to these problems. The fact that fluent reading skills which are needed in many areas of life, cannot be acquired at the desired level and there are many reasons behind this; makes the opinions of primary school teachers who are practitioners of fluent reading education at the primary school level important. In this context, the aim of the research is to reveal the problems faced by primary school teachers in the education of providing fluent reading skills to primary school students and their solutions to these problems. For this purpose, answers to the following questions were looked for:

1) What are the factors that negatively affect the education of primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills according to the primary school teachers?
2) What can be done for primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills according to the primary school teachers?

2. Method

2.1. Research Modal
Phenomenology which is one of the qualitative research designs was used in the research. Phenomenology focuses on phenomena that we are aware of but do not have in-depth and detailed knowledge. In phenomenological studies, data sources include individuals or groups who experience the phenomenon under investigation and can express this phenomenon. The main data collection method of the phenomenology design is an interview (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). The fact that the participant primary school teachers personally experienced the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills and the collection of data through interviews required the use of phenomenology design in the research.
2.2. Working Group
The study group of the research consists of 20 primary school teachers. The study group was determined by the easily accessible case sampling method, one of the purposive sampling methods. Convenience sampling is a type of sampling in which a situation that is close to the researcher and easy to reach is selected, which gives speed and practicality to the research (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). While selecting the sample, the diversification strategy was used; In this context, data source diversity was made by choosing teachers from different genders, ages and service periods and working in different settlements (province/district/village). A total of 20 teachers, 9 female and 11 male, participated in the study. The ages of the teachers are between 28 and 53; their professional seniority is in the range of 10-27 years. 9 of the participant teachers work in the city center, 7 in the district center and 4 in the village.

2.3. Data Collection Tools
A semi-structured interview form developed by the researchers was used to collect data in the study. A semi-structured interview is a technique in which questions are prepared in advance, but the flow of the interview can be affected by different additional questions depending on the process. The semi-structured interview allows the interviewee to open and elaborate on their answers (Türnüklü, 2000). Since it has a certain level of standard and provides flexibility to the research, a semi-structured interview form was used to collect data in this study. The interview draft, which was created by taking the opinions of 2 lecturers, 3 primary school teachers and 2 Turkish teachers who are experts in the field of measurement and evaluation, was tested on 5 primary school teachers, and the problems encountered were resolved by adding new questions, removing some questions and making changes in some questions.

2.4. Data Collection
Face-to-face interviews with teachers were organized in a room provided by the school administration. Before the interview, the teachers were informed about the research topic and interview questions. During the interview, questions were asked to the teachers, and additional questions were asked depending on the answers of the teachers and the flow of the interview. During the interviews, which lasted approximately 20 minutes, audio recordings were made and notes were taken with permission. The real names of the interviewed teachers were not used, and the names of the teachers were coded as T1, T2, T3…T20. In the study, the principles of scientific research and publication ethics were meticulously followed; for this purpose, the Ethics Committee Decision (date: 15.12.2021 and number: 2021-369) was taken from Ankara University Social Sciences Ethics Committee.

2.5. Data Analysis
The content analysis technique was used to analyze the data obtained in the research. According to Büyüköztürk, Kılıç-Çakmak, Akgün, Karadeniz, and Demirel (2021),
content analysis is a technique in which some words of a text are summarized with smaller content categories with coding based on certain rules. The interviews which were converted into written text were read several times by the researchers and coding was carried out. Coding is the process of naming the meaningful parts among the data (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). After the data were coded, the codes related to each other were categorized. A category is the grouping of related concepts under a higher theme (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). In the content analysis process, the answers were grouped into sub-categories and tabulated, and the frequencies of the sub-categories in the table were calculated. Frequency analysis, while determining the numerical and proportional frequency of the data; categorical analysis enables a message to be divided into units first, and then these units are grouped into themes-categories according to certain criteria (Bilgin, 2014).

The reliability of the data obtained in the study was achieved through peer debriefing, researcher triangulation and member checking; the validity and reliability of the qualitative dimension of the research were tested in the light of credibility, dependability, confirmability and transferability criteria.

