GREEN HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT IN HOSPITALITY INDUSTRIES: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

Eko Susanto¹,², Rofi Rofaida², Syamsul Hadi Senen³
¹Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia & Politeknik Negeri Bandung, Indonesia
²,³Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia

Abstract:
The publication of the Green Human Resources Management (GHRM) review in the hospitality industry still leaves extensive development opportunities. GHRM’s strategic role in realizing sustainable tourism needs to be studied from the forming factors, technical application, and its impact on various variables. Through the systematic literature review process, this article seeks to uncover GHRM studies in the hospitality industry from 2016 to 2021. The data sources used come from Science Direct, Sage Journal, and Emerald outlets with multi-region viewpoints. Implementing the PRISMA protocol revealed that the application of GHRM in the hospitality industry is closely related to the AMO Concept, Environmental Management System, and several impact variables, mainly on financial aspects, corporate image, and environmental performance.

JEL: L80; L83; O15

Keywords: GHRM, human resources, hotel, hospitality, industry

1. Introduction

The green management philosophy has gained popularity among industry and scholars for reducing the impact of industrial waste and the harms generated by conventional organizations and products. (Li et al., 2020). Stakeholders and scholars have pressured business organizations to devise policy strategies to achieve social, economic, and environmental outcomes. (Y. J. Kim et al., 2019). In line with business organizations' efforts to reduce waste and industrial hazards. Environmental issues have forced

¹Correspondence: email eko.susanto@upi.edu
companies to adopt environmentally friendly practices and focus on their overall environmental performance. (Ahmed et al., 2021).

Tourism, including the hospitality industry, has become one of the most valued commercial activities worldwide because it spurs economic growth (Bhutto et al., 2021; World Travel & Tourism Council, 2020). In the last 60 years, the tourism industry has moved 1.5 billion international travel with a growth of 3.8% year-on-year. This amount grew global tourism spending by 1.5 trillion USD from a position of 495 billion and contributed 7% to the export of goods and services (UNWTO, 2019, 2020). The hotel industry is becoming an integral part of global tourism growth.

Hospitality has explicitly been recognized as one of the highest energy-intensive sectors. Due to the nature of its operations, the hotel consumes large amounts of resources and produces excessive amounts of waste, leading to an unwanted carbon footprint (Farooq et al., 2021). The growth of the hospitality industry as a global giant industry has also harmed the environment, parallel to the enormous benefits that this industry has provided (Ahmed et al., 2021). The breadth of the global hospitality industry’s operating scope, value chain, and business size presents awareness to reduce the industry’s negative impact on the natural, economic and social environment (Nisar et al., 2021) using the concept of green hotel management.

Like other service industries, the hospitality industry is becoming a business entity that relies heavily on its human resources, in some literature focusing on frontline workers whose role is pivotal for the viability of the hotel business (Amaral et al., 2018; Cheng & Chen, 2017). The role of these workers, especially in service delivery, customization of hotel services, customer retention that is entirely closely related to the quality of service provided, has attracted various researchers to conduct scientific studies (Karatepe, 2013). In line with the pressure to produce an environmentally friendly business, the global hospitality industry has sought to implement green human resources management (GHRM) in its business activities.

GHRM is used as an abbreviation for green human resource management. GHRM includes efforts to hire and retain environmentally friendly employees, providing environmental training; measurement of employee performance by involving the assessment of contributions to environmentally friendly actions (Guest, 1997). GHRM practices are required to predict environmentally friendly performance and affect the overall supply chain, production, waste management, culture, values, strategies, and employee behaviour (Benevene & Buonomo, 2020). Green human resources management practices in the hospitality industry have attracted many researchers, including the commitment to the organization, environmentally friendly behaviour, and hotel environmental performance. (Y. J. Kim et al., 2019; Shafaei et al., 2020), corporate social responsibility (CSR) (Bohdanowicz et al., 2011; Úbeda-García et al., 2021), Ability-Motivation-Opportunity (AMO) theory (Pham, Vo Thanh, et al., 2020), and enforcement of an environmentally friendly culture for hotel industry workers (Stalcup et al., 2014).

Some of these studies provide findings that the application of GHRM has a strong relationship not only with individual workers but related to the strategic policies of
business organizations towards other stakeholders, the environment, and their customers. Achievement of aspects of personal competence of hotel workers in the form of cognitive, motivational, and conative as social cognitive theory (Farooq et al., 2021) related to green work behaviour reflects the organization’s success in implementing sustainable tourism business. From some of the findings above, it can also be known that CSR allocation that focuses on the sustainability of the natural and social environment becomes the primary consideration for employees in looking at their company’s alignment with a more holistic green management system.

