



MULTILINGUALISM AND CINEMA

Simber Atayⁱ

Head of Photography Department,
Fine Arts Faculty,
Dokuz Eylül University,
Turkey

Abstract:

Multilingualism is a very wide interdisciplinary research area. Multilingualism means speaking, reading, writing and self-expression in at least three languages. Sometimes, multilingualism is confused with bilingualism. But they are two different categories. Hence, there should be at least three languages in any multilingual structure. Multilingualism is also a cultural policy aimed quality communication from the Sumerian bureaucracy to nowadays. Besides, multilingualism is a significant inspiration source for cinema. In fact multilingual movie is a phenomenon of History of Cinema and moreover since the mid-1980s until today multilingual movie becomes a particular genre. In the present chapter, some components of multilingualism like Tower of Babel, Hermes, lingual politics of Renaissance, Lingua Franca, Esperanto, linguistic relativity and some sample multilingual movies like *Lost in Translation* (2003) of Sophia Coppola, *The New World* (2005) and *To the Wonder* (2012) of Terrence Malick, *Babel* (2006) of Alejandro G. Iñárritu, *Avatar* (2009) of James Cameron, *Inglourious Basterds* (2009) of Quentin Tarantino, *Arrival* (2016) of Denis Villeneuve, and *Radio Dreams* (2016) of Babak Jalali are studied within a descriptive approach.

Keywords: multilingualism, multilingual movie genre, Chris Wahl, Tower of Babel, Hermes, Benjamin Lee Whorf

1. Introduction

Multilingualism is an interdisciplinary research area. In fact, multilingualism represents a large multicompetence territory spreading within linguistics, philology, history, film studies, and cultural studies. Besides, the cosmopolitan cultures and environments traditionally free, colorful, tolerant and rich in structure constitute mnemonic basis of multilingualism.

In the context of Linguistics, the myth of the Tower of Babel, the polyglot character of Hermes, the universal language policy of Renaissance, lingua franca

phenomenon, the Esperanto ideal, linguistic relativity are some components of multilingualism.

Tower of Babel indicates chaotic character of multilingualism. Because a foreign language could be an existential obstacle; even the translation cannot resolve this problem; understanding a foreign language is insufficient sometimes for a perfect communication. Hence Tower of Babel is an archetypic symbol of non-communication or miscommunication. Multilingualism represents Tower of Babel curse in the sense of universal communication problematic between people but on the other hand, multilingualism is a linguistic gift, a cultural richness and privilege. Eventually Hermes represents positive side of multilingualism by his divine virtuosity of communication. Moreover, translation and publication policies in Renaissance display multilingual/multicultural quality of Humanism. On the other hand, lingua franca is an international cultural necessity. Throughout the history, according to cultural and political conjuncture some languages became lingua franca like Latin, French or English. Esperanto is also a universal multi-linguistic design created with the aim and hope of universal peace and harmony.

In the same context, according to linguistic relativity of Benjamin Lee Whorf, each language represents a different Weltanschauung.

Literally, *“Material culture of multilingualism comprises materialities relating to multilingual way of existence, whether by individuals or by societies.”* (Aronin & Laoine, 2013: 228).

Multilingualism inspires also cinema. In fact multilingualism exists in the nature of cinema. Global film industry is a multicultural and polyglot organization. Cinematographically multilingualism includes ancient languages, lost languages, and extinct languages, rare languages even invented languages besides living languages. Today in many territories of postmodern world, multilingualism becomes a daily reality because of global migration movements, related cultural policies, and post-colonial developments. Therefore, linguistic and cultural studies in the field of multilingualism have been intensified. Sometimes bilingualism is defined in the context of multilingualism, but we need at least three languages in order to fully define multilingualism.

Inter-lingual navigation, inter-cultural mobility of different languages, different mentalities and psychological contradictions represented by tongues, inter-critical discourses of different languages offer multilayered imaginative possibilities for artistic creativity. A multilingual community has many adventures and stories in its own right. Hence, multilingual creativity arises from the multilingual imagination that exists in a multilingual environment. This situation perfectly coincides with the notion of ‘multilingual imagination’ developed by Azade Seyhan (2005: 153) quoting from the text ‘Imaginary Homelands’ of Salman Rushdie in her studies about Contemporary German Literature and the authors of Turkish origin who write in German language.

As in literature and other arts, multilingualism inspires also film directors. Since the mid-1980s until today many film directors made many multilingual movies and as a result a new genre is created: Multilingual Movie Genre! Chris Wahl was the first person

to describe polyglot film/multilingual movie as a genre in 2005 (Dwyer, 2005: 296). He categorized it also in five sub-genres as the fraternization film, the globalization film, the migration film, the colonial film, the existential films (De Bonis, 2015: 23-24). Because, post-modernism, globalization and post-colonialism are also efficient social factors for the production of multilingual movies. In this context, multilingual movie is not a simple thematic issue but it represents a new cinematographic esthetic. Therefore, each director who makes multilingual movie does not represent literally multilingual movie genre. Multilingual movies tell us multilingual stories of polyglot persons or a multilingual movie is a composite movie consisting of monolingual and serial narratives. But as a genre, multilingual movie represents now a particular aesthetic, a particular critical vision and a cosmopolite irony. Multilingualism is a perfect environment for film directors to create hyper- realist historical atmospheres, cultural chronotopes and briefly artistic aura, moreover it provides possibilities to make historical and political criticism. In the same way, film directors can create metaphors and metonymies by using different characteristics of different languages. In this present chapter, some movies of contemporary directors who represent literally the particular aesthetics of multilingual movie genre and contribute to the evolution of cinematographic language by this way were chosen as samples to exam.

The discussion on bilingual or multilingual movies is related to linguistic as much as it concerns cinema. On the other hand, subtitle translation creates also a multilingual movie simulation. Another aspect of the issue is this: bilingual movies are sometimes used when we define multilingual film properties. But a real multilingual movie includes at least three languages.

Historically in Weimar Republic period, UFA produced simultaneously different versions of a movie in different languages until the subtitle system became perfect. In cinema, dubbing and subtitling are global distribution facilities but at the same time these methods depend on endless problematic of translation. A situation that needs also to be mentioned at this point: dubbing is against the nature of multilingual film. However, linguistics specialists have great interest for multilingual movie as well as academicians who work in film studies area.

Eventually for the multilingual movie genre, it's necessary to examine cultural components of multilingualism mentioned above, then the properties of the multilingual movie genre will be identified by these cult multilingual movies: *Lost in Translation* (2003) directed by Sophia Coppola, *The New World* (2005) and *To the Wonder* (2012) directed by Terrence Malick, *Babel* (2006) directed by Alejandro G. Iñárritu, *Avatar* (2009) directed by James Cameron, *Inglorious Basterds* (2009) directed by Quentin Tarantino, *Arrival* (2016) directed by Denis Villeneuve, and *Radio Dreams*(2016) directed by Babak Jalali.

The aim of this chapter is forming a textual assemblage by descriptive method about the genre of multilingual movie using the mentioned multilingualism components and related cinematographic indications.

2. What Is Multilingualism?

According to Merriam-Webster digital dictionary, definition of 'multilingual' is:

- 1) of, having or expressed in several languages
- 2) using or able to use several languages especially with equal fluency.

And multilingualism is *"a term of Latin origin meaning the use of many languages usually more than two or three...its Greek equivalent is polyglossia"* (Knauth, 2009: 60).