In the research, the audio recordings of the interviews were analyzed at two different times and the consensus rate in both analyzes was determined as 90.00%. In the literature, a consensus rate of 80.00% is considered sufficient (Keeves & Sowden, 1994). In addition, since the involvement of a co-expert in the research process enables more comprehensive data analysis (Denzin, 2017; Lincoln & Guba, 1985), a faculty member took part in the research as a co-expert and participant answers were examined separately by both researchers and co-experts. A consistency of 88.00% was decided in the determination of possible categories and codes. This calculated ratio is considered a high value for reliability analyzes based on peer review (Boyatzis, 1998; Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2019). Since a confirmation mechanism to be created with data sources will help to understand how adequate the results are to represent the truth (Houser, 2018; Silverman, 2006; Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018), the records that were converted into written text by the researchers were checked by the participants and their accuracy was confirmed.

3. Findings

In this part of the research, the findings related to each sub-goal are given below respectively.

3.1. Findings Regarding the First Sub-Aim
The data on the factors that negatively affect the education of primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills according to the primary school teachers are presented in Table 1.
Table 1: Factors negatively affecting fluent reading skills training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not fond of reading.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting bored of reading.</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparing for exams.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having too many assignments.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fond of computer games.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not having time to read.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working at a job out of the school time.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Teacher</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not having the habit of reading books.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not knowing the method of acquiring fluent reading skills.</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>70.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seeing the Turkish course as consisting of only grammar.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other subject teachers do not care about fluent reading.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being exam and test oriented.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students are not motivated to read fluently.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not paying attention to the proper use of Turkish.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not supporting students who is reading.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not being well trained before teaching experience.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers were given drudgery tasks at school.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family's disregard for fluent reading skills.</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The family is exam and test oriented.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of reading habit in the family.</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient attention of the family to the child.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low education level of the family.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The family’s economic situation is not good.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family forcing the child to earn money.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Environment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of reading habit in society.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet and social media addiction.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading books is not supported in society.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The disregard of reading books in society.</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>70.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prejudice that the reader will be harmed.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The society is exam and test oriented.</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>45.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No library or books around the child</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Printed Material</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textbooks do not have the feature of improving reading.</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The reading texts are not suitable for the level of the student.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading activities are ordinary and boring.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The reading texts in the Turkish book are too much and too long.</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>80.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textbooks and reading texts are exam oriented.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books are very expensive.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>55.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not buying newspapers or magazines at home.</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Curriculum</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The content of the program is very intense.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There are very few gains about fluent reading in the program.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient lecture hours.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The program is exam oriented.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The teacher's views are not reflected in the program.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The program’s emphasis on rote learning.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>30.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequent program changes.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Education System</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having an examination and training system based on test solving.</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The system does not pay attention to skill development.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Halil Taş, Tuncay Zorba  
FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY  
EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Count</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Application of rote learning.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluent reading skill is not supported by the system.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The unstable education system.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The ideological nature of the education system.</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When Table 1 is examined is seen that the factors that negatively affect the education of acquiring fluent reading skills are grouped under the categories of "student, teacher, family, social environment, printed material, curriculum and education system". When the categories are examined; 90% of teachers do not like students to read, 85% do not have the habit of reading books, 95% do not care about the fluent reading skills of the family, 90% do not have the habit of reading in the society, 95% textbooks do not improve reading and it is seen that 90% of the participants stated that the content of the program is very intense and 95% stated that the existence of an exam and education system based on test-solving are factors that negatively affect the education of gaining fluent reading skills.

a. Student Category
When the student category is examined is seen that the primary factor that negatively affects the education of fluent reading skills is that students do not fond of reading. Then, it is seen that being bored with reading, preparing for exams, having a lot of homework, being fond of computer games, not being able to find time to read, and working at a job out of school time are the factors that negatively affect the education of acquiring fluent reading skills respectively. Some examples of teachers' statements regarding the identified factors are given below:

“…Students’ dislike for reading renders our efforts in fluent reading skills ineffective…” (T3)

“…Students are in a constant exam race under the pressure of the system and their families… Exams cause reading skills to be relegated…” (T7)