Despite the importance of well-publicized GHRM from a sustainability perspective, there has not been much research examining GHRM in a hotel context. The development of studies on GHRM in the hotel industry one decade ago provides an opportunity to create a new framework. Publications about green human resources management have increased in the last five years. The condition can be assumed to relate to awareness of the importance of creating a better hospitality industry in times of pandemics. Some of the fundamental reasons why GHRM in the hospitality industry need to be systematically reviewed, namely: First, HRM has an essential role in realizing the policies and practices of environmentally-minded organizations through recruitment, selection, training, development, performance assessment, awards, compensation management, and exit policies, as well as in communicating the values and culture of the company. (Renwick et al., 2013); Second, the change in organizational behaviour to be green starts from the people involved in the organization in the form of mutual commitment and mutual influence between relevant stakeholders (Dubois & Dubois, 2021); Third, GHRM becomes a symbol of business organizations that seek to systematically avoid business behaviour that damages the natural, economic and social environment (Rubel et al., 2021).

With a systematic literature review approach, this work provides a comparative and evolutionary overview of research conducted in the field of GHRM in the hospitality industry by 1) examining concepts related to GHRM in the hospitality industry; 2) analyzing research published over the past ten years; 3) classify research according to humanware frameworks; 4) Suggest future research direction. The following section discusses definitions and variables relating to GHRM in the hospitality industry and future research directions. The conclusions section presents the practical and theoretical insights that have been obtained. This article will be presented in the next section through several consecutive sections, namely the methods section, discussing the procedures and software used in SLR.

2. Literature Review

GHRM represents various aspects of human resource management (HRM) aimed at developing environmentally minded employees, namely employees who are sensitive about the importance of activities related to environmental protection (Luu, 2019; Pham et al., 2019), covers a wide range of practices related to the entire lifecycle of employees.
in the organization, from employee selection to their retention (W. G. Kim et al., 2020). GHRM practices are defined as an organization’s commitment to environmental protection, and they include a variety of HRM practices that are all focused on the ecosystem’s instability and the ecological repercussions of an organization’s economic activity (Nisar et al., 2021). Previous researchers have evaded the application of GHRM on green recruitment and selection aspects (Yusoff et al., 2020), green training and development (Nisar et al., 2021), green performance management (Chen et al., 2018), and green reward and remuneration (Arasli et al., 2020).

Hiring and selecting individuals with environmental awareness using test instruments to ensure that employees are optimistic about environmental issues and questions relating to environmental views, values, and knowledge are examples of green recruitment and selection (Renwick et al., 2013). The green training program is designed to increase employee awareness, knowledge, and skills in green activities and a climate that encourages all employees to engage in environmental insight initiatives. (Fernández et al., 2003). Referring to (Renwick et al., 2013), green integrated training includes a comprehensive green program and links it to a performance management system, an approach to creating a green climate.

The importance of GHRM as a fundamental determinant of employee behaviour stems from the fact that GHRM is a critical component of an environmental insight-oriented strategic plan to build, maintain, and strengthen sustainable environmental performance in the tourism and hospitality sectors. (Farooq et al., 2021). Global tourism stakeholders have agreed to realize a sustainable tourism industry as a shared responsibility to the world’s citizens (Hall, 2019). In this aspect, GHRM has a strategic role in controlling worker behaviour in the tourism industry, including hospitality.