Bilingualism is also often mentioned when talking about multilingualism. Bilingualism is also a convenient environment for multilingualism in practice and study, but it is different. Bilingualism is generally a spontaneous extension of the family structure and social conditions in which the individual is involved whereas multilingualism is a form of cultural existence.

Multilingualism is an individual quality but it has also mass-characteristics. In fact, *"a language is more than just an instrument of communication, it is the mode of expression, of culture, the reflection of an identity."* (Yannic, 2010: 32).

Then, multilingualism represents cultural diversity on individual and social level.

Multilingual people are different from monolingual people. According to Moore & Gajo (2009): *"While monolingual speakers use one single language in all situations, multilingual speakers navigate among languages and do not use each of their languages for the same purposes in all communicative situations, in the same domains, or with the same people"* (as cited in Cenoz, 2013: 11).

Multilingualism is a rhythmical deterritorialization /reterritorialization oscillation phenomenon within vast cultural maps of different civilizations. According to the multilingualism definition of digital Yivo Encyclopedia: *"It assumes the ability to switch from one language to another in speech, in writing or in reading"*. (Harshav, 2011:1).

3. Tower of Babel

Multilingualism is a Janus phenomenon. One side indicates chaos but the other side represents harmony. Hence, multilingualism has been evolved along a Borgesian path: So let's go to the library! There is a book there, The Holy Bible, King James Version, printed by Coldstream; Robert Kerr for The Scottish Free Bible Press Company in MDCCCXLV (1845). Please open chapter XI /page six of Old Testament where the case of Babel is written:

"1 And the whole earth was of one language, and of one speech.

2 And it came to pass, as they journeyed from the east, that they found a plain in the land of Shinar; and they dwelt there.

3 And they said one to another, Go to, let us make brick, and burn them thoroughly. And they had brick for stone, and slime had they for mortar.

4 And they said, Go to, let us build us a city, and a tower, whose top may reach unto heaven; and let us make us a name, lest we be scattered abroad upon the face of the whole earth.

5 *And the Lord came down to see the city and the tower, which the children of men builded.*

6 *And the Lord said, Behold, the people is one, and they have all one language; and this they begin to do: and now nothing will be restrained from them, which they have imagined to do.*

7 *Go to, let us go down, and there confound their language, that they may not understand one another's speech.*

8 *So the Lord scattered them abroad from thence upon the face of all the earth: and they left off to build the city.*

9 *Therefore is the name of it called Babel; because the Lord did there confound the language of all the earth: and from thence did the Lord scatter them abroad upon the face of all the earth".*

Tower of Babel is a classical story about the fate of mankind: arrogance of man who wanted to prove that he is as powerful as God then punishment and curse of God to remind us that human beings are only human. But this kind of divine punishment could be reason of an endless struggle of human being in existential way. In this point, – Merci Monsieur Camus! Cordially! -.

So, tower of Babel is an archetypical metaphor of a multilingual environment where perfect communication is impossible and it's also an eternal theme for cinema and literature. For example, the fall of Babylon in 539 B.C. is one of the stories in David Griffith's cult movie "Intolerance" (1916). Miriam Hansen in her brilliant book *Babel and Babylon* explains the interpretation of the Director about this subject: "*The invocation of Babel is probably the most overdetermined moment in Intolerance text opening up an abyss of self-reflexivity, For the tower of Babel stands not only for the project of an a universal language but also for its opposite the impossibility of such a project, the punitive diversification of tongues*" (1991:184). On the other hand, according to Lillian Gish's memoir, David W. Griffith said her: "*We have gone beyond Babel, beyond words. We have found a universal language, a power that can make men brothers and end war forever. Remember that! Remember that when you stand in front of a camera!*" (As cited in O'Malley, 2013: 1).

Multilingualism is a wonderful situation in terms of Linguistic, competence, cultural richness; it's also the basis of liberal, democratic, transparent, humanistic, peaceful dialogue and solution production. But as archetype is a chaotic situation, a non-communication model. According to Jacques Derrida (1985: 165): "*The 'tower of Babel does not merely figure the irreducible multiplicity of tongues; it exhibits an incompleteness, the impossibility of finishing, of totalizing, of saturating, of completing something on the order of edification, architectural construction, system and architectonics*".

K. Alfons Knauth makes two surprising determinations in overcoming Janus character of multilingualism. Hence, this time we need to read The New Testament, 1 Corinthians -of course , again King James Version, printed by Coldstream; Robert Kerr for The Scottish Free Bible Press Company in MDCCCXLV (1845):

“And there are diversities of operations, but it is the same God which worketh all in all. {12:7} But the manifestation of the Spirit is given to every man to profit withal. {12:8} For to one is given by the Spirit the word of wisdom; to another the word of knowledge by the same Spirit; {12:9} To another faith by the same Spirit; to another the gifts of healing by the same Spirit; {12:10} To another the working of miracles; to another prophecy; to another discerning of spirits; to another [divers] kinds of tongues; to another the interpretation of tongues: {12:11}”.

According to Knauth (2007: 6): *“The miraculous polyglossia of the Pentecostal event was conceived as the Christian revision of the catastrophic Babylonian confusion; the 72 languages the apostles learnt through the inspiration of the Holy Ghost corresponded to the 72 Babylonian languages created by God in order to confound humanity”.*

Before we get to Knauth's second definition, we have to open a parenthesis for Avant-Garde. The significance of avant-garde attitude in digital age and cyber culture is steadily increasing. The identification of life with art, mass individuality, meta-language discussion and research, formalism, intertextuality, the passion of defining and presenting ‘new’ are some characteristics of Avant-Garde. Also, Lev Manovich updated Avant-Garde while developing his New Media theory. In this context, besides the other works, his article titled ‘Avant-Garde as Software’ is a revolutionary text because his question is: *“if new media is indeed the new cultural avant-garde, how can we understand it in relation to earlier avant-garde movements?”* and the answer is as follows: *“Looking retroactively on the 1920s from the viewpoint of today we realize that the key artistic innovations of the 1920s were all done in relation to what was then “new media”: photography, film, new architectural and new printing technologies”* (Manovich, 1999: 1-2). Moreover, countless Internet users are constantly displaying avant-garde attitude by sights, sounds, music, images, texts, memes, records etc. especially in social media. Knauth is also one of the contemporary updaters of Avant-Garde. He overcomes the problem of the Tower of Babel by Guillaume Apollinaire’s manifesto titled ‘L’Antitradition futuriste’ (1913). Because, *“Polyglottisme/Poliglottismo is located in the graphic center of calligrammatic manifesto. Moreover he transforms the negative model of Babel into a positive one, the Tour Eiffel, the Americans skyscrapers and the modern hotels being the euphoric counterpart of catastrophic Tower of Biblical myth”* (Knauth, 2007: 8).

Consequently, new cultural avant-garde mind transformed one more time Babel into a widespread metaphor.

4. Hermes

Multilingualism includes eventually translation activity. According to Gadamer (2009): *“While building bridges between languages, the translator reveals eventually an example of the reciprocal relationship between the interpreter and the text which corresponds to the mutual relationship involved in understanding / agreement in conversation. Because each translator is an interpreter”* (p.175).

Hermes is divine representative of translators and interpreters. He is messenger between Olympian Gods and ordinary people. He is also god of diplomacy, trade, communication and patron of heralds, merchants and thieves. Eventually he is polyglot!