“…the increase in students’ interest in electronic tools… and games causes them to move away from reading books…” (T12)

b. Teacher Category
When the teacher category is examined is seen that one of the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills is that the teachers did not acquire the habit of reading books. Then, it was determined that the method of gaining fluent reading skills was not known, they saw the Turkish lesson as only grammar, the other subject teachers did not care about fluent reading, they were exam-oriented or test-oriented, they could not motivate the students to read fluently, they did not pay attention to the proper use of Turkish, they did not support the students who read, they were not trained well before their teaching experiences, and the teachers are given drudgery tasks at school are the
factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the identified factors are given below:

“A teacher who has not acquired the reading skill and has not improved herself/himself in this regard cannot be expected to give her students this skill…” (T5)

“… Many of my colleagues do not know how to gain fluent reading skills…” (T6)

“Teachers consider the Turkish lesson to consist only of grammar… It is very difficult for teachers who work with exam focus to acquire fluent reading skills…” (T12)

“Teachers are given many drudgeries at school... watch, ceremonies, celebrations... Because of these drudgeries, teachers cannot do their main work.” (T18)

c. Family Category
When the teacher category is examined is seen that one of the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills is the family’s disregard for fluent reading skills. Then, it is seen that the family’s being exam-oriented and test-oriented, the lack of reading habits in the family, the family’s insufficient attention to the child, the poor economic situation of the family, the low education level of the family and the family’s forcing the child to earn money are the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the identified factors are given below:

“… Families care more about how many questions the student solves in the central exams, rather than fluent reading…” (T1)

“Families are not interested in their children enough... Without family support, it would be very difficult for a teacher to teach a child a skill alone…” (T4)

“… the education levels of the families directly affect the educational achievements of the students… The families with a high education level support the teacher in every subject…” (T16)

d. Social Environment Category
When the social environment category is examined is seen that the lack of reading habits in society is one of the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills. Then, it is seen that the internet and social media fondness, the lack of support for reading books in the society, the ignorance of reading books in the society, the prejudice that the reader will be harmed, the fact that the society is exam-oriented or test-oriented, and the absence of a library or book around the child are the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the identified factors are given below:
Halil Taş, Tuncay Zorba
FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY
EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY

“… so students cannot acquire fluent reading skills because they are members of a society that does not have the habit of reading books...” (T3)

“… fondness for social media pushed the act of reading into the background for the society...” (T6)

“… The attitude of the society discourages the child’s enthusiasm for reading…” (S10)

“… the stereotype that readers are politically harmed has led to a prejudice against reading and readers…” (T13)

e. Printed Material Category
When the social environment category is examined is seen that the main factor that negatively affects the education of fluent reading skills is that the textbooks do not have the feature of improving reading. Then, reading texts are not suitable for students’ levels, reading activities are ordinary and boring, reading texts in Turkish books are too long and exam-oriented, textbooks and reading texts are prepared for exams, books are too expensive, and newspapers or magazines are not bought at home are seen that there are factors that negatively affect education. Some examples of teachers' statements regarding the identified factors are given below:

“… Turkish books do not have the qualifications to acquire and develop fluent reading skills...” (T2)

“… some of the texts in the books are not suitable for the level of the students, and some of them are too long... This causes boredom and tedium...” (T6)

“… the fact that the textbooks are prepared with an exam focus interrupts the education of fluent reading skills...” (T11)

“… and the expensiveness of the books reduces the desire to read...” (T14)

f. Curriculum Category
When the curriculum category is examined is seen that one of the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills is that the content of the program is too loaded. Then, it is seen that there are very few gains in fluent reading in the program, insufficient course hours, the program is exam-oriented, the teacher's views are not reflected in the program, the program emphasizes the rote understanding, and the program changes too often are the factors that negatively affect the education of acquiring fluent reading skills. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the identified factors are given below:
“…the program content’s being very intense… and limited number of course hours negatively affects the education of gaining fluent reading skills…” (T4)

“…The absence of sufficient acquisitions regarding fluent reading skill in the curriculum shows that this skill is not taken into consideration…” (T7)