3. Material and Methods

This article presents a systematic literature review (SLR) on Green Human Resources Management (GHRM) in the Hospitality Industry to discuss assumptions of concept differences by assessing state-of-the-art human resource management through a systematic literature review of critical elements, trends, and research gaps. Systematic Literature Review is a method of synthesizing a certain amount of information and identifying a particular topic’s main characteristics. SLR is done by applying the PRISMA approach (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) (Benevene & Buonomo, 2020; Pati & Lorusso, 2018) consists of 1) setting SLR objectives; 2) identifying concepts; 3) establishing the terminology of the search; 4) establish the source of the data; 5) conduct search and collection of data; 6) selecting data; 7) establish inclusion and exclusion criteria; 8) Analysis of selected data. A scientific study is also included in this review form, including a comprehensive search of possibly relevant papers and specific and repeatable selection criteria (Adams et al., 2017).
As portrayed in Figure 1, the first stage is to identify the sources of Scopus indexed databases, including Emerald, Sage Journal, and Science Direct published in 2016-2021. There were 6,346 articles related to green human resources management, 872 in SAGE Journal, 2,158 on Emerald Insight, and 3,316 on Science Direct. To align the purpose of the study screening conducted by establishing keywords and Boolean "AND" with the findings of 317 articles. Furthermore, the selection was conducted based on the syntax titled "green human resources management" and "green HRM" with a post-selection acquisition of 47 articles. This number is then extracted based on abstract and content and set as many as 12 articles studied at the final stage, as the steps presented in Table 1.
Eko Susanto, Rofi Rofaida, Syamsul Hadi Senen
GREEN HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT IN HOSPITALITY INDUSTRIES: A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Emerald</th>
<th>Sage Journal</th>
<th>Science Direct</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Entire articles that contain at least one additional keyword in the abstract or title: hotel; hospitality; lodging</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Select an article with syntax title: green human resources management &quot;AND&quot; green HRM &quot;AND&quot; GHRM &quot;AND&quot; hotel &quot;AND&quot; hospitality &quot;AND&quot; lodging.</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>According to the selected &quot;fit for purpose&quot; method, all articles whose abstract content is substantially relevant</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>According to the selected &quot;fit for purpose&quot; method, all articles whose text is effectively relevant</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Processed data, 2021

4. Results and Discussion

![Figure 2: Growth of Green Human Resources Management Articles](image)

Studies related to green human resources management have experienced an exponential development since 2016-2021, as presented in Figure 2, with growth per year of 22%, increasing sharply in 2021 as much as 42% of the number of publications in 2020. Using the software Publish or Perish 8, in the period 2016-2021, it is known that articles with related topics get 458 citations with 30.53 citations per paper. It can be assumed to be a strong awareness of industry researchers and practitioners in the Covid-19 pandemic to implement a green business model. The implementation of GHRM becomes an integral part of "change from within" with the implementation of smart business (Ballina, 2020) and total quality management (Aquilani et al., 2017).
4.1 GHRM State of the Art in the Hospitality Industry

Twelve findings are considered to provide breakthroughs in the GHRM study in the hospitality industry, as portrayed in Table 2. We built a GHRM framework from these findings' personal, organizational, and social sides. The personal side is a condition that is closely related to individual workers regarding the intelligence of environmental insights they have since the pre-work process and motivation to develop-implement such intelligence into green competence during work (Farooq et al., 2021; Nisar et al., 2021). Green competence is measured by workers' motivation, commitment, and creativity in facing the challenges of implementing green business activities in their work environment.

The next dimension of the framework is in the organizational aspect, where leadership has a vital role in applying GHRM. Understanding and initiative of leaders embodied in the policy of organizations related to selection and recruitment, training, worker assessment, and empowerment to realize an environmentally minded hotel business (Islam et al., 2021; Pham, Vo Thanh, et al., 2020; Sobaih et al., 2020; Úbeda-García et al., 2021). Organizational policies greatly influence GHRM performance; Commitment and consistency as outlined in the development; punish-reward is found to be effective in achieving the goals of environmentally-minded hotel organizations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The ability of owner-managers to select the right person, recruit only those who have green values, and design employee green training were the most influential GHRM practices on both green innovation and environmental performance (i.e., reduced overall costs and lead–time, improved quality and reputation of the hotels).</td>
<td>(Sobaih et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees' belief in their abilities to achieve environmental goals, achieve environmental missions, overcome environmental problems, and creatively resolve environmental issues at work will be enhanced by GHRM initiatives, such as green training and green behaviour-based appraisals, compensation, rewards, and promotions.</td>
<td>(Farooq et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green training and employee involvement are widely recognized as essential for green management effectiveness.</td>
<td>(Pham, Vo Thanh, et al., 2020)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executives' understanding of the critical role of CSR in increasing company success, both directly and indirectly, can improve GHRM and environmental performance.</td>
<td>(Úbeda-García et al., 2021)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel organizations must implement relevant GHRM because it helps employees feel proud of their organizations' role in environmental protection, reinforcing employees' commitment to their organizations and encouraging eco-friendly behaviour, resulting in their successful environmental performance. Specifically, whether the hotel property has a green certificate or not, hotel organizations should make GHRM a primary priority.</td>
<td>(Y. J. Kim et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employees who are given opportunities to participate in environmental concerns and are motivated by green performance management policies are more likely to acquire and utilize green knowledge and skills to help the hotel preserve the environment.</td>
<td>(Pham et al., 2019)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
When using environmentally responsible techniques (green HRM), organizations will gain from competitiveness, such as environmental performance, social well-being, and financial success. (Yusoff et al., 2020)