“Hermes was known throughout the ancient world both his religious and philosophical wisdom and his seer-like understanding of the most obscure areas of human speculation and experience: astrology, magic, the secrets of plants and stones and alchemy.” (Linden, 2003: 27).

With these features, Hermes, himself, also as inventor of language and as Hermes Trismegistus has opened the door to various doctrines such as Hermeticism, Hermeneutics and Theosophy.

Common points of these naturally multilingual doctrines are:

- Free navigation between different times, spaces, languages, cultural geographies and belief systems to realize the meaning-which one we are looking for-, to determine the truth-which one we are looking for-, to experience spiritual power, to find cultural intersections between different civilizations with hope of universal harmony,
- Search for a universal language fed by multilingualism in humanistic way,
- Romantic loyalty to Classical Antiquity,
- Intertextual experience which embraces rationalist and esoteric, historical and contemporary, philosophic and artistic texts written in different languages.
- Infinite knowledge and infinite intuition!

Today, hermeneutics offers rich methodologic possibilities for linguistic and esthetic research.

In this point, let's read a very sympathetic definition of hermeneutics:

“Hermeneutics means to honor its patron saint Hermes and his sacred and magical canon of spoken language. The name of the god Hermes itself stems from herma, the mute stone monument which also corresponds phonetically to the Latin sermo (speech). He is a hermeneus (interpreter) in the sense of a linguistic mediator” (Behera, 2007: 182).

On the other hand, multilingualism is also an organization because of translation activity. Policies of trade, education, diplomacy, mass-media and art require such a structural activity. United Nations, NATO, European Union are some examples.

Umberto Eco conceptualized also multilingualism by his famous sentence in 1993, Arles, during his lecture presented at the conference of ATLAS: *Assises de la traduction littéraire: “Language of Europe is translation”* (as cited in Frank, 2016: 1).

Multilingualism is also a special wisdom sign. Let's remember a famous example from Star Wars movies: C-3PO is a droid, programmed by Jedi Anakin Skywalker, is fluent in more than seven million forms of communication! Hermes is an archetypical source for C-3PO design.

5. Monolingualism and Multilingualism Politics in Renaissance

Monolingualism may become a repressive policy in the context of totalitarianism. Initially romantic utopias such as Pan-Germanism, Pan-Slavism in the 19th century based on monolingualism, were partly the basis of some nationalist and racist policies of the 20th century.

Today, in countries that are experiencing post-colonial problems due to immigration and refugees or who have to share these problems, the monolingual diversity of immigrants and refugees could be a topic of xenophobic discourse from time to time. Because, staying monolingual and insisting to stay monolingual in a multilingual environment, due to any political sanction, ethnocentric organization or radical identity ownership is a cultural isolation.

Multilingualism is also another issue of a paradox: a monolingual person, a community or a society can have a multilingual perspective that means humanist perspective. In this point, let's remember the Italian Renaissance and the Ideal Language/Italian Vulgate based on the Toscana dialect. *"The most important aspect of the ideal language is the national and political front, that is, an intellectual homeland has been established for the intellectuals who have grown up in all the regions of Italy, which have been fragmented since longtime. This country, too, belongs not only to the nobility class nor to any other class. Even though it is the poorest and most depraved situation, everyone has the time and means to have this homeland they want."* (Burckhardt, 1978: 556). Again as Burckhardt underlined: *"Dante certainly did the greatest service with his great poetry to achieve such a result"* (Burckhardt, 1978: 555) But Dante thinks at the same time: *"the whole world is my own country"* (Burckhardt, 1974:214). Hence humanism is based on multilingual mentality. Many humanists who represent universal harmony with their personalities and studies have a multilingual formation. For example: *"Apart from his brilliant competence in Latin, Pico della Mirandola developed a comprehensive knowledge of Greek and also knew Hebrew, Arabic and Aramaic to a certain degree"* (Kienpointner, 2016: 844). Giannozzo Martelli, a scholar and statesman from Florence, learned Hebrew; the Venetian physician Hieranimo Ramusio did many translations from Arabic. Aldo Manucci from Venetia again printed many books in Greek (Burckhardt, 1974:304-305).

In this context, cinema as a universal language provides multilingual vision for global audience which could be sometimes monolingual.

6. Lingua Franca

Since the beginning until today, a lingua franca is generally part of a multilingual entity for practical reasons. *"As ca. 2600 BC, The Sumerians already needed to train multilingual civil servants to respond to the challenges posed by their large empire, a preoccupation. Similarly in the Roman Period, key institutions were multilingual. During the Middle Age multilingualism was also commonplace"* (Franceschini 2013:5; Lasagabaster, 2015: 1).

On the other hand, a lingua franca could be also language of power. Any political power wants to be strong and effective also in terms of culture. In the context of this

cultural desire a lingua franca covers both glocal linguistic texture and global communication and interaction. Lingua franca is a multilingual initiative, a common place to live, to work and to communicate each other of different peoples who speak different languages. By the way, a language can be spoken by millions of people, but that does not make it a lingua franca.

Beyond primitive anti-imperialist or aggressive post-colonial rhetoric, lingua franca is a concrete aspect of global everyday reality. In this context, cyber-linguistic panoramas are particularly interesting: lingua franca for internet users who speak thousands of different languages on the earth, English ranks first. But at the same time multilingual search/research options and translation possibilities are available via search engines. In addition, internet users are becoming active, socializing and organizing because of common software standards. In this case, the definition of lingua franca is not only specific to classical linguistic discipline, but also could be applied to programming languages.

The Greek of Alexander the Great and Latin of Roman Empire preserve still their existence as lingua franca in scientific, academic, philosophic and intellectual life sometimes only at the terminological level or even in quotation. In the colonial and imperial context, the language of power may become lingua franca between the periods of ascension and decline of empires. But a lingua franca at this point cannot be considered only as a work of a dominant mentality. As French President François Mitterrand explained at the Francophonie Summit in Dakar in 1989: *“It is not the French language that makes the Francophonie but its coexistence with 2000 languages of the francophone space”* (as cited in Yannic, 2010: 29).

At the first step, English is lingua franca of global film industry but recent arising production of multilingual movies indicates a different- more realistic- film production strategy.

7. Esperanto

When studying on multilingualism, it is necessary to mention also Esperanto as a linguistic ideal. Esperanto aims one, commune language for all of humanity but it has been designed as a multilingual assemblage in a multilingual environment. *“Esperanto, a Romance-German blend was invented in 1867 by the Russian oculist Ludwik L. Zamenhof in the multilingual city of Bialystok where at the time Polish, Russian, Yiddish, German and Lithuanian were widely spoken”* (Ginsburgh & Weber, 2011: 17).

Invented or constructed languages like Esperanto or Interlingua (1951) reveal a special kind of linguistic creativity. Hence this experience is very useful to design pseudo-archaic, pseudo-esoteric languages and science-fiction tongues or to animate extinct languages, particularly in Cinema.

8. Linguistic Relativity

Multilingualism is also an ideal environment to discuss 'Linguistic Relativity' of Benjamin Lee Whorf.

Benjamin Lee Whorf (1897-1941), famous for his research and work on the Native American Languages in the 1930s, developed his concept of linguistic relativity under the title of the Sapir-Whorf hypothesis together with his mentor Edward Sapir. According to Whorf: "*Human beings do not live in the objective world alone, nor alone in the world of social activity as ordinarily understood, but are very much at the mercy of the particular language which has become the medium of expression for their society*" (as cited in Black, 1959: 228-229).