“Curriculum’s adopting rote learning… makes it difficult to acquire fluent reading skills.” (T9)

g. Education System Category
When the curriculum category is examined is seen that one of the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills is an exam and education system based on test-solving. Then, it is seen that the system does not give importance to skill development, the implementation of rote learning understanding, the lack of support of fluent reading skills by the system, the instability of the education system and the ideological nature of the education system are the factors that negatively affect the education of acquiring fluent reading skills. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the identified factors are given below:

“… Our education system is exam-oriented… It causes what is done at school more than solving tests to be perceived as a waste of time and effort…” (T1)

“… The instability of the education system… and rote learning prevent the expected benefit from teaching…” (T12)

3.2. Findings Regarding the Second Sub-Aim
The suggestions of the primary school teachers about what can be done to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills are presented in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>f</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Enabling students to read books more.</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reducing the time spenter with computer games.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Supporting students who are capable and willing to read.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Providing students with books.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dissemination the use of the library.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organizing award-winning reading competitions.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>Educating teachers about fluent reading skills training.</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>95.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Supporting fluent reading skills of other course teachers.</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Making fluent reading skill-based assessment instead of testing.</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>To give teachers the habit of reading books.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>75.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Being an example to students by reading.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>65.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organizing reading days.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Making reading fun.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>50.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When Table 2 is examined, the suggestions of the primary school teachers about what can be done to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills; It is seen that they are gathered under the categories of “student, teacher, family, social environment, printed material, curriculum and education system”. When the categories are examined; It is seen that for primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills,
100% of the teachers should ensure that the students read more books, 95% of them should train teachers to acquire fluent reading skills, 95% of the parents should be an example for their children by reading books, and 85% of them should have the habit of reading books to the society, 95% of them recommend that the reading texts which is interesting and entertaining, 90% of them simplifying the content of the program and 85% of them suggesting independent fluent reading course.

a. Student Category
When the student category is examined; In order to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills, it is seen that primary school teachers primarily recommend students to read more books. Afterwards, it is seen orderly that they propose to reduce the time allocated to computer games, to support talented and willing students, to provide books to students, to expand the use of the library and to organize award-winning reading competitions. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… ensuring that students read more books is the first step in gaining fluent reading skills…” (T1)

“… it is necessary to limit the time children spend with computers and the Internet…” (T7)

“… organizing reading competitions and giving awards to successful ones will enable them to gain fluent reading skills…” (T11)

b. Teacher Category
When the teacher category is examined is seen that in order to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills, primary school teachers suggest that teachers should be trained first to acquire fluent reading skills. Then, it is seen that it was aimed to support the fluent reading skills of the other subject teachers, to carry out assessment-evaluation based on fluent reading skills instead of the test, to give teachers the habit of reading books, to organize book reading days, to make reading fun, to help students obtain books, to help students develop fluent reading skills, to motivate students about the subject of education, to be an example to the students by reading, not to give too much homework to the students and not to give drudgery tasks to the teachers at the school. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… fluent reading skills training requires professionalism… educating teachers in this regard will ensure that students are also trained…. (T4)

“… that all teachers are meticulous in this regard positively affects fluent reading skills training.” (S9)
… organizing reading days at school… supplying students with books and rewarding students enable them to acquire fluent reading skills…” (T11)

“… giving too much homework causes students not to find time to read…” (T17)

c. Family Category
When the teacher category is examined is seen that primary school teachers especially suggest families to be an example for their children by reading books in order to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills. Then, it is seen that they suggest that more attention should be given to the child, to support the child who loves to read, to understand that education is not only about solving test questions, providing books to the child, rewarding the child who reads, to prepare an environment at home for the child who loves to read, not to employe the child in income-generating jobs and to create free time for the child. Some examples of teachers' statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… families should be an example by reading so that the child can acquire fluent reading skills.” (S7)

“… families should have their children read a lot of books instead of constantly having them solve tests…” (T13)

“… The student who reads a book is supported by the family… and if she/he is rewarded, the child will develop an interest in reading…” (T19)