Green activities have a higher level of employee involvement, and employees' attitudes toward CSR will motivate them to develop new green practices to address present concerns. (Srivastava & Shree, 2019)

HRMPs are likely to play a critical role in coping with unknown problems by ensuring green commitment in hotels. (Arasli et al., 2020)

To describe and comprehend the relationship between millennial employee retention and (green involvement, green performance management, green reward, green recruitment, and green training). (Islam et al., 2021)

Hotels may strengthen their green intellectual capital by hiring committed workers, providing training and development, and maintaining green discipline. According to the findings, green intellectual capital motivates employees by believing that they can conduct particular green behaviours because they possess the necessary information, skills, abilities, and processes. (Nisar et al., 2021)


4.2 GHRM Forms in the Hospitality Industry

GHRM has been considered part of a green resource management innovation strategy that is widely proven to drive organizational success (Albort-Morant et al., 2018). In the service industry, especially hospitality, humans have become a distinguishing element in the competition, so organizations need to continue innovating (Wikhamn, 2019). The hospitality industry has become one of the industries with high energy consumption, waste generation, and natural environmental engineering in the name of hospitality. In today’s green-minded community, stakeholders are interested in the sustainable hospitality business model (Pham, Chiappetta Jabbour, et al., 2020), which includes the green HRM practice.

The standardization of hospitality workers that has long been applied is to the quality aspects of knowledge and technical skills of guest and property management. However, it is felt that it has not contributed enough to sustainable tourism. Hotel workers and all stakeholders are encouraged to have green intelligence within the framework of the GHRM application as one of the organizational performance benchmarks. In particular, the findings (Haywood et al., 2010) Provide a vision that the organization’s existence today is not only about profit but about resilience.

The application of GHRM to the hospitality industry needs to continue to be pursued primarily to understand the response and motivation of employees' environmental insights, where their behaviour can significantly affect service delivery and customer satisfaction at the point of contact. The fulfillment of these needs cannot be separated from the obligation of employees to avoid extensively investigating the negative impact of services on the natural, social and economic environment. The contradiction that needs to be avoided is that service to hotel guests can cause environmental damage caused by business motives.
Referring to Table 3, GHRM is found in the hospitality industry with various variations in the central concept of Ability, Motivation, Opportunities (AMO) Concept. Ability developed through selection and recruitment, training, and performance management. Motivation is built through assessing green work performance, compensation, promotion of positions, and work discipline approach. Opportunity is built through organizational policies to empower workers in green business activities and corporate social responsibility.

Table 3: The Form of GHRM and Its Implications for Organizations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form of GHRM</th>
<th>Impact</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green AMO Concept</td>
<td>Green: Abilities-Motivation-Opportunities</td>
<td>Green Innovation and Green Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHRM Initiatives</td>
<td>Green: training, behaviour-based appraisals, compensation, rewards, and promotions</td>
<td>Green Self Efficacy and Green Creativity (extending the Social Cognitive Theory)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMO Concept on Organization Perception</td>
<td>Green: Training, Performance Management, Employee Involvement</td>
<td>Employee green commitment; organizational citizenship behaviour for the environment; corporate environmental performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSR as GHRM Strategies</td>
<td>CSR Society-Customers-Employee</td>
<td>Environmental outcomes and organizational performances</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMS and CSR yang diaplikasikan sebagai GHRM</td>
<td>Green: Training, rewards and compensation, corporate environmental policy, corporate ethics on environmental issues</td>
<td>Employee organizational commitment; employee eco-friendly behavioural and hotel environmental performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHRM Practices</td>
<td>Green: training, employee involvement, performance management</td>
<td>Organizational Citizenship Behaviour for the Environment (OCBE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHRM Practices</td>
<td>Green: recruitment and selection, training and development, Performance Appraisal, Compensation</td>
<td>Environmental Performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHRM as partial dimension</td>
<td>Green: training &amp; employee involvement</td>
<td>Perception of CSR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHRMP dimension</td>
<td>Green: training-reward system, empowerment</td>
<td>Employee resilience; work engagement and Environmental Commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GHRM</td>
<td>Green: recruitment and selection, training and development, performance management, remuneration and reward, involvement</td>
<td>Moderating by Psychological Empowerment have a positive impact on</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In studies focusing on specific GHRM features, employee training and development and involvement and empowerment were consistently connected to significant advantages. These characteristics include training and development to give employees the information to follow green organizational rules and practices (i.e., training and development) and establishing an environment where employees can effectively engage in green behaviours (i.e., involvement and empowerment). In the chosen publications, these approaches were discovered to substantially impact green organizational outcomes like sustainability, environmental commitment, and environmental performance. Even in articles that focused on one to three GHRM elements, the training and development component was emphasized.