Linguistic relativity was initially highly criticized. Because: "*There is much exaggeration and a vaporous mysticism blurs perspectives already sufficiently elusive*" (Black, 1959: 228). Now, this is a historical discussion but 'linguistic relativity' remains interesting in terms of the postmodern perspective. The mentioned hypothesis is an intuitive interpretation and according to this, each language represents a different cognitive structure and a different Weltanschauung. Whorf explains (1940:229) this subject as follows: "*Reality is presented in a kaleidoscopic flux of impressions which has to be organized by our minds- and this means largely by the linguistic systems in our minds. We cut nature up, organize it into concepts, and ascribe significances as we do, largely because we are parties to an agreement to organize it in this way- an agreement that holds throughout our speech community and is codified in the patterns of our language.*"

Beyond Linguistics Studies, if we popularize this topic in an anachronistic way: Holy Roman Emperor Charles V explained his multilingual profile as follows: "*I speak Spanish with God, French with men and German to my horse and Italian to the ladies!*" By the way, Charles V spoke little German (!).

Aby Warburg introduces himself as follows: "*By heart a native Hamburg, by blood a Hebrew, in spirit a Florentine!*" (Johnson, 2012: 13)

Jorge Luis Borges said: "*...every language is a way of perceiving the world*" (as cited in Niles, 2016:302).

In this context, we should refer also to James Joyce's *Ulysses* (1922) or in the same way to T. S. Eliot's *The Waste Land* (1922) to experience how to live in a polyglossia!

9. Linguistic Organization in Cinema

The subject of cinema and multilingualism is examined by theorists who work in the field of linguistics like film theorists. Because multilingual structure of movies needs translation to become comprehensive by spectators in all around the world. Total dubbing, partial dubbing that means mixing dubbing and subtitles, subtitle, off-voice reading as translation, linguistic adaptation of movie are different methods to translate movies. Such methods like off-voice reading as translation - as once applied in Eastern Bloc- or linguistic adaptation of movie -as once applied for Egyptian movies in Turkey, during II. World War- (Onaran, 1976) are no longer available.

Dubbing is a subsidiary industry of cinema. It's also an art because dubbing artists display their dramatic skills when speaking instead of film characters. In fact, dubbing artists rebuild the movie in a peculiar theatrical sense and they make familiar the rhetoric of a movie by their voices and interpretations. Some dubbing artists are as famous as dubbed movie stars in their country where there is a strong dubbing culture, for example such Italy, Spain and Turkey.

Translated existence of actors or actresses is a fantastic existence mode. When we watch a dubbed movie, we understand the same language of film characters; no matter what language is. Dubbing is replacement of the language of a movie by another language. Beyond the context of dubbing, there is another replacement of the language for movies; everybody speaks the same language as it is usually in global film industries like Hollywood Cinema. Bleichenbacher (2008) who works in this field, defines the mentioned simulative multilingualism as follows: *"Even when the depicted story would realistically have taken place in a different linguistic setting, the language(s) are replaced by the base language of narration; in my case, English. Thus German composers, Russian submarine commanders, and Polish pianists speak English, rather than- more logically- German, Russian, or Polish"* (p.179).

On the other hand, film-dubbing is a control policy especially to filter inconvenient expressions according totalitarian authority or a cultural necessity because watching a dubbed movie could be easier by some ordinary people groups. However, subtitle is the best method to keep artistic originality of movies. This is even more important for polyglot films because it is necessary to preserve also the cultural originality of multilingualism. For example *"using different color subtitles for each of secondary languages present in the film"* is a convenient application (De Bonis, 2015: 58). Moreover, according to Wahl: *"Polyglot films must be shown with subtitled (or without any aid) because they are anti-illusionist in the sense that they do not try to hide the diversity of human life behind the mask of a universal language"* (as cited in Berger & Komori, 2010: 8); in this context, distribution standards of translation, dubbing and subtitling must be special to each film to percept perfectly meaning of the movie.

Briefly, if a film has a multilingual design in terms of both cultural and artistic it should be also a multilingual production. Because a multilingual movie is technically more realistic than a film that describes 'linguistically being different' in accented way or just indicating it in a lingua franca. Hence, each film character speaks his/her mother tongue and linguistic articulation between characters becomes more naturalistic. On the other hand, *"Multilingual speech is creative"* (Cenoz, 2013:12) and in this context, a multilingual movie may represent a political emancipation at least on linguistic level in terms of diasporic, post-colonial or postmodern ethnocentric criticism or could be a homage to polyphony of global cosmopolite culture or indicates existential alienation as a linguistic symptom of Babylonian confusion or a redemption act for extinct languages or film director could be a memory-bender to reanimate forgotten languages.

But at the end, cinema is a universal language.

10. Multilingual Movie as a Genre

There are some precursors of multilingual movie genre in 1980s and 1990s like Jim Jarmusch with his films, *Stranger than Paradise* (1984) and *Night on Earth* (1991), Aki Kaurismaki with *Leningrad Cowboys Go America* (1989), Kevin Costner with *Dance With Wolves* (1990) and Michelangelo Antonioni & Wim Wenders with *Beyond the Clouds* (1995).

Jarmusch and Kaurismaki narrate stories of cross-cultural encounters in ironical way and mutual discourse of each film character is based on this principle: My language is my identity!

Costner used original Lakota Sioux language for native characters of his movie. According to O'Sullivan, this is a turning point (2007, p. 86). Moreover after *Dance with Wolves*, many film directors use original native languages to narrate deservedly stories of native peoples and characters. *Windtalkers* (2002) of John Woo, *The New World* (2005) of Terrence Malick, *Apocalypto* (2007) of Mel Gibson are some examples. Re-animating lost languages of American natives is a redemption act expressed by linguistic choice of film directors as multilingualism.

Antonioni and Wenders' movie is about love stories of several characters who speak in Italian, French and English. In this multilingual environment the Directors indicate this typical Antonionian point: love is not a miraculous remedy for identity crisis and in this context translation does not provide eventually guarantee for full comprehension.

In the 2000s, the new global and post-colonial conjuncture and endless confrontations between different cultures and civilizations require a new and different film genre to be identified in cinema like multilingual movie genre because of a significant amount of multilingual movie production.

Film industries and film directors who could be from main-stream cinema, independent cinema or third world cinema evaluate and interpret eventually this new conjuncture by their films that materialize multilingualism with several aspects.

Chris Wahl is the first to describe the polyglot movie genre in 2005 and he categorized polyglot cinema in five distinct sub-genres:

1. *The fraternization film*
2. *The globalization film*
3. *The migration film*
4. *The colonial film*
5. *The existential films*" (as cited in De Bonis, 2015: 23-24).

Multilingual movie is not a simple issue of story - it goes in a multilingual environment! – Genre characteristics of a multilingual movie are like these:

- Practically a multilingual movie is a film in which three or more languages are spoken

- Basic feature of storyline is linguistic differences of characters or linguistic variety of polyglot characters.
- Plot is developed through rhizomatic articulation of different languages.
- Multilingualism becomes a convenient doctrine to discuss human condition within its aesthetic, political, historical, mnemonic, geographical and cultural multi-coordinates.
- A multilingual movie is a landscape depicted by linguistic deterritorializations.
- A multilingual movie has a particular esthetic because multilingualism shapes ontologically multilingual movie. In the context of multilingual movie as a genre, cinematography and film editing should be realized as visual equivalents of linguistic mobility, navigation between different languages, cultural specificities of different languages and the variable nature of speakers of different languages.