“… having a child work outside is a serious obstacle to his education … this must be stopped.” (T20)

d. Social Environment Category
When the social environment category is examined is seen that primary school teachers suggest that primary school students first gain the habit of reading books in order to enable them to acquire fluent reading skills. Afterwards, it is seen that reducing the use of the internet and social media, supporting children who read, encouraging children who read books by rewarding them, making it easier for children to access books, organizing reading activities, reducing book prices, and abandoning the prejudice against books are recommended. Some examples of teachers' statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… that the society reads books and supports those who read books is an important factor for students to acquire fluent reading skills…” (T3)

“… the fondness for social media existing in society should be directed to reading books.” (T10)
“… reducing the prices of books, rewarding and encouraging reading students with books are important in terms of acquiring fluent reading skills.” (T17)

e. Printed Material Category
When the printed material category is examined is seen that primary school teachers primarily suggest that reading texts should be interesting. Then, it is seen that they suggest that reading texts should be prepared in accordance with the level of students, textbooks should be prepared in a way that improves reading, reading texts should be kept short, book prices should be reduced, newspapers or magazines should be bought at home, books should be printed with quality and access to books should be facilitated and entertaining in order to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills. Then, it is seen that they suggest that reading texts should be prepared in accordance with the level of students, textbooks should be prepared in a way that improves reading, reading texts should be kept short, book prices should be reduced, newspapers or magazines should be bought at home, books should be printed with quality and access to books should be facilitated. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… in order to develop fluent reading skills, the texts in the books should be interesting and entertaining…” (T5)
“… the reading texts should be suitable for the level of the students… the reading texts should be in appropriate number and length…” (T10)

“… books should be printed with good quality… No student would like to read an expensive book printed on bad and poor quality paper…” (T15)

f. Curriculum Category
When the printed material category is examined is seen that primary school teachers primarily recommend simplifying the content of the curriculum in order to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills. Afterwards, it is seen that they recommend increasing the number of achievements related to fluent reading in the program, increasing the reading hours, reflecting the views of the teachers in the program, abandoning the exam-oriented program, and making the program based on reading-weighted assessment-evaluation. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… simplification of the curriculum will facilitate the work of both the student and the teacher in terms of allocating time for fluent reading…” (T5)

“… increasing the number of course hours will be very effective in helping teachers gain and develop fluent reading skills…” (T13)
“… the fluent reading-weighted scale-evaluation proposition of the curriculum will make this skill come to the fore…” (T20)

g. Education System Category
When the education system category is examined; it is seen that primary school teachers suggest that fluent reading courses be given first in order to enable primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills. Then, it is seen that they suggest that reading books should be distributed free of charge like textbooks, fluent reading should be an elective course, the test-solving-based education system should be abandoned, the students who read should be rewarded, the rote learning should be abandoned, and skill-based education should be given instead of theoretical knowledge. Some examples of teachers’ statements regarding the suggestions are given below:

“… introducing an independent fluent reading course will be the solution for many problems…” (T1)

“… distributing reading books free of charge will eliminate the problem of expensiveness and access to books…” (T11)

“… the education system should give up rote learning and test-solving and focus on fluent reading education…” (T20)

4. Discussion, Conclusion and Recommendations

In this study, in which the factors that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills and the solutions related to these factors are tried to be determined in the context of the opinions of the primary school teachers, it is seen that the problems arise from seven main reasons: ‘student, teacher, family, social environment, printed material, curriculum and education system’.