Rewards, salary, and compensation are other factors that are frequently linked to significant outcomes. It has been defined as a combination of monetary and nonmonetary incentives that drive green employee behaviour while reinforcing long-term company objectives. This component significantly impacts organizational sustainability, environmental performance, and green supply chain management, according to the selected articles. Employee-related outcomes, such as enhanced green commitment and decreased turnover intentions, have also been linked to these factors. Finally, green selection and appraisal procedures were widely favoured for meaningful results. Most studies that showed a distinct influence of the "selection, recruitment, and hiring" aspect focused on organizational ramifications, specifically organizational sustainability as seen by managers and employees. The two studies that demonstrated a substantial influence primarily connected to the performance management and assessment dimension were perceived environmental performance and staff commitment to green concerns.

GHRM is an organizational policy instrument outlined in green recruitment and training, performance management, and empowerment. The application of GHRM to this literature review was found to influence organizational goals substantially. In the next cycle, GHRM implications for workers are strengthening aspects of Ability-Motivation-Opportunity (AMO Concept) and impacting operational efficiency, environmental support, consumer perception, and social environment. In the final cycle, this process boils down to achieving GHRM's ultimate goal of helping achieve organizational goals financially, environmentally, and corporate image, as presented in Figure 3.
5. Conclusion

Based on the literature review that has been done, we found that the application of GHRM in the hospitality industry is closely related to the development of ability-motivation-opportunity of workers. AMO concept is carried out through recruitment and training, performance management, and empowerment. The transformation of outcomes of this process is aimed at building operational efficiency, environmental support, and influencing consumer perception and the social environment. Ultimately, GHRM efforts aim to align all components of human resources to achieve the ultimate goal of business organizations on the financial, social, and superior aspects of green hospitality competitions.

This study has revealed GHRM research opportunities in the hospitality industry that have not been widely done. The post-pandemic hospitality industry trend that is currently in a state of recovery requires the thinking of researchers to uncover the supporting factors and impacts resulting from the technical application of GHRM. There are wide-ranging opportunities for researchers to communicate the latest findings to realize a better hospitality industry in the future. Nevertheless, we are aware of the limitations of this study in terms of database sources used that are limited to a few sources.

Conflict of Interest Statement
The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

About the Author(s)
Eko Susanto is a Doctoral Program in Management student at the Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia. Working as a lecturer at the Politeknik Negeri Bandung, and interested in tourism management research.
Rofi Rofaida is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Economics and Business Education, Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia; and has expertise in human resource management and is actively researching management.

Syamsul Hadi Senen is a Professor in management at the Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia; a senior researcher and has expertise in human resource management.

References


GREEN HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGEMENT IN HOSPITALITY INDUSTRIES:
A SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW

Creative Commons licensing terms
Authors will retain copyright to their published articles agreeing that a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0) terms will be applied to their work. Under the terms of this license, no permission is required from the Author(s) or publisher for members of the community to copy, distribute, transmit or adapt the article content, providing a proper, prominent and unambiguous attribution to the authors in a manner that makes clear that the materials are being reused under permission of a Creative Commons License. Views, opinions and conclusions expressed in this research article are views, opinions and conclusions of the Author(s). Open Access Publishing Group and European Journal of Management and Marketing Studies shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability caused in relation to/ arising out of conflict of interests, copyright violations and inappropriate or inaccurate use of any kind content related or integrated on the research work. All the published works are meeting the Open Access Publishing requirements and can be freely accessed, shared, modified, distributed and used in educational, commercial and non-commercial purposes under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (CC BY 4.0).