Hence, the increase in the production and distribution possibilities of the films, which are designed in multilingual manner in content and form, attracts the attention of researchers who work in the field of linguistics and film-studies.

Multilingual movie content has generally two main environments: Multilingualism as a linguistic quality and multilingualism as a minorities feature and in this second context, there are two types of film directors: Minority directors and minor cinema directors. Minority director narrates minority stories within a multilingual design but minor cinema director narrates minority stories through linguistic effects of self-deterritorialization process. One of Deleuze's descriptions of the minor cinema is as follows: *"The author of cinema finds himself in the presence of a doubly colonized people from the point of view of culture, colonized by the stories that come from another place, but also by their own myths, which have become impersonal entities in the service of the colonizer. So the author should not be an ethnologist of the people and not even invent a fiction that would still be a private story, because every personal fiction, as well as any impersonal myth, is on the side of the bosses"* (Deleuze, 1989: 245).

Deleuze & Guattari's Minor Literature is also model of Minor Cinema of Deleuze. Minor Literature is based on analysis of Franz Kafka's minority identity and his authorship in German. Of course, this is an example also applicable to other languages, cultures and arts.

Accordingly, the first characteristic of minor literatures is: *"In short, Prague German is a deterritorialized language, appropriate for strange and minor uses...The second characteristic is that everything in them is political...The third characteristic is that in it everything takes on a collective value"* (Deleuze & Guattari, 1986: 17). Thence, Minor Cinema director becomes *"a real collective agent, a collective ferment, a catalyzer"* (Deleuze, 1989: 245) like Minor Literature author.

Today, self-expression of the minor using the major's language is a common multilingual movie scheme that means it is not necessary for a director to be a minority member in order to represent the logic of the minor cinema . Because a postmodern artist may appropriate the cultural memory and identity of a minority existing in any historical or geographical coordinates.

11. Historical Beginning of Multilingual Movie

Multilingualism exists in nature of cinema because cinema is a mass-media issue. Movies are produced and distributed for millions spectators who live all around the world and speak different languages. Global film industry is a cosmopolite environment. Filmmakers, distributors, actors, actresses, screenwriters, cinematographers, art directors and related teams from different countries come together in common cinematographic platforms. Films tell universal stories addressing global audiences.

In the History of Cinema, the invention of sound film has led to some crisis in the beginning, but some production strategies like trilingual films have been applied until dubbing and subtitle methods have been developed in European Cinema. *"Yet multilingual films are not a new phenomenon. Indeed, they are developed hand in hand with the coming of sound"* (Dweyer, 2005: 296).

Atlantic (1929) an Elstree production, directed by Ewald André Dupont is the first multilingual sound picture in the world and the movie was about sinking of Titanic transatlantic; *"Dupont made the film in three separate versions, English, German and French with independent casts and some story and character variations, but, in each instant with the same cinematographer, the Englishman Charles Rosher (1885-1974)"* (St. Pierre, 2010:110).

But the real center of this trilingual films production was the UFA (Universum Film Aktien Gesellschaft). UFA was also a pioneer company in cinematography field with its notorious chief producer Erich Pommer (1889-1966).

At the beginning: *"The Babelsberg complex has a long and checkered production history with the first (glass-walled) film production studio built in the site in 1912 by the Berlin film company Bioscop...in the 1920s, the facility became the legendary Ufa film city"* (Goldsmith&O'Regan, 2005: 125). So, UFA produced 160 versions of 75 films- as trilingual films- between 1929 and 1939; Besides trilingual films there is also another example Quattro-lingual example: *Melodie des Herzens* (1929, Melody of the Heart) that has been produced again by Pommer in German, English, French, Hungarian languages as a silent version (Wahl, 2008:48-49).

In this context, another multilingual movie, *Niemandsländ* (1931, No Man's Land/Hell on Earth) directed by Victor Trivas is an interesting example. This movie narrates the prewar and war time stories of five soldiers trapped in a no-man's land in World War I. These soldiers are an English, a French, a German, a German Jew, and a black man. According to Nancy P.Nenno (2011:285), *"Niemandsländ has an Esperantist vision and so the voice is central to the film's diegesis as the narrative itself mimics the move from muteness to speech, from dominant monolingualism to pluralistic multilingualism"*.

12. Contemporary Multilingual Movie

Today, there are a lot of multilingual movies but there are only few directors who create and represent particular esthetics of multilingualism in cinema. Let's look at our cult examples:

12.1 Lost in Translation (2003). Directed by Sofia Coppola.

The story of movie: Once a famous, middle-aged actor Bob (Bill Murray) comes to Tokyo to film commercials for a whiskey brand. As film shoots continue, he meets a young woman Charlotte (Scarlett Johansson) whose photographer husband (Giovanni Ribisi) was working out of Tokyo for a project. They are both alone. Then they start to talk and to wander together along the streets of Tokyo...

Simultaneous translation is done continuously throughout the film; from English to Japan and vice versa; this translation serves to communicate on practical level but indicates also the impossibility of comprehension. Within this linguistic oscillation, two protagonists, Bob and Charlotte hear, understand but cannot give a meaning to the spoken. Meaning is suspended in translation. Being in Tokyo is always a particular experience because Tokyo is forever a foreign city for non-Japanese people and Japanese is generally a foreign language for non-Japanese people! *Lost in Translation* is an existentialist movie that describes an alienation story- even partial, even ephemeral and even postmodern-

According to Bennet Schaber: "*Lost in Translation is a prime example of new global cinema.*" (as cited in Dweyer, 2005:296). Briefly this 'new global cinema' is multilingual cinema where everybody speaks his or her own language beyond a lingua franca and translation becomes a deterritorialization environment.

Lost in Translation is a cult movie and its title became a metaphor used globally to express non-communication, non-comprehension situations despite linguistic understanding and translation possibilities.

12.2 The New World (2005). Directed by Terrence Malick.

The story of movie: Captain Smith (Colin Farrell) gets in 1607 to Virginia that was setting the stage for conflicts between English settlers and Algonquian Indians. Smith is captured during an exploration by Indians but Pocahontas, daughter of chief (Q'orianka Kilcher) saves him. Subsequently they became lovers. They taste together the beauty of harmonious and immense nature and teach each other words from own languages- as interpreted by Roger Ebert (2006:1): "*with such a tender feeling of discovery*" -. But they are separated. Captain Smith leaves Pocahontas and goes for another exploration mission. Then Pocahontas marries an English settler, John Rolfe (Christian Bale). They return to England where Pocahontas will die shortly thereafter.

This movie is a Pocahontas story because she is an inspirational figure in historical and aesthetic context. She is a bridge between Algonquian and English languages –she was very talented in language learning- but at the same a tragic symbol of difference between Algonquian and English cultures and the impossible fusion of these two civilizations.

She has concrete and spiritual contact with nature moreover she is part of Nature and her linguistic and cultural adaptation or her Anglicization means dissolution of Algonquian nature. The new world of Malick's movie is a damaged eco system so, "*what The New World recounts is the transformation of the natural world into an artificial world*" (Woessner, 2011:154).