According to the teachers, one of the factors that negatively affect fluent reading education stemming from students is students’ dislike for reading; this factor is followed in order by being bored with reading, preparing for exams, having a lot of homework, being fond of computer games, not finding time to read, and working at a job outside of school. In the study conducted by Karatay, Külah and Kaya (2020), it was determined that reading should be perceived as a necessity by individuals and an interest in reading should be created in order to acquire a reading skill in the desired direction. The words of a participant (T3), “Students’ dislike for reading renders our efforts to acquire fluent reading skills in vain…” clarifies our research findings. In addition, it can be said that an exam-intensive study, homework load (İskender, 2013) and working in a job for profit have a negative effect on the education of fluent reading skills in terms of time.
According to the teachers, the primary factor that negatively affects the fluent reading education originating from the teacher is the fact that the teachers did not acquire the habit of reading; these factors are respectively; not knowing the method of acquiring fluent reading skills, seeing the Turkish lesson as consisting of only grammar, being exam and test-oriented, not giving importance to fluent reading by other course teachers, not motivating students to read fluently, not paying attention to the proper use of Turkish, not supporting students who read, pre-service are not well trained and teachers are given drudgery duties at school. There are many studies in the literature that support our research findings; studies (İskender, 2013; Karakkullukçu & Çelik, 2021; Minskoff, 2005; Tekgül, 2013; Tunç, 2018; Ülper, 2011; Yalinking, 2017) reveal that teachers who have important responsibilities as a model for inculcating reading habits in students do not read adequately. The fact that the teacher, which is an important factor in motivation to read, supports and rewards his students, allows students to allocate time to reading and increase their reading skills (Karakakkullukçu & Çelik, 2021; Karatay, Külah & Kaya, 2020; Yıldız & Akyol, 2011).

Research findings indicate that whole of the teachers do not care about fluent reading skills and do not take care to use Turkish properly among the factors that negatively affect the education of students to acquire fluent reading skills. The fact that reading is a basic skill shows that this skill will be effective at every stage of an individual’s education life. This comprehensiveness of reading skill requires that this skill be given importance in all lessons and should be prioritized by all teachers. According to Yılmaz and Ertem (2020), fluent reading skill is equally important not only for Turkish courses but also for all courses in the program. Because individuals who do not have the habit of reading fluently are likely to experience failure due to not being able to understand what they read in all classes. Therefore, fluent reading skill is an important skill that should be centered not only in reading-based courses such as Turkish or Literature, but also in all courses (Okatan, 2021).

According to the teachers, one of the family-related factors that negatively affect fluent reading education is the family’s disregard for fluent reading skills. This factor is followed by the family’s being exam-oriented or test-oriented, the lack of reading habits in the family, the family’s not paying enough attention to the child, the socio-economic status of the family, the low education level of the family, and the family’s forcing the child to earn money. According to Yıldız and Akyol (2011), the fact that family members value reading enables children to be motivated to acquire reading skills. According to Rasinski (2010), who states that fluent reading is a skill that can be developed under family supervision, children can acquire reading skills more effectively and quickly with the support of their parents. One participant (T1) said, “When the family does not care about something, it becomes difficult for the child to learn about it. Families do not care about fluent reading skills, but how many questions the student solves in the central exams…” are the words that shed light on the subject. Reading hours in the family environment can help the reading activity to continue throughout life (Karatay, Külah & Kaya, 2020). Children’s taking their parents as an example (Karatay, Destebaşi & Demirbaş, 2015; Özensel, 2004;
Şen, 2015) ensures that the children of parents who read books are willing to read. According to Yılmaz and Ertem (2020), parents’ attitudes and behaviors about reading, the importance they attach to reading and their thoughts about reading affect the child and direct the process of acquiring reading skills. The words of a participant (T4), “… It would be very difficult for the teacher to give the child fluent reading skills without the support of the family… and it would be very difficult to achieve success…” also reveals the importance of the family in the process of acquiring and developing fluent reading skills.

According to the teachers, the lack of reading habits in society comes first among the factors originating from the social environment that negatively affect the education of fluent reading skills. This factor is followed by the internet and social media fondness, the lack of support for reading books in the society, the disregard for reading books in the society, the stereotype that the reader will be harmed, the society being exam-oriented or test-oriented, and the absence of a library or book around the child. The undeniable effect of the social environment and social structure on the perceptions, attitudes and behaviors of the individual can also seriously reflect the process of acquiring fluent reading skills. According to Aktaş and Çankal (2019), since the social environment of the student is effective in the development of fluent reading skills, the social environment should determine the acquisition of fluent reading skills as a common goal. The words of one participant (T2), “…it can be said that students cannot acquire fluent reading skills because they are members of a society that does not have the habit of reading books…” and the words of another participant (T6), “… and social media fondness pushed reading to the background…” is clarifying.