Malick had a problem when he wanted to film the movie also in original Virginia Algonquian language because *“no one is known to have spoken Virginia Algonquian since 1785. Like many other Indians, except some cultures in Mexico and Central America, Algonquian speakers had no writing system and their grammar and most of their vocabulary were lost.”* (Wilford, 2006: 1).

Then Malick began to work with the linguist Blair Rudes. Rudes, regenerated this extinct language using 500 words recorded by William Strachey and 50 words recorded by John Smith himself.

Rudes explains his work and collaboration with Malick in an interview made by Stephan Lovgren (2006): *“The real job was to figure out what Virginia Algonquian looked like in terms of pronunciation and grammar and trying to figure out which of the other eastern languages it was similar to, so I knew where to go when I needed to have a word or grammatical structure that was not attested by Strachey or Smith...I had no life for two months. During those first two weeks when the decision had been made to move from 2 to 40-something scenes, I basically stayed in my hotel room and translated, translated, translated and recorded, recorded, recorded. Then I had to be on location whenever they filmed a scene where Virginia Algonquian was spoken”* (p.2).

The New World is also bilingual but Malick has a very cool post-colonial discourse about lost freedom of Algonquian slavery, in other words, he has accomplished a humanist mission by doing his movie in a forgotten language of a repressed indigenous culture by English colonists.

Zoller- Seitz (2006) explains the economic but intensive use of words in The New World: *“But words, Malick realizes, fix nothing because nothing is fixed; there is no past or present, no differences or similarities, except those we choose to mark. In Malick’s films, memory becomes history (or anecdote); thoughts and feelings become images, and images become music, and everything becomes new.”* (p.1).

Eventually Emanuel Lubezki’s cinematography has a significant role in this film like their other collaborations; Malickian meandering of Dasein fluidity find a perfect linguistic and visual expression in navigation from one language to another and in fluid choreography of Lubezki’s cinematography. This formalism was evolved from The New World to *The Tree of Life* (2011), *To the Wonder* (2012) and *Knight of Cups* (2015) and Malick’s Cinema is transformed into Cinema of Becoming beyond any content, thematic or storyline matter. At this point, we must again underline a determination made by Woessner for the film *Days of Heaven* (1978), one of the first Malick’s films; Accordingly *“it is interested less in the stable essence of this historical world (of 1916) than in its transition, its becoming.”* (2011: 147). This thematic ‘becoming’ forms the basis of Cinema of Becoming by conceptualizing throughout Malick’s movies.

12.3 Babel (2006). Directed by Alejandro González Iñárritu.

The story of movie: There are four nesting stories. A morocco villager buys a rifle of a Japanese businessman for the jackals attacking his sheep. But his son shoots a tourist bus and an American tourist Susan (Cate Blanchett) is severely wounded. Her husband Richard (Brad Pitt) demands medical help but he could find only villagers help. Mexican

nanny of Susan and Richard's children, in San Diego, goes to Mexico for her son's wedding together with children. On the other hand, this mentioned Japanese man has a deaf- mute daughter in crisis after her mother's suicide.

Babel is also a real multilingual movie; are spoken English, Arabic, Spanish and Japanese. These four languages mean four civilizations articulated each other but not identified reciprocally. Iñárritu's interpretation is a post-apocalyptic one because he is re-exploring threatening cultural diversity that is Babel confusion.

On the other hand, traditionally, culturally and linguistically different territories are places where individual existence problems are more frankly defined. Hence, North Africa deserts are significant places in modern existentialist literature and cinema in this context.

After all, everyone survives in their own language.

12.4 Avatar (2009). Directed by James Cameron.

The story of movie: U. S. Army organizes a space-mission in 2154 to get Pandora, a great moon in orbit of a huge planet with a very rich and beautiful nature. Native inhabitants of Pandora are Na'vis, blue-skin, golden- eye giants. The atmosphere is not convenient for humans and makes them pygmies. For this, Army creates and uses Na'vi avatars who are controlled totally by humans. This is a hopeful possibility for Jake Sully, a paraplegic soldier who has been interpreted by Sam Worthington, because he can move and work.

Avatar is a bilingual movie but it has a significant place in multilingual movie context because, Na'vi language is an invented language for this movie at the request of Cameron. Paul Frommer is creator of this language. *"Frommer explained that there were several requirements for the Na'vi language. It needed to be exotic, coherent so that people hearing it would recognize it as a language while not understanding it, and be learnable by humans"* (Scudder, 2010:1).

12.5 Inglourious Basterds (2009). Directed by Quentin Tarantino

The story of movie: This is a WW II story. SS Colonel Hans Landa (Christoph Waltz) is a polyglot person; he hunts Jews throughout Europe also using this quality. He speaks several languages as his mother tongue. But one his victims, and Shosanna Dreyfus survives and goes to Paris. 1st Special Service Force Lieutenant Aldo Raine (Brad Pitt) from US Army with his eight colleagues begin to struggle against III Reich behind enemy lines. Meanwhile, in Paris Shosanna, under a false identity - Emmanuelle Mimieux- runs a cinema where Germans want organize a propaganda night and to project "Stolz der Nation" movie with the participation of Nazi leaders. Shosanna makes an unsuccessful plan to kill all...At the end of the war, Raine catches Landa trying to escape and he carves on forehead a swastika.

Inglorious Basterds is also a real multilingual movie. German, English, French, and Italian are spoken. Multilingualism is normally a cultural richness and personal gift but here Tarantino determines inhuman character of III Reich by multilingualism. SS Colonel Hans Landa traps and catches Jews, speaking several languages of Europe.

Thus multilingualism becomes metaphor of Nazism's repressive power in a surprise way. During the Movie, this symbolic and dangerous aspect of multilingualism is repeated as several variations.

12.6 To the Wonder (2012). Directed by Terrence Malick.

The story of movie: Neil (Ben Affleck) falls in love with Marina, a Russian-French woman (Olga Kurylenko) in Paris, Normandy, Mont Saint Michel... and he brings her and her daughter in Oklahoma to live together. At the beginning everything is ok but by the time problems begin to emerge; a sweetheart from Neil's childhood (Rachel McAdams) and Father Quintana (Javier Bardem) who is in an existential crisis are figures who emphasize these problems.

To the Wonder' is a real multilingual movie with English, French, Spanish and Italian. This multilingualism is principal factor of mentioned Cinema of Becoming of Malick. Following Marina within movie we contemplate not only her movements like a dance but at the same time a linguistic choreography between pronunciations of several languages. *"Malick navigates in this polyphonic universe to research what is meaning of life"* (Atay, 2015: 2).

Marina is a rootless individual. It seems that she can live in anywhere. Her impressions, expressions, movements are in motion, endless motion! Moreover she is an ex-ballerina. She and the other figures of the film are like celestial objects that temporarily enter each other's attraction area in the infinity of space. Here, multilingualism is a spatial landmark of the random mobility. There is not any cliché of dramatic comment, identity crisis or usual result because nothing is absolute in this universe.

12.7 Arrival (2016). Directed by Denis Villeneuve

The story of movie: Dr. Louise Banks (Amy Adams) is a distinguished linguist. One day is called by Colonel Weber (Forest Whitaker) to communicate with the aliens. Then Louise and a physicist named Ian (Jeremy Renner) form a team. She succeeds in communicating with the aliens and she continues to study symbolic alien language. Finally she realizes that aliens are able to see the future. On the other hand, existence of aliens causes social chaos and also an international crisis. Chinese authorities begin to make war preparations...But with Louise's personal efforts-in Chinese!-international and extraterrestrial peace is provided ones again. By the way Louise and Ian found love in infinite relativity of time.

Alien language, Chinese, Russian and English form together multilingual character of this movie. Louise as a polyglot person saved universe communicating in Alien language and speaking Chinese. Once again, the importance of diplomacy is pointed out (!).

12.8 Radio Dreams (2016). Directed by Babak Jalali

The story of movie: This is a one day story of Pars Radio, San Francisco's #1 Farsi-language broadcaster. Manager of the radio is a melancholic Iranian intellectual, Hamid Royani (Mohsen Namjoo). Radio station is at the same time an international diaspora meeting place where are spoken Farsi, English, Dari, Assyrian Neo-Aramaic. With the aim of revive the situation of the radio, Royani arranges Metallica to play with Kabul Dreams, Afghanistan's first rock band and everybody begin to wait for a happy-end or coming of a member of Metallica, Lars Ulrich.

Postmodern ethnocentrism has generally represents global freedom idea but these ethnic identities could be at the same time restrictive to share universal values in reality. In this context, one of the global economy expansion effects is imposed multilingualism (Dor, 2004:98). But, here, Royani represents both his Iranian identity and his universal and modern intellectual identity. Because we have universally common values like Katyusha song of Russians, Schubert's Ave Maria, Metallica and rock music as indicated several times in this movie.

Conclusion

Multilingualism is a culture. It has been effective from Sumerians to the European Union, from the Old Testament to Renaissance text production, from literature to cinema.

Multilingualism is an interdisciplinary field that offers rich research opportunities. *"Multilingualism and multicompetence- means having developed a cultural sensitivity toward various different language situations- are central to the ongoing research activities in different disciplines which are becoming more and more sensitive to multilingual phenomena"* (Francheschini, 2011:351).

Multilingualism is a linguistic policy that defines our global and post- colonial world. In this context: *"The fact that the films of minority filmmakers (sometimes of western origin, sometimes not) can be seen from Japan to South Africa, to put two extreme points of the planet, is also the result of this globalization."* (Cerdán Los Arcos, 2004:156).

Multilingualism has creative effects on both mainstream and alternative cinemas. Multilingual movies have brought a new category within contemporary cinema. Multilingual movie genre is a sui generis cinematic aesthetic context; each director who works in this area has developed it according his or her own style. The multilingualism of a film is not just a subject matter, but an aesthetic quality specific to cinema language.

Finally, as said Roger Bacon: *"Notitia linguarum est prima porta sapientiae!"* (Knowledge of languages is the doorway to wisdom).

References

Aronin, L. & Ó. Laoine, M. (2013). The Material Culture of Multilingualism: Moving beyond the Linguistic Landscape. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 10:3, 225-

-
235. Retrieved October 10, 2017, from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14790718.2012.679734>.
- Atay, S. (2016, 6-9 September). *Being Polyglot and Becoming Polyglot*. Paper presented at the Conference [VII. ПАНЕЛНА ДИСКУСИЈА зала 58](http://lcmm2016.com/wp-content/uploads/07-neu_VII-panel) http://lcmm2016.com/wp-content/uploads/07-neu_VII-panel Varna, Bulgaria.
- Behera, S. (2007). Hermeneutics: Some Methodological Claims. In M. Ghosh & R. Ghosh (Eds), *Language and Interpretation: Hermeneutics from East-West Perspective* (pp. 178-193). New Delhi: Northern Book Centre.
- Bender, L. (Producer) & Tarantino, Q. (Director). (2009). *Inglourious Basterds* (Motion picture), USA: Universal Pictures
- Black, M. (Apr. 1959). Linguistic Relativity: The Views of Benjamin Lee Whorf. *The Philosophical Review*, 68(2), 228-238 Published by Duke University Press. Retrieved January 4, 2018 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2182168>.
- Bleichenbacher, L. (2008). Linguistic Replacement in the Movies. *Poznan Studies in Contemporary Linguistics* 44(2), 179-196. Retrieved from <https://www.degruyter.com/downloadpdf/j/psicl.2008.44.issue-2/v10010-008-0008-9/v10010-008-0008-9.pdf>
- Burckhardt, J. (1974). *İtalya'da Rönesans Kültürü, Vol.I*, (B.S.Baykal, Trans.), Şereflikoçhisar: Devlet Kitapları.
- Burckhardt, J. (1978). *İtalya'da Rönesans Kültürü, Vol.II*, (B.S.Baykal, Trans.), Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı.
- Cameron, J. (Producer) & Cameron, J. (Director). (2009). *Avatar* (Motion picture). USA: Twentieth Century Fox.
- Cerdán Los Arcos, J. (2004). Cinematografías periféricas en el sistema global de distribución: tensiones estructurales. *Revista CIDOB*, 66/67, 151-164. Retrieved November 24, 2017 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40586100>
- Cenoz, J. (2013) Defining Multilingualism, *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics* 33, 3-18 Retrieved October, 10, 2017 from <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/annual-review-of-applied-linguistics/article/defining-multilingualism/43CE7314179D99DF482C36287AEB7FB0>.
- Coppola, S. (Producer), & Coppola, S. (Director). (2003). *Lost in Translation* (Motion picture). USA: [Focus Features](#).
- De Bonis, G. (2015). *Tradurre Il Multilingualismo al Cinema: Lingua, Identità culturali e loro rappresentazione sullo schermo*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Università di Bologna, Bologna.
- Deleuze, G. & Guattari, F. (1986). *Kafka Toward a Minor Literature*, (D, Polan, Trans.), Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Deleuze, G. (1989). *L'immagine-tempo Cinema 2*, (L.Rampello&P.L.Cerri,Trans.), Milano:Ubulibri
- Derrida, J. (1985), *Des Tours de Babel*. In J. F. Graham (Ed. and Trans.), *Difference in Translation*, Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.
-