According to the teachers, the primary factor that negatively affects the education of fluent reading is the fact that textbooks do not have the feature of improving reading. These factors are followed in order by the following factors the reading texts are not suitable for the level of the students, the reading activities are ordinary and boring, the reading texts in the Turkish book are too long and the textbooks are prepared in an exam-oriented type, the books are too expensive, and the newspapers or magazines are not bought at home. The fact that printed materials, especially textbooks, are the most frequently and easily used tools by teachers and students in the learning-teaching process (Guzel-Candan & Ergen, 2014), enable them to be an effective factor in the process of gaining fluent reading skills. According to Karakullukçu and Yaşar (2021), books have a significant impact on the reading motivation of students. One participant expressed the effect of books on fluent reading skills with the following words: “… Turkish textbooks are not capable of acquiring and developing fluent reading skills…” (T2). In the study conducted by Aktaş (2021), it was concluded that activities related to fluent reading were included in the textbooks in a limited number and that the basic components of fluent reading were placed in the textbooks in an irregular and insufficient type. In the studies conducted by Kırmızı and Akkaya (2009) and Güven (2011), it was determined that the long and high number of reading texts in Turkish books poses a significant problem in terms of content.
According to the teachers, one of the main curriculum-related factors that negatively affect fluent reading skill training is that the content of the curriculum is too intense. This factor is followed by the factors such as the fact that there are very few gains in fluent reading in the program, the course hours are insufficient, the program is exam-oriented, the teacher’s views are not reflected in the program, the program emphasizes the rote learning, and the program changes very often. Content-target consistency should be ensured in curricula, the curriculum should be compatible with contemporary developments in science, art and philosophy (Demirel, 2017), and should take into account the interests and needs of students and their developmental characteristics, should be away from theoretical rote learning and should be practical. In the studies conducted by Taş and Minaz (2019) and Dinç and Doğan (2010), it was determined that the content of the Turkish course curriculum is very intense and the number of course hours is not sufficient compared to this content. In the study conducted by Yalçınkaya and Ülper (2011), it was concluded that the intense course content prevents allocating sufficient time for reading. The words of one participant (T4), “… The fact that the content of the program is very intense… and the number of course hours is limited, prevents allocating time for education to acquire fluent reading skills…” is clarifying the subject.

In the study conducted by Aktaş (2021), it was determined that there was no gain in the program regarding the components of fluent reading, which supports our research findings. In the study conducted by Eldeleklioglu-Onuk and Avci (2021), similar to our research findings, it was concluded that the weight given to metacognitive skills such as fluent reading among the objectives/achievements in the program is much less than other skills, and the course hours allocated for fluent reading skills are limited. The words of a participant (T7) “The fact that there are not enough acquisitions related to fluent reading skill in the curriculum shows that this skill is not taken into consideration...” shows that the acquisitions related to fluent reading skill are not included in the curriculum at a sufficient level. Although fluency is a necessary prerequisite for reading comprehension, it is clear that fluent reading skills are not included enough in the primary school curriculum in our country (Baştuğ & Akyol, 2012).

According to the teachers, one of the factors originating from the education system that negatively affects the education of fluent reading skills is an exam and education system based on test-solving. This factor is followed by the system's lack of emphasis on skill development, the implementation of rote learning, the fact that fluent reading skills are not supported by the system, the education system is unstable and the education system is ideological. Today, the fact that student success depends on the exam scores obtained causes the success to be exam-oriented and the students do not spare time for constantly reading and solving tests for exams. Participants stated, “The fact that our education system is exam-oriented... causes what is done other than solving tests at school to be perceived as a waste of time and effort...” (T1), “The instability and rote learning of the education system prevent the expected benefit from educational activities...” (T12), are remarkable in this sense. The fact that fluent reading education is a process and performance-oriented study require the use of both process and performance and result-oriented measurement
methods, techniques and tools (Eldeleklioglu-Onuk & Avci, 2021). Hence, in order for students to gain fluent reading skills, it is necessary to abandon the measurement of success only with the grades taken in the exams and to create free time for students to read books (Karatay, Külah & Kaya, 2020).

In the studies, it was determined that the solutions offered by the primary school teachers for primary school students to acquire fluent reading skills were gathered in seven categories: "student, teacher, family, social environment, printed material, curriculum and education system". Enabling all of the teachers to read books so that their students can acquire fluent reading skills, 95% of them train teachers to acquire fluent reading skills, 95% of families be an example for their children by reading books, 85% of them make the society gain the habit of reading, 95% of them read books in which the texts should be interesting and entertaining, 90% of them recommend simplifying the content of the program, and 85% of them suggest an independent reading fluency course are seen when the teachers' suggestions about what needs to be done to help students gain fluent reading skills are considered as a whole.

In the research, the teachers' consideration of the factors that negatively affect the students' fluent reading skills education and the solution proposals in the same categories; shows that teachers perceive the causes of problems as ways to a solution in a sense. The data obtained shows that teachers see the elimination of problems or the factors that pave the way for the formation of problems as an important solution in providing students with fluent reading skills. The results of the research can be interpreted as the teachers are aware of the problems related to fluent reading education and they have effective and different suggestions for the solution of these problems.

The following recommendations can be developed based on the research results:
1) Since they have important duties and responsibilities in providing students with fluent reading skills, making them love reading, guiding and motivating them, teachers should improve/update themselves on these issues.
2) Families have to be made conscious about helping their children acquire fluent reading skills and motivating them to read, and their active participation in the education process of providing children with fluent reading skills should be ensured.
3) The role models of families and teachers urge important duties on parents and teachers in the process of acquiring fluent reading skills. In this framework, both parents and teachers should manage their duties and responsibilities by reading and supporting the reader.
4) So as to gain fluent reading skills, students' access to books should be facilitated, children who read should be supported in many ways, reading days/activities should be organized, healthy reading environments should be created and students who reads should be rewarded.
5) Exam-centered and test-question-oriented education should change and the perspective that accepts the test exam score as the only criterion for success should be abandoned.
6) Texts in textbooks and reading books should be of length and number that will make reading fun and books should also be prepared to motivate reading in terms of paper and print quality.

7) Activities related to reading should be given more time in the classroom environment, and the criteria of relevance for purpose, being interesting and entertaining should be taken into account in the preparation and implementation of such activities.

8) The number of acquisitions related to fluent reading skills in the Turkish curriculum and the number of course hours should be increased.

9) Teachers should be given effective and practical training on fluent reading skills before and during the teaching experience.

Conflict of Interest Statement
The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

About the Authors
Halil Taş works at the Ministry of National Education as an Inspector. He holds a doctorate in classroom teaching. He conducts research on classroom teaching, teacher training, literacy and classroom management.

Tuncay Zorba works at the Ministry of National Education as a Branch Manager. He holds a doctorate in education management. He conducts research on education management and classroom management.

References


FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY


Bursuck, W., & Damer, M. (2014). Reading instruction for students who are at risk or have disabilities. London, UK: Pearson Education Inc.


FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY
EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY


Halil Taş, Tuncay Zorba
FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY
EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY


Yılmaz, M., & Ertem, İ. S. (2020). İlkokul öğrencilerinin okuma alışkanlarının çeşitli değişkenler açısından incelenmesi. Journal of Social, Humanities and Administrative Sciences, 6(34), 2210-2219

FACTORS THAT AFFECT THE FLUENT READING ABILITY EDUCATION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL STUDENTS NEGATIVELY

Creative Commons licensing terms
Author(s) will retain the copyright of their published articles agreeing that a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0) terms will be applied to their work. Under the terms of this license, no permission is required from the author(s) or publisher for members of the community to copy, distribute, transmit or adapt the article content, providing a proper, prominent and unambiguous attribution to the authors in a manner that makes clear that the materials are being reused under permission of a Creative Commons License. Views, opinions and conclusions expressed in this research article are views, opinions and conclusions of the author(s). Open Access Publishing Group and European Journal of Education Studies shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability caused in relation to/arising out of conflicts of interest, copyright violations and inappropriate or inaccurate use of any kind content related or integrated into the research work. All the published works are meeting the Open Access Publishing requirements and can be freely accessed, shared, modified, distributed and used in educational, commercial and non-commercial purposes under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0).