- Dor, D. (2004). From Englishization to Imposed Multilingualism: Globalization, the Internet, and the Political Economy of the Linguistic Code. *Public Culture*, 16(1), 97-118. Retrieved October 25, 2017 from Project Muse DOI: 10.1215/08992363-16-1-97.
- Dwyer, T. (n.d.) Universally Speaking: Lost in Translation and Polyglot Cinema. Retrieved from <https://lans.ua.ac.be/index.php/LANS-TTS/article/viewFile/143/85>.
- Eco, U. (1993, November). *The language of Europe is translation*. Lecture presented at the conference of ATLAS: *Assises de la traduction littéraire*, Arles, France.
- Ebert, R. (2006, January 19). The New World. Retrieved from www.rogerebert.com/reviews/the-new-world-2006.
- Franceschini, R. (2011). Multilingualism and Multicompetence: A Conceptual View. *MLJ The Modern Language Journal*, 95(3): 344-355. Retrieved November 24, 2017 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41262371>.
- Frank, T. (2016, September 23). The Language of Europe is Translation. *Hungarian Review* Vol. VII, No: 5. Retrieved December 16, 2018 from http://www.hungarianreview.com/print/20160923_the_language_of_europe_is_translation.
- Gadamer, H. G. (2009). *Hakikat ve Yöntem*, Volume II, (H. Arslan & İ. Yavuzcan, Trans.), İstanbul: Paradigma.
- Ginsburgh, V. & Weber, S. (2011). *How Many Languages Do We Need? The Economics of Linguistic Diversity*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Green, S. (Producer) & Malick, T. (Director). (2005). *The New World* (Motion picture). USA: [New Line Cinema](#)
- Gode, A. (Autumn 1954). Le Moderne Interlinguistica e Benjamin Lee Whorf. *ETC* 12(1): 48-57. Retrieved January 4, 2018 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24234299>.
- Golin, S. (Producer) & Iñárritu, A. G. (Director). (2006). *Babel* (Motion picture). USA: Paramount Pictures
- Gonda, N. (Producer) & Malick, T. (Director). (2012). *To the Wonder* (Motion picture). USA: [Brothers K Productions](#).
- Hansen, M. (1991). *Babel and Babylon Spectatorship in American Silent Film*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Harshav, B. (2011). Language: Multilingualism. In *YIVO Encyclopedia of Jews in Eastern Europe*. Retrieved March 28, 2018 from <http://www.yivoencyclopedia.org/article.aspx/Language/Multilingualism>.
- Johnson, C. D. (2012). *Memory, Metaphor, and Aby Warburg's Atlas of Images*, Ithaca-New York: Cornell University Press-A Signale Book.
- Kienpointner, M. (2016). Argumentation and Latin Linguistics. In P. Poccetti (Ed), *Latinitatis Rationes: Descriptive and Historical Accounts for the Latin Language*. (pp.840-868). Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Knauth, K. A. (2009). Literary Multilingualism I: General Outlines and Western World. In L. Block de Behar, P. Mildonian, J-M. D., D. Kadir, A., Knauth, D. Romero Lopez and M. Seligmann Silva (Eds), *Comparative Literature: Sharing Knowledges for*

- Preserving Cultural Diversity Volume III Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems, Unesco*, (pp.41-64), Oxford: Eolss.
- Lasagabaster, D. (2015). Different Educational Approaches to Bi-or Multilingualism and Their Effect on Language Attitudes. *Content-based Language Learning in Multilingual Educational Environments, Educational Linguistics* 23, 13-30. Berlin: Springer. Retrieved January 7, 2018 from DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-11496-5_2.
- Levine, D. (Producer) & Levy, S. (Producer) & Linde, D. (Producer) & Villeneuve, D. (Director). (2016). *Arrival* (Motion picture). USA: [Lava Bear Films](#).
- Linden, S. J. (2003). *The alchemy reader: From Hermes Trismegistus to Isaac Newton*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Lovgren, S. (2006, January 20). 'New World' Film Revives Extinct Native American Tongue, National Geographic News. Retrieved from http://news.nationalgeographic.com/news/2006/01/0120_060120_new_world.html
- Manovich, L. (1999). *Avant garde as Software*.1-20 Retrieved April 22, 2018, from http://manovich.net/content/04-projects/027-avant-garde-as-software/24_article_1999.pdf
- Moghimi, M. (Producer) & Golozar, T. (Co-producer) & Jalali, B. (Director). (2016). *Radio Dreams* (Motion picture). USA | Iran: [Butimar Productions](#).
- Nenno, N. P. (2011). Language, the Voice and Esperantism in Early German Sound Film: The Case of "Niemandland", *Colloquia Germanica*, 44(3): 283-302. Retrieved January 4, 2018 from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23981968>.
- Niles, J. D. (2016). *Old English Literature: A Guide to Criticism with Selected Readings*. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell.
- O'Malley, S. (2013). Griffith's 'Intolerance,' a foundational film that's also a great one, at Film Forum. *Politico*. Retrieved from <https://www.politico.com/states/new-york/city-hall/story/2013/08/griffiths-intolerance-a-foundational-film-thats-also-a-great-one-at-film-forum-067223>
- Onaran, A. Ş. (1976). *The History of World Cinema*, Unpublished Lecture Notes. Dokuz Eylül University, İzmir.
- O'Sullivan, C. (2007). Multilingualism at the multiplex: a new audience for screen translation? *Linguistica Antverpiensia*, 6:81-95. Retrieved from <https://lans-tts.uantwerpen.be/index.php/LANS-TTS/article/view/181>
- Scudder, R. (2010, April 20) [How the Na'vi Language Was Developed for AVATAR](#) (Web log comment) Retrieved from <http://avatarblog.typepad.com/avatar-blog/2010/04/where-did-the-navi-language-come-from-who-developed-the-navi-language-in-avatar-.html> .
- Seyhan, A. (2005). From Istanbul to Berlin: Stations on the Road to a Transcultural/Translational Literature. *German Politics & Society*, 2 (74): 152-170. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23740917>
- St. Pierre, P. M. (2010). *E. A. Dupont and His Contribution to British Film: Variété, Moulin Rouge, Piccadilly, Atlantic, Two Worlds, Cape Forlorn*. Madison, Teaneck: Fairleigh Dickinson Univ Press.

- V. Berger, V. & M. Komori, M. (Eds). (2010). *The Polyglot Cinema: Migration and Transcultural Narration In France, Italy, Portugal and Spain*. Wien: LIT Verlag.
- Wahl, C. (2008). Inside the Robots' Castle: Ufa's English-Language Versions in the Early 1930s. In T. Bergfelder & C. Cargnelli (Eds), *Destination London: German-Speaking Emigres and British Cinema, 1925-1950* (pp.47-61), New York-Oxford: Berghahn.
- Woessner, M. (2011). What Is Heideggerian Cinema? Film, Philosophy, and Cultural Mobility. *New German Critique* 113, 38 (2), 129-145. Retrieved from DOI 10.1215/0094033X-1221803.
- Wilford, J. N. (2006, March 7). Linguists Find the Words, and Pocahontas Speaks Again. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from www.nytimes.com/2006/03/07/science/07lang.html.
- Whorf, B. L. (1940). Science and linguistics. *MIT Technology Review* 42: 229-31. Retrieved from http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/Benjamin_Lee_Whorf.
- Yannic, A. (2010). Francophonie, plurilinguisme, traduction: La mondialization des enjeux identitaires, *Hermès*, La Revue 2010/1, 56: 29-34. Retrieved from <https://www.cairn.info/revue-hermes-la-revue-2010-1-page-29.htm>.
- Zoller Seitz, M. (2006, January 2). There is only this...All else is unreal. *Slant Magazine*. Retrieved March 10, 2018 from <https://www.slantmagazine.com/film/there-is-only-this-all-else-is-unreal/>

Creative Commons licensing terms

Authors will retain the copyright of their published articles agreeing that a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0) terms will be applied to their work. Under the terms of this license, no permission is required from the author(s) or publisher for members of the community to copy, distribute, transmit or adapt the article content, providing a proper, prominent and unambiguous attribution to the authors in a manner that makes clear that the materials are being reused under permission of a Creative Commons License. Views, opinions and conclusions expressed in this research article are views, opinions and conclusions of the author(s). Open Access Publishing Group and European Journal of Applied Linguistics Studies shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability caused in relation to/arising out of conflict of interests, copyright violations and inappropriate or inaccurate use of any kind content related or integrated on the research work. All the published works are meeting the Open Access Publishing requirements and can be freely accessed, shared, modified, distributed and used in educational, commercial and non-commercial purposes under a [Creative Commons attribution 4.0 International License \(CC BY 4.0\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).